

STATE OF CALIFORNIA  
CITIZENS REDISTRICTING COMMISSION (CRC)

In the matter of:

CRC BUSINESS MEETING

FRIDAY, NOVEMBER 6, 2020

9:30 a.m.

Transcription by:

eScribers, LLC



APPEARANCESCOMMISSIONERS

Neal Fornaciari, Chair  
J. Kennedy, Vice-Chair  
Isra Ahmad, Commissioner  
Linda Akutagawa, Commissioner  
Jane Andersen, Commissioner  
Alicia Fernandez, Commissioner  
Antonio Le Mons, Commissioner  
Sara Sadhwani, Commissioner  
Patricia Sinay, Commissioner  
Derric Taylor, Commissioner  
Pedro Toledo, Commissioner  
Angela Vazquez, Commissioner  
Russell Yee, Commissioner

STAFF

Dan Claypool, Executive Director  
Marian Johnston, CRC Legal Counsel  
Wanda Sheffield, Office Technician

TECHNICAL CONTRACTORS

Kristian Manoff, AV Technical Director/Comment Moderator

VIDEOGRAPHY STAFF

Jesse Solarzono, Assistant Crew Chief

PRESENTERS

Rahmo Abdi, PANA  
Jeanine Erikat, PANA  
Tavae Samuelu, EPIC  
Tho Vinh Banh, Strategic Partnerships and Community  
Engagement  
Eric Harris, Strategic Partnerships and Community  
Engagement  
Russell Rawlings, California Foundation for Independent  
Living Centers

**Also Present**Public Comment

Deborah Howard, California Senior Advocates League

INDEX

|   | <u>PAGE</u> |
|---|-------------|
| Call to Order and Roll Call   | 4           |
| Discussion and Agreement on Ground                                  | 22          |
| Rules for Working Together and Procedures<br>for Meeting Management |             |
| Public Comment  | 97          |
| General Access Panel  | 106         |
| Presenter Rahmo Abdi, PANA  | 107         |
| Presenter Tavae Samuelu   | 113         |
| Presenter Tho Vinh Banh   | 126         |
| Public Comment  | 221         |

P R O C E E D I N G S

1  
2 November 6, 2020 9:30 a.m.

3 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Well, welcome back to the  
4 November 4th through 6th meeting of the Citizens  
5 Redistricting Commission. I'd like to welcome the  
6 commissioners back, the staff, and all the folks watching  
7 our webcast.

8 So we'll get started with roll call. Is Wanda going  
9 to do the roll?

10 MS. SHEFFIELD: Good morning.

11 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Good morning.

12 MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Ahmad? No.

13 Commissioner Akutagawa? I can't hardly hear. Yes?

14 CHAIR FORNACIARI: We see you but we don't hear you,  
15 Commissioner Akutagawa. You're still -- we still can't  
16 hear you. Just -- she's here.

17 MS. SHEFFIELD: Yes. Commissioner Andersen?

18 COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: Here.

19 MS. SHEFFIELD: Okay. Commissioner Fernandez.

20 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Yes.

21 MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Fornaciari.

22 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Yes.

23 MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Kennedy.

24 VICE CHAIR KENNEDY: Here.

25 MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Le Mons.

1 COMMISSIONER LE MONS: Here.

2 MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Sadhwani.

3 CHAIR FORNACIARI: She -- she'll be joining us after  
4 lunch.

5 MS. SHEFFIELD: Okay. Commissioner Sinay.

6 COMMISSIONER SINAY: Here.

7 MS. SHEFFIELD: Okay. Commissioner Taylor.

8 COMMISSIONER TAYLOR: Present.

9 MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Toledo.

10 COMMISSIONER TOLEDO: Here.

11 MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Turner. No  
12 Commissioner Turner?

13 CHAIR FORNACIARI: She's in Arizona. I'm not  
14 sure -- I thought she was going to join us this morning,  
15 but maybe not.

16 MS. SHEFFIELD: Okay. Commissioner Vazquez. No?  
17 Commissioner Yee.

18 COMMISSIONER YEE: Here.

19 MS. SHEFFIELD: Okay. Who did? Who just came?  
20 Okay. Thank you.

21 COMMISSIONER AKUTAGAWA: Are you able to hear me?

22 MS. SHEFFIELD: We have a quorum. Thank you.

23 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Yes, we could hear you there,  
24 Commissioner Akutagawa.

25 COMMISSIONER AKUTAGAWA: Okay. Great. I think I

1 realized why I wasn't able to speak out. Okay. Thank  
2 you.

3 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Okay. Director Claypool, I see  
4 you have your hand raised.

5 DIRECTOR CLAYPOOL: I just wanted to ask  
6 Commissioner Taylor is everything okay with you, and was  
7 everything okay last night?

8 COMMISSIONER TAYLOR: Yes. Everything's fine.  
9 Everything's still contingent on our election results,  
10 but we're on standby. Thank you.

11 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Okay. Well, yeah, thank you.  
12 Just, you know, let us know, you know, whatever you need  
13 from us to help out.

14 COMMISSIONER TAYLOR: Thank you. It's much  
15 appreciated.

16 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Well, okay. So we are back. We  
17 just have a few items left on the agenda. We have a few  
18 things to circle back. We have a -- our guest speaker's  
19 coming at 1:30, and so I'm going to make a hard stop for  
20 lunch at 12:15. So we can have fifteen minutes to, you  
21 know, get the meeting started again and have public  
22 comment after lunch and then -- so we don't have to  
23 interrupt our speakers -- our visitors.

24 We're -- there was a -- we were potentially going to  
25 have a speaker later in the afternoon from the Department

1 of Technology. Unfortunately, they had to reschedule.  
2 So they'll be coming -- visiting with us the week of --  
3 during our next meeting which is the 16th through the  
4 18th. So we'll hear from them then.

5 Okay. Let's see. We had a few things to circle  
6 back on. Commissioner Fernandez set out the revised  
7 policies that we had looked at last time. And we're  
8 going to vote on -- well, she revised the per diem policy  
9 as per the suggestions that were made. She created the  
10 travel policy as per the suggestion and then made the two  
11 revisions to the code of conduct for the commissioners.  
12 And we'd already voted to accept that.

13 So we need to look at -- I don't know if you guys --  
14 I want to check in, see if you all have had a chance to  
15 look at the two new policies and if you're ready to go  
16 ahead and vote on those or you have some changes you'd  
17 like to see.

18 Commissioner Kennedy.

19 VICE CHAIR KENNEDY: On the personal expense policy  
20 in the third line of the first paragraph, I just think  
21 instead of pursuant to this act, because this isn't the  
22 act. This is our policy manual. We should just cite the  
23 act directly, rather than saying this act. Thank you.

24 CHAIR FORNACIARI: So did you catch that,  
25 Commissioner Fernandez? Okay. Okay.

1 Any other -- did you have something, Marian?

2 MS. JOHNSTON: I didn't have the policies, but Dan  
3 just forwarded them to me.

4 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Oh, okay. Okay.

5 So any other comments, feedback? Do people need  
6 a -- do folks need a couple minutes to review them?

7 Director Claypool?

8 MS. JOHNSTON: Do you want to do public comment?

9 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Marian?

10 MS. JOHNSTON: Do you want to do public comment?

11 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Well, I just want to make sure  
12 that all the commissioners have had adequate time to take  
13 a look and if they have any feedback, and then we'll --  
14 we need a motion and a second, and then we'll take public  
15 comment. Oh, oh, I'm sorry. You're right. I need to  
16 take public comment first thing in the meeting. Yeah,  
17 sorry, operator error.

18 Yes, let's go ahead and take public comment.

19 Kristian, is Katy here today or --

20 MR. MANOFF: We've got Jesse (ph.) with us today,  
21 Chair.

22 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Okay. Jesse, if you could go  
23 ahead and --

24 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: In order to maximize  
25 transparency and public participation in our process, the

1 commissioners will be taking public comment by phone. To  
2 call in, dial the telephone number provided on the live  
3 stream feed. The telephone number is 877-853-5247. When  
4 prompted, enter the meeting ID number provided on the  
5 live stream feed. It is 93489457215 for this week's  
6 meeting. When prompted to enter a participant ID, simply  
7 press pound.

8       Once you have dialed in, you will be placed in a  
9 queue from which a moderator will begin unmuting callers  
10 to submit their comment. You will also hear an automated  
11 message to press star 9. Please do this to raise your  
12 hand indicating that you wish to comment.

13       When it is your turn to speak, the moderator will  
14 unmute you and you will hear an automated message that  
15 says, the host would like you to talk and to press star 6  
16 to speak. Please make sure to mute your computer or live  
17 stream audio to prevent any feedback or distortion during  
18 your call.

19       Once you are waiting in the queue, be alert for when  
20 it is your turn to speak and again, please turn down the  
21 live stream volume. These instruction are also located  
22 on the website.

23       The committee is taking public comment at this time.

24       CHAIR FORNACIARI: So it looks like we have a caller  
25 in the queue at this point; is that correct, Jesse?

1           PUB LIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Yes, Chair.

2           CHAIR FORNACIARI: Yeah, we'll go ahead and take  
3 that call.

4           PUB LIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Callers, please press  
5 star 6 to unmute yourself please.

6           Chair, they are not responding to my request to  
7 unmute.

8           CHAIR FORNACIARI: Caller from 916, if you could  
9 press star 6 to unmute yourself and share your comment.  
10 Okay. They've hung up.

11          PUB LIC COMMENT MODERATOR: There are currently no  
12 more callers in the queue, Chair.

13          CHAIR FORNACIARI: Okay. Yeah, I want to wait for  
14 another minute or so. The instructions finished a minute  
15 or so ago, so make sure we give callers adequate time to  
16 dial in.

17                   (Pause)

18          CHAIR FORNACIARI: Okay. So that's been another  
19 minute or so. Doesn't look like anybody's in the queue.  
20 And we will be taking public comment again when we return  
21 from lunch.

22          Okay. So sorry about that. Back to the policies.  
23 Did anyone else have a comment or feedback on that?

24          Commissioner Ahmad, were you just going to remind me  
25 to take up a comment; is that why you raised your hand

1 before?

2 COMMISSIONER AHMAD: No, I just -- I think I figured  
3 it out. The highlighted sections are changes that were  
4 made, correct?

5 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Yeah.

6 COMMISSIONER AHMAD: Got it.

7 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Okay. Well, if there's no other  
8 comments or corrections -- excuse me -- can I get a  
9 motion to accept and a second?

10 Commissioner Fernandez?

11 COMMISSIONER AHMAD: Second.

12 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: I will make a motion with  
13 the change that Commissioner Kennedy requested to the  
14 personal expense policy. So it's a motion to accept both  
15 the per diem policy and the personal expense policy.

16 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Okay. And then Commissioner  
17 Ahmad seconded.

18 COMMISSIONER AHMAD: Yeah.

19 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Okay. Thank you. So Wanda, can  
20 you call a vote please?

21 MS. JOHNSTON: Sorry. Now, you need public comment  
22 on this one.

23 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Oh, all right. Yeah, I'm sorry.  
24 I did not get my sleep last night. Okay.

25 Jesse, can you call for public comment on this

1 motion please?

2 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: In order to maximize  
3 transparency and public participation in our process, the  
4 commissioners are taking public comment by phone. To  
5 call in, dial the telephone number provided on the live  
6 stream feed. The telephone number is 877-853-5247. When  
7 prompted, enter the meeting ID number provided on the  
8 live stream feed. It is 93489457215 for this week's  
9 meeting. When prompted to enter a participant ID, simply  
10 press pound.

11 Once you have dialed in, you will be placed in a  
12 queue from which a moderator will begin unmuting callers  
13 to submit your comment. You will also hear an automated  
14 message to press star 9. Please do this to raise your  
15 hand indicating that you wish to comment.

16 When it is your turn to speak, the moderator will  
17 unmute you and you will hear an automated message that  
18 says, the host would like you to talk and to press star 6  
19 to speak. Please make sure to mute your computer or live  
20 stream audio to prevent any feedback or distortion during  
21 your call.

22 Once you are waiting in the queue, be alert for when  
23 it is your turn to speak and again, please turn down the  
24 live stream volume. These instruction are also located  
25 on the website.



1           The Commission is taking public comment on this  
2 motion at this time.

3                         (Pause)

4           CHAIR FORNACIARI: Okay. The live stream just  
5 caught up so we'll hang on for a minute to see if anybody  
6 wants to make a public comment.

7                         (Pause)

8           CHAIR FORNACIARI: Okay. Doesn't look like there's  
9 anybody in the queue, right, Jesse?

10          PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: There are currently no  
11 callers in the queue, Chair.

12          CHAIR FORNACIARI: Okay. All right. So I think  
13 we'll go ahead and call the vote.

14          MS. JOHNSTON: Commissioner Ahmad.

15          COMMISSIONER AHMAD: Yes.

16          MS. JOHNSTON: Then Akutagawa.

17          COMMISSIONER AKUTAGAWA: Yes.

18          MS. JOHNSTON: Commissioner Andersen.

19          COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: Yes.

20          MS. JOHNSTON: Commissioner Fernandez.

21          COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Yes.

22          MS. JOHNSTON: Commissioner Fornaciari.

23          CHAIR FORNACIARI: Yes.

24          MS. JOHNSTON: Commissioner Kennedy.

25          VICE CHAIR KENNEDY: Yes.

1 MS. JOHNSTON: Commissioner Le Mons.

2 COMMISSIONER LE MONS: Yes.

3 MS. JOHNSTON: Commissioner Sadhwani is not here.

4 Commissioner Sinay.

5 COMMISSIONER SINAY: Yes.

6 MS. JOHNSTON: Commissioner Taylor.

7 COMMISSIONER TAYLOR: Yes.

8 MS. JOHNSTON: Commissioner Toledo.

9 COMMISSIONER TOLEDO: Yes.

10 MS. JOHNSTON: Commissioner Turner's not here.

11 Commissioner Vazquez.

12 COMMISSIONER VAZQUEZ: Yes.

13 MS. JOHNSTON: And Commissioner Yee.

14 COMMISSIONER YEE: Yes.

15 MS. JOHNSTON: Thank you. The motion passes.

16 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Okay. Very good. Thank you all.

17 More policies to come down the road.

18 So I believe the next item that we needed to  
19 continue with was -- I wanted to check in with the hiring  
20 committee for the communications director. Are we ready  
21 to make that announcement?

22 COMMISSIONER TAYLOR: I -- go ahead, Angela. Go  
23 ahead, Commissioner Vazquez.

24 COMMISSIONER VAZQUEZ: I believe so. Yes. I  
25 believe we have closed the loop with all of our

1 outstanding candidates, and we are excited to announce  
2 that Mr. Fredy Ceja has accepted the position as  
3 communications director, and he will be starting on  
4 November 16th.

5 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Outstanding. So that's -- what's  
6 that, ten days from now. Very good.

7 Well, we're very much looking forward to having Mr.  
8 Ceja on board. And I do want to thank the subcommittee  
9 for their work in managing the hiring process. And the  
10 other -- I believe there was a separate two commissioners  
11 who did the negotiations for that.

12 COMMISSIONER VAZQUEZ: No, it was Commissioner  
13 Taylor who took the lead on --

14 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Oh, that's right, for that, okay.  
15 Right, okay.

16 COMMISSIONER VAZQUEZ: -- on the offer and  
17 negotiation. And thank you to Commissioner Taylor. It  
18 was a pleasure working with you, sir.

19 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Yes, thank you both very much.  
20 We appreciate all your hard work and we're all looking  
21 forward to having a communications director on board.  
22 He's -- we've already got a pile of work for him. All  
23 right. Very good.

24 So Dan, do you want to -- sorry. Director Claypool,  
25 do you want to talk about the press release for that

1 announcement?

2           DIRECTOR CLAYPOOL: Yes. And so I have the two  
3 drafts from Commissioner Ahmad. Thank you very much. So  
4 that I can actually write that draft. I'll be doing that  
5 at lunch today, and then we'll send it out by our  
6 SurveyMonkey list of 4,400-plus emails.

7           I spoke yesterday with Micha Gutierrez (ph.) and  
8 Ogilvy and I also looked at the contract that we have  
9 Ogilvy as well as the statement of services that they  
10 provided as for the period of time that they were under  
11 contract with us.

12           The contract to start with was for a period of time.  
13 It didn't -- it just was for services that we requested  
14 during that time. And the list of services that they  
15 gave us included two press releases as well as a couple  
16 of public service announcements that were made, and a  
17 long list of other things that they provided. I can  
18 provide that to anyone who might wish to review it.

19           But the net result was that the contract was for a  
20 period of time and not for specific services rendered.  
21 That was up to us. Towards the end Ms. Gutierrez was  
22 constantly contacting us and asking us if there were  
23 other things that we needed to do, and we did add a  
24 couple of things under that, including the announcement  
25 for the New Mexico presentation that Commissioner

1 Fornaciari will be making.

2 They did not have a request for a press release for  
3 our communications director nor for our deputy executive  
4 director. So I'm going to work off the ones that we have  
5 and generate that one for review.

6 But they didn't have an obligation to produce those  
7 for us after the contract had closed, and so we're just  
8 going to move forward with it ourselves. And I'll take  
9 care of it. Any questions?

10 CHAIR FORNACIARI: No questions? Okay. Thanks.

11 Oh, I'm sorry, Commissioner Sinay?

12 COMMISSIONER SINAY: Two things. One is do we have  
13 the email mailing list that Shape California had? Have  
14 they transferred all those individuals who had been part  
15 of the process to us so that we're continuing to engage  
16 them? Because people don't realize that it's two  
17 different entities.

18 And so that -- and then second, I understand there  
19 was a limited time because that was the only way I think  
20 we're allowed to make those type of contracts or  
21 something. But can we understand how it fell through the  
22 cracks that the Commission-- the commissioners did ask  
23 staff to please get those press releases done and it was  
24 not? It's late now, and you don't need to -- I mean,  
25 it's too late now so there doesn't need to be a response

1 now, but we do need to understand how things are falling  
2 through the cracks like that.

3         DIRECTOR CLAYPOOL: So first of all, the Shape  
4 California's Future email list was consolidated with  
5 Ogilvy's constantly during that process. They were in  
6 fact one and the same. As the Shape California received  
7 requests for people to be part of that interested persons  
8 list, we moved it forward. And Ogilvy maintained it.  
9 When it was finished, Ogilvy gave us their -- or gave the  
10 state auditor the list. And so that's -- it's one and  
11 the same. We have the same list.

12         Falling through the cracks. I didn't see a request  
13 at any time that we put together a press release for the  
14 two positions that you're referring to, Commissioner  
15 Sinay. I don't believe that anything fell through the  
16 cracks. We weren't in a position to write those press  
17 releases early on.

18         And when Ms. Gutierrez asked us for any additional  
19 work that we might think we wanted, we gave her  
20 additional things to do. She created a piece for  
21 Commissioner Sadhwani. She, again, as I said, did the  
22 work for the New Mexico representation and in fact,  
23 approached us with it. So they were very proactive on  
24 asking us for these documents. I just don't believe we  
25 ever asked them to do those two press releases. And I

1 don't believe that they would have known what to do to  
2 start with because we weren't releasing the information.

3 So I think that it's not a matter of falling through  
4 the cracks. I just think we weren't prepared to ask for  
5 the work at that time, and we didn't ask for the work.

6 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Commissioner Andersen.

7 COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: Thank you for that, Mr.  
8 Claypool, but unfortunately, that's not accurate. As  
9 Commissioner Sinay said, the -- we did indeed request  
10 that a rough draft be written up. In our meeting, we did  
11 say could we have -- why don't we get them to write up a  
12 rough draft. Don't put names in until we get to it. So  
13 it's already done.

14 Now, I don't know if that's what was then given to  
15 Commissioner Ahmad or something or another. And I  
16 think -- I believe that's what Commissioner Sinay is  
17 referring to, that in our meeting, we did indeed -- we  
18 can check notes or transcripts or however we need to do  
19 that, but we did request that staff ask Ogilvy to come up  
20 with a rough draft, you know, again, not being complete,  
21 but -- and so that's I believe what is being asked about.  
22 Did a ball get dropped or something or another. So we  
23 don't have that happen again.

24 Now I understand that, that said, it's just to  
25 clarify that. But I believe our -- by the time our next

1 group comes around, we're now a new communications  
2 person. So this is a moot point, but just for  
3 clarification.

4 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Director Claypool.

5 DIRECTOR CLAYPOOL: So when was -- do you remember  
6 approximately when that meeting was, Commissioner  
7 Andersen, because I have absolutely no recollection of  
8 anybody asking to have Ms. Gutierrez do that function.  
9 And when we received her request for additional assist --  
10 did we need additional assistance, I passed that email  
11 around to the Chair and the vice Chair and to several  
12 others, and that's how we generated the additional work  
13 for Commissioner Sadhwani, and how we generated the work  
14 for the New Mexico presentation.

15 So I'm a little -- I have no idea when that  
16 occurred. I would be curious as to -- if you have a  
17 recollection of when that specific request was made or a  
18 general time. I don't want to --

19 COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: I'll go ahead and answer  
20 that. I don't -- I'd have to go back through my notes.  
21 Unfortunately, that's why -- which I know we're starting  
22 to add now minutes in, so we can go and quickly check  
23 when that happened. But at this point, I don't have that  
24 information. And I --

25 DIRECTOR CLAYPOOL: Okay.

1           COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: I don't know if any other  
2 commissioner has a good recall of -- and I believe, Mr.  
3 Claypool, that that was before you came on board. It  
4 could have been after we'd sort of hired you, but before  
5 you came on board. Certainly that could have been in the  
6 time frame.

7           But it was at some point we were discussing Ogilvy  
8 and how their contract was going to be coming up --  
9 ending. We said, well, what could we get them to do. So  
10 I don't know if that's -- I would defer to other  
11 commissioners and/or other Chairs to see if they had  
12 thought had already happened or what exactly happened on  
13 that.

14          CHAIR FORNACIARI: So I think -- go ahead, Director  
15 Claypool.

16          DIRECTOR CLAYPOOL: Okay. And I appreciate that. I  
17 just wanted -- as you said, and it's well stated, the --  
18 we do have Mr. Ceja coming on board and this will become  
19 a priority for him. I just was wanting to make sure that  
20 we had accurately portrayed what occurred. That's all.  
21 Thank you.

22          CHAIR FORNACIARI: Thank you. Yeah, I think -- so I  
23 don't know when it all took place and how it fell through  
24 the cracks, but now that we have someone keeping track of  
25 the minutes and the actions and that kind of thing, you

1 know, I think we're all hoping that, you know, we can be  
2 a little more effective at tracking actions and ensuring  
3 that they get done down the road.

4 So okay, well, thank you for that. So I think at  
5 this point, we are on agenda item number 14. If there  
6 is -- unless there's anything that we needed to follow up  
7 on that I missed? No. Okay.

8 I think we're on agenda item number 14. So let me  
9 grab that document here.

10 I'm going to ramble a little bit here. I'm going to  
11 try not to ramble too much but I'm going to ramble a  
12 little bit here. And so I put this item on the agenda.  
13 I think that, you know, there had been -- it had come up  
14 a few times in prior meetings and, you know, I think some  
15 of the commissioners had some ideas about ways we can  
16 manage the meetings kind of more effectively. And I  
17 tried to capture those in the list. The lists are just  
18 ideas. You know, my ideas. You know, I recognize other  
19 folks have other ideas and I want to talk about those  
20 and, you know, I think I have a way that we can  
21 facilitate this somewhat effectively. It's difficult,  
22 obviously, on Zoom.

23 I might actually want to try to use -- what's the  
24 tool called Commissioner Sinay?

25 COMMISSIONER SINAY: Miro.

1 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Miro.

2 COMMISSIONER SINAY: Like the architect.

3 CHAIR FORNACIARI: For the ground rules exercise  
4 because they get -- they have voting in there and we  
5 could do, like, those little sticky tab things but they  
6 call it voting. It might be interestingly a more  
7 effective way to engage. But I want to step back a  
8 little bit because being Chair has, you know, given me a  
9 different perspective on being Chair. And so I'm  
10 struggling a bit. And you know, I said I didn't sleep  
11 much last night because I spent a lot of time thinking  
12 about this. And a little bit of background on me, I've  
13 never been involved in any commission, any public thing,  
14 anything like this, right? No nonprofit work, nothing  
15 like that, right? It's all been, you know -- I've always  
16 worked in an organization where there was a clear leader  
17 who was responsible, you know. And even on the Grand  
18 Jury, I was foreperson of the grand jury.

19 So in that context, I was responsible, and when, you  
20 know, issues came up amongst the group, I felt it was  
21 clear that it was my role to help facilitate the group  
22 working through those issues. And so when, you know,  
23 this -- when we decided that we needed to have kind of an  
24 outside meeting last time, I kind of took it upon myself  
25 as Chair to decide that we were going to do that, you

1 know, and set a time for it. But, you know, it's not  
2 clear to me what the group's expectation of the Chair is,  
3 and how -- kind of how we run this railroad with a  
4 rotating Chair.

5       You know, I mean I think we set some Chair roles. I  
6 tried to look through the documentation, email, if we've  
7 actually written down those roles for the Chair, and I  
8 couldn't find anything. And so did we ever write those  
9 down anywhere? Or, I mean, no? I'm getting no. So I've  
10 got the Chair roles as we've created them now is to  
11 create the agenda, run the meetings, Chair for at least  
12 three days, responsible for signatures and other  
13 approvals, acting as Chair from the beginning of the  
14 meeting that they are Chairing until the beginning of the  
15 next meeting when the vice Chair takes over. That's my  
16 recollection of what we decided the responsibilities of  
17 the Chair are. Is that everyone else's recollection?  
18 Okay. Okay.

19       So I'm going to capture that and write that up in a  
20 document so we all have it. We'll put it in the policies  
21 and procedures, wherever, so we can find it. But so, you  
22 know, I mean, so we set up this meeting, you know, we  
23 feel we need to have some off-line conversations, you  
24 know, in this meeting on Thursday. So because I'm Chair,  
25 you know, I set that meeting up, and I feel like, you

1 know, because I'm Chair now, it's my role to facilitate  
2 that. But that's just my feeling. I mean, is that your  
3 guys think -- thought? I mean, how are we going to  
4 manage this process down the road? I mean, we're in, you  
5 know, a COVID environment. We're working on Zoom. I  
6 mean, if this were to come up, you know, and we were all  
7 together, we would have gone to dinner or gone to have a  
8 glass of wine and talk it through.

9 But you know, we're in an environment where, you  
10 know, it's more challenging. We have to, I think, be  
11 more deliberate to kind of work through, you know, the  
12 kinds of things that we would be -- that would be, you  
13 know, taken care of -- I mean, you know, taken care of at  
14 you know, some off time if we were all together. And so  
15 I just wanted to kind of throw that out there to you  
16 guys. I mean, I don't -- you know, I have some ideas. I  
17 mean, you know, maybe we can be very deliberate about  
18 setting up an hour and a half of lunch for every meeting  
19 that is a private lunch just so we can talk. I mean,  
20 maybe we can be very deliberate about -- and then the  
21 Chair for that meeting could be responsible for  
22 facilitating that conversation, whatever that  
23 conversation is, whether we just want to talk about our  
24 families, or we have other things to talk about.

25 But it seems to me that I think we need to be a

1 little bit deliberate about how we manage and how we  
2 spend time outside of these Commission meetings together,  
3 working through stuff, getting to know each other. But I  
4 don't know if that's just me who feels that way? You  
5 know, I don't know if it's just, you know, that I haven't  
6 done this kind of thing before. I don't know, maybe this  
7 is how it goes on these things all the time. I got no  
8 idea. And so I just -- I'd like some help here and some  
9 guidance in where's everybody at? I mean, I don't know.  
10 I just feel like this came up during my Chairmanship, and  
11 I kind of own it. So I'm going to own it, you know.

12 But you know, I'm -- Commissioner Yee, what are your  
13 thoughts? I'm going to put people on the spot because I  
14 want to have a conversation about this. I mean, if I'm  
15 off the rails here, tell me I'm off the rails and things  
16 are fine. If I'm not, I mean, I want to figure out what  
17 we're doing here. I mean, I feel lost.

18 COMMISSIONER YEE: Okay. Thank you, Neil, for  
19 sharing your thoughts and feelings and initiating this  
20 conversation. My first thought is simply just to  
21 appreciate all the Chairs so far. I mean, I've been  
22 quietly grateful for my name being low in the alphabet,  
23 and my turn as Chair coming up only a while from now.  
24 You know, I've been taking notes trying to learn but it's  
25 a tough job for sure. Yeah, and even tougher, I'm sure

1 when you're actually doing it. And you guys have been  
2 magnificent, you know. I mean, we've got a lot done.  
3 It's a huge challenge to get fourteen people, you know,  
4 from scratch started on such a task. So you know, I've  
5 really appreciated every one of our Chairs so far,  
6 including you Neil.

7 For sure we have been told and we've all sensed, I  
8 think, that we need to gel more and bond more, not just  
9 getting business done, but at a personal level and  
10 relationally and we just haven't had ways to do that very  
11 much, you know, a couple of social lunches. We've all  
12 interacted in different subcommittees, more individually.  
13 Yeah, we haven't been very intentional about that and  
14 systematic. So you know, maybe we start saying, you  
15 know, at least one social lunch per multi-day meeting,  
16 you know, and just start there.

17 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Okay. Anyone want to raise their  
18 hand or just wait till I call on you?

19 Commissioner Vasquez?

20 COMMISSIONER VASQUEZ: Appreciating all of our  
21 Chairs, for sure. And also particularly, you, Neil, for  
22 bringing this up in this way. Because I think there's an  
23 ask to have a specific conversation on the table. And I  
24 think, you know, we're going to have that specific  
25 conversation or attempt to next Thursday, but I do think

1 you're opening up space for a conversation that I think  
2 several of us -- I'm remembering specifically  
3 Commissioner Sinay, has asked in some form or another to  
4 sort of get on the same page with each other about how we  
5 want these meetings to work, how we'd like them  
6 facilitated, or at least specific conversations  
7 facilitated.

8       Because I think there is a challenge with both  
9 facilitating a conversation and sharing a Commission and  
10 those goals aren't always in alignment, I feel like. And  
11 having been a facilitator and having, you know, having  
12 some facilitation training, being a Chair, it was a whole  
13 different ballgame than being a facilitator of a group  
14 that maybe you're not even a part of. So there's that,  
15 and I'm not sure I had a specific point with that piece.  
16 But I also think this is also somewhat normal, or to be  
17 expected. Some of you may have seen, at some point, sort  
18 of the stages of group development forming, storming,  
19 norming, and performing.

20       And so we're definitely in the second phase of group  
21 dynamics, which is storming, you know. We're getting  
22 more comfortable with each other. We're getting more  
23 comfortable with -- or we think we are starting to see  
24 people's personalities come out and ways of interacting,  
25 and that necessarily sort of creates -- it creates

1 conflict, you know. And there's generative conflict.  
2 And there's -- I feel like, my belief is that there's  
3 generative conflict and then there's destructive  
4 conflict. And so hopefully, through this struggle and  
5 this back and forth, that we can make these moments  
6 generative conflicts where we create and sort of become  
7 greater than the sum of our parts.

8       But I think that does require some facilitation.  
9 And I also think, they're oftentimes where it feels  
10 really cheesy in other meetings that I've facilitated or  
11 have been part of, but I do think, because we have  
12 Robert's Rules of Order governing our structure to a  
13 particular purpose, we've skipped what I have found can  
14 be a really critical piece in group dynamics, which is  
15 setting up our ground rules. So in many organizing  
16 meetings, you know, one of the first things we do is put  
17 up the chart paper and have people put up suggestions for  
18 ground rules and collectively as a body we create a set  
19 of standards for each other.

20       You know, it's often a working document. You know,  
21 you go back to them and refer -- when you come up with  
22 areas of conflict, you go back to the ground rules and  
23 say, do these still work for us? Do we need to add? Do  
24 we need to amend or do we need to take some of these out?  
25 So we may, like you said, Neil, may need to use something

1 like Miro, so that we can come up with some ground rules  
2 for achieve -- how we make sure everyone feels heard, how  
3 everyone feels -- has their ideas respected, and that we  
4 continue to move us forward toward our ultimate goal of  
5 redrawing district boundaries. So yeah, those are my  
6 thoughts.

7 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Okay, so what -- let me ask you,  
8 though, a question. So I 100 percent agree, you know --  
9 you know, I'm familiar with these stages of forming on a  
10 team. I just, you know, back to the role of the Chair,  
11 you know, it's a rotating role. And so, you know,  
12 they're, you know, I mean, in my experience, so I can  
13 only share what my experience is -- you know, there's  
14 always been the Chair there as the sort of continuity  
15 through the thing, and so we're kind of passing the baton  
16 every meeting. And so how do we, you know, deliberately  
17 ensure the ball doesn't get dropped when things need to  
18 be addressed? I mean, I don't know.

19 So Commissioner Akutagawa?

20 Did you want to respond? I'm sorry, Commissioner  
21 Vasquez?

22 COMMISSIONER VASQUEZ: No, I think what you're  
23 noting there is, again, what I feel like is sometimes a  
24 conflict in objectives between Chairing a meeting which  
25 is more business and in some ways administrative. And

1 then there's this facilitation component of managing a  
2 conversation, right? So also, for me, like, I feel like  
3 facilitate -- part of a facilitator's job is sometimes to  
4 cut off a conversation or to shift a conversation toward  
5 a particular outcome or toward a decision point. Or  
6 other times a facilitator is best to sort of fade into  
7 the background and let a conversation bloom and evolve  
8 and go where it needs to go. And that's always, like,  
9 the art and the dance of facilitation. And it's hard to  
10 do that when you're also trying to manage all the other  
11 little things. We've got to take public comment. We got  
12 to make sure that we write down these action steps and  
13 sometimes they're in perfect alignment. And other times,  
14 those roles are at cross purposes. And so that might  
15 just be the nature of the beast of being a Chair of such  
16 a large group. This is also a -- this is a large  
17 commission. I mean, most boards, especially active  
18 boards, you know, are more in the what, like five to ten  
19 range.

20       You know, there's certainly nonprofit boards that  
21 are this large, but they're also not often as engaged on  
22 the administration and the business side of the org. So  
23 this is a huge task for a Chair, I feel like, with  
24 fourteen people, and that also creates its own  
25 challenges.

1 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Right. And I think, I'm not a  
2 skilled facilitator so, you know, I can't speak for  
3 anybody else but you know, I'm not kind of -- I've been  
4 to meetings that have been facilitated, but I haven't  
5 done it myself a lot.

6 So I think we have Commissioner Akutagawa then  
7 Fernandez.

8 COMMISSIONER AKUTAGAWA: Thank you for bringing this  
9 up. Okay, now I'm thinking, where do I start? Let's  
10 see, around the idea of being able to have that  
11 continuity, I guess, having just come off of Chairing  
12 meetings, and I guess, each one of us are going to bring  
13 a different style. I think I've enjoyed all who have  
14 Chaired previously. I look to your styles to see -- not  
15 necessarily to replicate what's been done, but to also  
16 honor some of the things that I felt, you know, worked  
17 for me in terms of what I can do to bring to, I think  
18 Chairing a meeting.

19 My kind of background is more -- or my kind of work  
20 is centered around facilitation. So I tend to let  
21 conversations go and I want to make sure everybody wants  
22 to be heard. And I think on that note, it -- I hear,  
23 Neil, what you're saying that you have to keep focused  
24 also on the business end. And so, with that in mind, I  
25 think there's a couple of suggestions that maybe I can

1 make. One is just by circumstance, one, I had a chance  
2 to step in on Commissioner Vasquez's behalf when she was  
3 not feeling well that, like, very last day of the last  
4 meeting where I ended up Chairing the whole meeting  
5 instead of a portion of it. So I kind of got that trial  
6 by fire without going into my official role as the Chair.  
7 So I think that that helped. I'm not saying that that's  
8 what we should do. But I'm just kind of just mentioning  
9 that.

10 And I think that for me, there could be a  
11 continuity. I think, because of the way the scheduling  
12 was done, I was supposed to Chair two two-day meetings,  
13 or something like that, of which then one extra day was  
14 added to it. So my length of time of how many days I  
15 actually Chaired was a lot longer. And I'm thinking that  
16 that may be something -- and for those of you who have  
17 yet to Chair, you may be kind of wanting to kill me if I  
18 say this, but I'm thinking that it may be helpful from a  
19 continuity point of view, to have each Chair, Chair not  
20 by the number of days, but the number of meetings,  
21 regardless of if it's two days or three days. I felt  
22 like being able to Chair two meetings in a row enabled me  
23 to think ahead in terms of what the agenda for the second  
24 meeting would be. Because if I knew I couldn't cover it  
25 all in the first one, it could be covered in the second

1 one. And then working together with Neil as my vice  
2 Chair, we were -- because he had the two meetings to  
3 prepare to think about his meeting, I feel like there  
4 were things that he was able to then continue on, or at  
5 least that's the sense that I got. And I think that that  
6 helps with some continuity as well, too. So that's just,  
7 you know, perhaps something to just think about in terms  
8 of creating that.

9 And then therefore, then whoever the vice Chair is  
10 going to be, then if they have at least two meetings to  
11 start preparing for, thinking about their meeting, you  
12 know, with this two week -- we have to post two weeks in  
13 advance, it gives them that much longer time to be  
14 thinking out a little bit further, you know about what  
15 they need to be thinking about for their meetings. And  
16 the two-week turnaround time can come really fast. So  
17 having those two meetings in a row, I thought was really  
18 helpful.

19 The other suggestion that I would make, and because  
20 each one of us is going to be different, I will say that  
21 trying to keep track of who wants to talk is kind of a  
22 whole thing in itself. And then trying to pay attention  
23 to the discussion and then writing notes and everything  
24 like that, maybe another -- I'd say practice that we  
25 could incorporate is, depending on the Chair, everyone's

1 going to be different. You know, I'm always happy to  
2 take on the role of keeping track of who's next in terms  
3 of hands raised. And perhaps using the chat box in the  
4 Zoom to just keep a running list so that then the Chair,  
5 all they have to do is just look at that list to know  
6 who's next. And they could stay focused on keeping the  
7 business of, you know, Chairing the meeting going and  
8 keeping the conversation going, if that helps. That's a  
9 another suggestion that I would give. You know, and  
10 again, I think some of these other ground rules that are  
11 being suggested may help move some of the business of  
12 Chairing the meeting along.

13       And so the last thing, Neil, I'm going to go back to  
14 what you started with in terms of just your role and  
15 owning, you know, the kind of conversations that need to  
16 go on. I would just say in terms of Thursday, I don't  
17 know if the others would agree, but I would just say I  
18 don't think that that's something that you have to own  
19 alone. I think that that's a responsibility that we all  
20 as commissioners need to own and that you shouldn't look  
21 at that this is something that you have to kind of, you  
22 know, bear the weight of. I think we all equally need to  
23 bear that weight together. And I think that's part of  
24 the purpose of having, you know, these get to know each  
25 other and really work through, you know, some of those

1 things that we need to work through.

2 I would also lastly suggest -- and this for the  
3 Lessons Learned Committee, that some of these  
4 conversations that we're having now would be something  
5 that we also put in place as a suggestion for the 2030  
6 Commission. One of the things being, I think,  
7 Commissioner Vasquez, I thought you brought up a really  
8 good point. Normally, you know, to avoid or minimize or  
9 to make it a little less stormy when a group goes through  
10 its norming phases, going through the ground rules would  
11 be really important. And I feel like we were just given  
12 an agenda and told, okay, you're going to learn this,  
13 this, and this. And I think, just for the 2030  
14 Commission, I would just say that one of the first things  
15 that they should also do, in addition to all the kind of  
16 training or educations that we'll get, is, you know, take  
17 the time to really establish what those ground rules are.  
18 And you could suggest, like, the tools. We know -- and  
19 acknowledge that tools might be different in 2030. But I  
20 think, you know, one of the first things that a group  
21 should go through in 2030 is the is establishing the  
22 ground rules so that everybody is on the same page. That  
23 doesn't mean that we're going to avoid the storming  
24 phases. I think we won't, but maybe hopefully, for 2030  
25 It'll be a little less stormy. So that's kind of my

1 litany of suggestions.

2 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Yeah, thanks. I mean, just to  
3 share, I asked the, the county or the State Auditor's  
4 Office, the lead, Ms. Saxon (ph.), I think was her name,  
5 the legal counsel, who was setting up the agendas for the  
6 fourteen of us, to add those -- that kind of opportunity  
7 in the agenda. And I don't know why they didn't, but,  
8 you know, by the time the agendas were out, you know,  
9 we're a month later before we can even think about doing  
10 it. And we didn't even have time to talk about thinking  
11 about doing it, you know, unfortunately. So I think it  
12 needs to be cooked in up front.

13 So Commissioner Fernandez, I believe, had her hand  
14 up next.

15 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Commissioner Akutagawa just  
16 kind of stole a lot of my ideas. I wouldn't say stole,  
17 I'd probably say, I agree. Because the notes I had was  
18 as a Chair, you don't have -- you can delegate tasks.  
19 Like, you don't have to be the facilitator. You don't  
20 have to be the timer. You don't have to be the one that  
21 decides who goes next. And if there's an agenda item  
22 that someone else is more of an expert or they feel more  
23 comfortable with, it's okay to have them do it. And I  
24 think that's a sign of good Chair, is knowing who has  
25 strength in certain areas.

1           Because yes, it is very overwhelming to have to do  
2 it all. And I wish I would have thought of this when I  
3 was Chair. And I do agree with Commissioner Akutagawa.  
4 And I have brought this up at our very first combined  
5 meeting, that I had said, oh, you should have the Chair a  
6 month at a time. And everyone's like, ah, it's too long.  
7 I mean, at some point in time, we're probably going to go  
8 back to weekly meetings, and maybe the Chair for every  
9 two weeks would be great. Because what I felt was, you  
10 know, you get into it, and you're learning from the prior  
11 Chairs of okay, I'll do this, that. And then by the time  
12 you finally get it, you're done and then it's time for  
13 the new Chair. Now, here's a new learning curve. I  
14 would really support Chairing more than one consecutive  
15 meeting because it's true, you just feel like you're  
16 inheriting this stuff, and you're trying to carry some  
17 stuff forward but it's really not yours anymore. And I  
18 just feel that there would be more cohesion if you did  
19 something like that.

20           And what else was I going to say? I think that was  
21 it. And then I guess, at the end of the day, we've got  
22 to get to the point where we trust each other, and we  
23 trust our areas, and we trust that we're doing what we're  
24 supposed to be doing. And Zoom doesn't help that,  
25 obviously. So it's great to start the conversation. I

1 agree, it should have been done, but it hasn't been done.  
2 So let's do it now. Because if we keep putting it off,  
3 it's going to be six months from now and things are going  
4 to be unsettled still. So thank you so much for bringing  
5 that up. I appreciate it. And you know, whatever  
6 support or help you need, just please reach out.

7 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Okay. Thanks.

8 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: And that goes to all  
9 Chairs, current, future Chairs.

10 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Okay. So I want to make sure I  
11 give everyone an opportunity to chime in. I started by  
12 putting Commissioner Yee on the spot there. You know, I  
13 don't want to -- I guess, that wasn't fair of me, but I  
14 appreciate you being a good sport. You know, I don't  
15 know if I don't -- I kind of feel bad about it now, so  
16 sorry about that. I don't want to put anybody on the  
17 spot if they don't want to share. That wasn't fair of me  
18 so thank you, Commissioner Yee.

19 Commissioner Kennedy?

20 VICE CHAIR KENNEDY: Thank you. Yeah, I want to  
21 start out by saying that every single meeting, I look at  
22 this zoom screen in front of me and I see all of you.  
23 And I am just really filled with admiration. And it  
24 really blows my mind that, you know, the ARP and the  
25 auditor's office and the whole process, including the

1 random process, you know, has as managed to come up with  
2 such an incredible group of people. You know, that's  
3 where I start every day.

4       Second, you know, having lead teams that included 65  
5 nationalities, I have to say I'm pretty used to dealing  
6 with diversity. And I really do recognize that people  
7 have different styles, you know, and so I tend to, you  
8 know, just kind of say, okay, that's this person's style,  
9 that's that person's style.

10       And you know, yeah, occasionally I've had to go out  
11 in the field and resolve some issues. But generally, you  
12 know, I find that diversity is not the root of the  
13 problem. And I celebrate the diversity in this group.

14       The groups that I've lead, I really have -- maybe  
15 it's the privilege of working in the field of elections.  
16 But you know, we know so clearly what our goal is and  
17 what our timeline is. And so it's easier to keep people  
18 focused. But you know, leadership really, in my mind and  
19 my experience, leadership is about helping maintain  
20 focus, establishing a culture of focus and cooperation  
21 across many diversities, setting a mood in order to get  
22 things done, and having a rotating Chair.

23       You know, I certainly recognize that, you know, I  
24 don't think any of us would want to Chair for a year at a  
25 time. I do agree with Commissioner Fernandez. You know,

1 I was supportive of a month at a time. I think that, you  
2 know, it does -- it is slightly disruptive to our rhythm  
3 to have such frequent changes because it makes it  
4 difficult for a Chair to promote a focus on the  
5 objective.

6 And finally, I'll say, you know, one of the great  
7 joys that I've experienced over the years in leading  
8 these groups, including sixty some nationalities, is  
9 going around and checking in. And so yeah, you know, the  
10 Zoom format is a real barrier to effective check-ins.  
11 And I found that my staff appreciated the fact that, you  
12 know, I was getting up out of my office and going around  
13 and physically checking in with them on a regular basis.

14 So I don't know how we replicate that, but  
15 certainly, you know, as Chair for the next meeting, my  
16 plan has been and continues to be to have a social lunch  
17 on one of those days. I'm still playing around with some  
18 of the timing, so I don't know which day yet, but I'll  
19 make sure and get that out. Hopefully we can continue to  
20 use those as opportunities to check in with each other.  
21 Thanks.

22 CHAIR FORNACIARI: You can hear me better now. So  
23 does anyone else have anything that they want to add to  
24 this part of the conversation at this point?

25 Yeah. Commissioner Le Mons.

1           COMMISSIONER LE MONS: I just wanted to offer some  
2 thanks and appreciation to you for the sensitivity and  
3 approach by which you, taking this on. And your outreach  
4 to me personally, which I appreciate and in the context  
5 of you being the Chair. I don't have anything to add.

6           I think the comments made by the previous  
7 commissioners, I support and agree with and on both the  
8 challenges as well as, you know, what should have  
9 happened and kind of where we are. And I think that  
10 we've been having multiple conversations or alluding to  
11 or insinuating for a period of time now about this  
12 reality. And I think we're finally, as a group, tackling  
13 it.

14           I agreed it is the group's responsibility and not  
15 the Chair to foster this. And I shared that with you  
16 before. And the same in terms of picking the time  
17 yesterday when I said, no, that I didn't want -- I mean,  
18 the day before yesterday -- I mean, on Thursday. It was  
19 for that very reason that it wasn't up to me but when we  
20 should meet that we as a group should have come to that.  
21 And we didn't. I mean, you took charge and did it, and  
22 that was fine, too. But what I would have liked to have  
23 seen was more of an organic approach that, you know, we  
24 got there as a group.

25           So I think that just how we got there kind of tells

1 us where we are as well. As someone who also has quite a  
2 bit of experience in the realm of facilitation and group  
3 dynamics, there are various approaches to getting there.  
4 And I'm one of those, everything is grist for the mill.  
5 So I'm comfortable with many roads to wherever it is that  
6 we're trying to go. But what I am always focused on is  
7 where we're trying to get to, and that's something that  
8 is really, really important to me that we get there.

9       So I'm very happy that you raised this. I  
10 appreciate it. And I just wanted to take a moment to  
11 lift you up in that way. I think you -- whatever my  
12 observations of you are, I think what you've done today  
13 is consistent with that observation. So -- and I say  
14 that to say this. I think we often think that people are  
15 one way and then suddenly they are somebody else.

16       Nobody on this panel for me is different today, a  
17 month and six weeks in, eight weeks, twelve weeks in.  
18 That I think they're who they've always been. And I  
19 think we are maybe understanding each other better. And  
20 I think the more we engage, and I think these social  
21 gatherings will help us engage as well, and we're going  
22 to continue to do the good work.

23       I still think that we're one group and I have  
24 nothing but confidence in our ability to do what we came  
25 here to do and to do it well. And I think we're going to

1 be fine, as I said the other day. So again, Commissioner  
2 Fornaciari, thank you.

3 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Thank you, Commissioner Le Mons.  
4 Thanks, I appreciate that. Okay. So if I can kind of  
5 sort of circle back a little bit, I think, you know, I've  
6 heard from a couple of different commissioners, this idea  
7 of commissioners Chairing for a longer duration of time  
8 to keep some consistency. You've heard two meetings.  
9 I've heard a month. Looks like in the outer months, two  
10 meetings in a month are the same thing. But I just -- I  
11 want to throw it out there, do we want to have a specific  
12 proposal on that? And come to an agreement on extending  
13 the time, maybe. Or I'll just say two meetings at this  
14 point. Would that suffice for folks? I mean, do you  
15 want to make that decision at this point?

16 Commissioner Akutagawa

17 COMMISSIONER AKUTAGAWA: Just for clarification, can  
18 I ask when you -- when you would propose this take  
19 effect? Like beginning after Commissioner Kennedy?

20 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Yeah, maybe after. After. I  
21 mean, I would -- I would --

22 COMMISSIONER AKUTAGAWA: Or with Commissioner  
23 Kennedy?

24 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Well, I would ask Commissioner --  
25 I mean, maybe with Commissioner Kennedy. I mean, look,

1 I'm not trying to pass the buck here, but you know, he's  
2 already put the agenda together for the next -- for the  
3 next meeting at this point. And I know I only Chaired  
4 for technically two days, but I've -- anyway,  
5 Commissioner Le Mons.

6 COMMISSIONER LE MONS: Yeah, I would -- I support  
7 that. I do think that it would be up to Commissioner  
8 Kennedy. And since I'm his vice Chair. It would affect,  
9 I guess, he and I, the most immediately if we make this  
10 change. So I guess I defer to him and ask him, how does  
11 he feel about it? We as a Commission make the change to  
12 do two meetings in a row or two meetings as the new  
13 standard as opposed to one meeting. Or move away from  
14 the three day. I think it's a three day right now.

15 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Commissioner Kennedy.

16 VICE CHAIR KENNEDY: So I mean, it just requires a  
17 little crank here to expand my thinking. I'm okay with  
18 it. I had not been thinking of that. And so you know,  
19 I'm going to want to sit down and have a chat with  
20 Commissioner Le Mons and with Director Claypool to kind  
21 of extend my horizon of my thinking as far as this. I'm  
22 okay with it, you know.

23 Another option is, I was trying to pull up the  
24 rotation schedule and wasn't finding it. But you know,  
25 we could wait until we get to the end of the rotation, as

1 it's currently set and then start. But either way, I'm  
2 fine.

3 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Yeah. So I have the rotation  
4 schedule. So we're on rotation 6 of 14. So I mean, it's  
5 a long, long way out by the time we get to circle back.  
6 So I mean, I would think we'd want to do something  
7 sooner.

8 Commissioner Andersen.

9 COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: Yeah. I do have the list  
10 of -- the orders and stuff. And actually the way -- it  
11 even has some dates on it. And it actually does have --  
12 it has Commissioner Kennedy doing the November 16 to 18  
13 with Commissioner Le Mons as the vice Chair. And then it  
14 has -- and I believe it's because there is a misprint.  
15 It has December 1 and 2 and then 14 and 16 as  
16 Commissioner Le Mons as the Chair and Commissioner Taylor  
17 is the vice Chair. I would think, I -- it's almost like,  
18 it's easier to keep the month together as opposed to  
19 dividing the month. Because if we go -- if we do this  
20 now, Commissioner Kennedy would be doing November and the  
21 first part of December, but then Commissioner Le Mons  
22 would be doing the first -- the last part of December and  
23 then waiting over the two weeks until the first part of  
24 January. And then, because we have January set up sort  
25 of differently, I think it might be cleaner maybe to do,

1 you know, I don't know in terms of -- but would  
2 Commissioner Kennedy just do the one? And then  
3 Commissioner Le Mons do both meetings in December? You  
4 know, kind of go to the, you know, the two -- try to keep  
5 the two in a month.

6 But then I -- in January, we have -- remember we  
7 have a day and then a week and then, like, three days and  
8 then a day and three days. We penciled it in just in  
9 case. So it's a little bit, like, do we want to have two  
10 people -- one person in January or two people in January?

11 I think we need to kind of have a look and see how  
12 we're breaking it down. If we want to go -- I agree with  
13 the idea of, two meetings certainly helps. You know, I  
14 like that. But I think we need to look at, do we need to  
15 do a three-meeting and then a two-meeting type of thing  
16 just to keep it consistent as opposed as how it breaks up  
17 and continuity over time? Because if there's a huge --  
18 my reason I'm saying that is that there's a big gap in  
19 between.

20 That's clearly a good time for someone else to take  
21 over as opposed to try to hang on to, you ran one meeting  
22 and then your next meeting is until three weeks later.  
23 That's a bit tricky. And I think that would be an easier  
24 place for another Chair to take over in. There's enough  
25 transition time is what I'm trying to say.

1           So I don't know if -- that said, so I don't know if  
2 we if we want to do just Commissioner Kennedy and  
3 Commissioner Le Mons or -- I'd almost like all of us,  
4 like, those guys kind of have a look at it with January  
5 and maybe come up with a plan. And maybe Commissioner  
6 Taylor, since they're the immediate commissioners  
7 involved.

8           We haven't -- we don't have anything scheduled past  
9 January at this point. So -- and those are the three  
10 commissioners involved in that. So that would be an  
11 idea.

12           CHAIR FORNACIARI: Okay. I appreciate that, thank  
13 you. I have Commissioner Yee and then Commissioner  
14 Fernandez.

15           COMMISSIONER YEE: Yes. I think -- I think actually  
16 December is correct because the standard is three days or  
17 one meeting, whichever is longer. So the fact that  
18 December 1, 2 is only two days is why Le Mons and Taylor  
19 Commissioners Le Mons and Taylor have those two meetings  
20 in December.

21           COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: Let me just say, yes, except  
22 that we actually scheduled it 1 to 3. I have a down on  
23 my calendars that it was December 1, 2, 3 -- 1 and 2 -- I  
24 believe you're correct, Commissioner Yee, in saying  
25 that's why it was added that way.

1 COMMISSIONER YEE: Oh, I see, I see. We added it  
2 in.

3 COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: There's a happy coincidence.

4 COMMISSIONER YEE: Oh, I see. Right. Okay. And  
5 just a reminder, Commissioner Sinay actually declined to  
6 serve as Chair in the rotation for now. So it's not all  
7 14 of us. So the balance seems to be on one hand, having  
8 longer terms, you know, gives -- is better for planning  
9 for the current Chair. And kind of gets you -- gives us  
10 each a chance to, you know, once we're in the Chair mode  
11 to employ those skills, you know, a little more fully.

12 The flip side is it sounds exhausting, you know, and  
13 you can't pay full attention. And you know, that's a  
14 pretty big negative. So I think only the ones who've  
15 served as Chairs so far can speak to that. And you know,  
16 where they fall in that balance. And you know, it's  
17 pluses and minuses both ways, obviously.

18 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Well, I mean, for me, I'll just  
19 respond to that and then I'll turn it over to  
20 Commissioner Fernandez. I mean, I think for me, I think  
21 some of these other ideas that have come up where, you  
22 know, maybe the, you know, someone else can manage, you  
23 know, watching for hands and who's going to speak up.  
24 And also, I think turning over the facilitation role to  
25 other commissioners who are, you know, leading a given

1 topic would also be helpful. But I will say, you know,  
2 it's a work getting, you know, the agenda together and  
3 you know, I mean it's a -- it's work but you know, it's  
4 what we sign up for, I guess. So Commissioner Fernandez.

5 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Gosh darn it, I've lost my  
6 train of thought. Okay. In terms of the gaps, yeah,  
7 Commissioner Andersen was correct. We do have that gap  
8 in December. And we have to really think ahead because  
9 at some point in time we're going to have no gaps. So  
10 it's going to be week after week after week after week.  
11 So that may work out better.

12 We did in our first meeting together, I believe, it  
13 was Commissioners Yee and Toledo that put together a  
14 list. And I don't know, maybe an option would be to have  
15 them maybe go back and kind of take the information that  
16 we've talked about and then come up with another proposed  
17 rotation in terms of the meeting dates.

18 And then in terms of the -- in response to  
19 Commissioner Yee, in terms of it being exhausting. I  
20 think a better word for it might be, not necessarily  
21 exhausting, but you just really have to plan for it,  
22 like, the day before you're planning for the next day and  
23 that evening you're planning for the next day.

24 So in a sense, it is a little bit more work. But I,  
25 I don't think I'd call it exhausting. I think it's just

1 more of upfront work by the Chair. And again as -- and  
2 if we delegate some of those duties, I think it'll be  
3 easier to manage.

4 So thank you everyone for, I guess looking beyond  
5 the one meeting per Chair, because I do think it'll be  
6 better because we will have a Chair and we will have a  
7 vice Chair that in essence will be connected for four  
8 meetings, if you look at it that way. And they could  
9 work together. And I really think that will be more  
10 powerful and it'll lead to a smoother transition.

11 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Okay. We have Commissioner  
12 Akutagawa, then Commissioner Vazquez.

13 COMMISSIONER AKUTAGAWA: Thank you. And I think  
14 what Commissioner Fernandez said is right. I want to --  
15 I'd like to weigh in on what Commissioner Andersen just  
16 said about, you know, having it each commissioner take on  
17 a month. I see the logic in terms of, you know, like,  
18 yeah, I have this month. But at the same time, if you  
19 have four meetings, you know, in a month, it's a lot of  
20 work. I mean, I think that's really what it is. It's, I  
21 think for me, I mean, and I think everyone's going to be  
22 different, but I think they're -- to me, the Chair's role  
23 is to make sure that we move the meeting along. And that  
24 we accomplish all the kind of agenda items that we need  
25 to do.

1           So part of that also means, as we're getting staff  
2 on, that your role as the Chair also means working with  
3 the staff to make sure that we're all in alignment with  
4 the things that are going to be discussed to understand  
5 what, in this case, Director Claypool is also going to be  
6 reporting on so that then we know and we can anticipate  
7 what is going to be happening for you as the Chair to  
8 also be prepared in terms of how you want to set things  
9 up.

10           I think those are all part of the pre-work that  
11 needs to be done. And I think that -- I think right now,  
12 December and January is kind of a different kind of  
13 animal because of the holidays. We're going to have a  
14 little bit more of the gaps. Whereas I think in the  
15 other months as we go forward, there's going to be less  
16 of those gaps because, basically, the whole entire month  
17 is going to be at play.

18           And so I think whoever is going to be the Chair and  
19 vice Chair will be very conscious of when it's their turn  
20 regardless of the month. And I think, you know, I think  
21 maybe I would just suggest that we try out the, you know,  
22 two meetings in a row, because I think -- I'm also  
23 thinking that if someone is working full time to try to  
24 really be focused in this way and doing all the pre-work,  
25 it's just, I mean, it almost does become a full-time job

1 on its own. And I just want to be respectful. And also  
2 that, you know, I think, you know, those who are working  
3 are trying to balance multiple things. And so I think  
4 we're all attempting to do our best, you know, as we can  
5 on a Zoom to be as focused as possible.

6 I think what's exhausting is being on Zoom all day.  
7 There are days after these meetings where I'm just, like,  
8 just physically tired because it's just like staring into  
9 the camera and into the screen and seeing focused. It's  
10 a whole other animal, I think that that -- many people  
11 have talked about as well, too, so.

12 I think I just want to weigh in for, you know, just  
13 perhaps keeping to every two meetings in a row. And I  
14 think whether or not it makes sense to then start with  
15 December as being the two meetings in a row, that means  
16 that would be Commissioner Le Mons. Or starting with  
17 Commissioner Kennedy.

18 And then so he would take over the first meeting in  
19 December and then Commissioner Le Mons would take over  
20 the second meeting in December and then share the first  
21 meeting in January. I think that's really going to be up  
22 to them whether or not, you know, what they feel is --  
23 how they might want to do it, so. Thank you.

24 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Okay. I have Commissioner  
25 Vazquez and then Andersen.

1           COMMISSIONER VAZQUEZ: Yeah. I will say it is  
2 exhausting for a lot of reasons. It was exhausting for  
3 me. I think a big part of it is Zoom. And so all of  
4 these meetings that take a lot -- facilitation takes a  
5 lot. Managing the business side of it. Chairing takes a  
6 lot. And a lot of planning, you know, you don't just get  
7 to leave, especially as the Chair, you don't just get to  
8 leave the meeting, as Commissioner Fernandez says, and  
9 sort of go back to the regularly scheduled programing.  
10 Particularly if a Chair is on a subcommittee or more than  
11 one subcommittee, as I was. That is also, again,  
12 additional workload for Chairs.

13           So being mindful of that, I will say I'm, like,  
14 hesitant but will go with the group in terms of Chairing  
15 two meetings in a row. I will say, you know, my -- the  
16 learning curve is now over for me. So I feel much more  
17 confident going in. If I was going to Chair one week, I  
18 would feel as confident as I would going in for two  
19 weeks.

20           So we may also consider that in terms of, you know,  
21 maybe the rest -- maybe the first cycle finishes off  
22 doing these two meetings in a row. But maybe as -- once  
23 we've all had a chance to sort of experience it, that  
24 trial by fire, and have had a longer time of getting our  
25 feet wet with it, we might be able to move at a different

1 clip. Because also, we don't know how frequently we're  
2 going to need to be meeting once things really get  
3 cranking. And two meetings might actually be not enough  
4 in terms of just keeping some continuity.

5 So I will go with the group. But I did want to say  
6 that particularly if you're on a committee and are  
7 working and/or have family obligations, that Chairing  
8 really is -- expect to do 40 hours a week of Commission  
9 business.

10 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Okay. I think I'm going to go to  
11 you, Commissioner Andersen, in just a second. But I'd  
12 like to say, you know, I think we've all had a chance to  
13 provide our input and thoughts on this. We're up against  
14 a break. So Commissioner Andersen, if you could just be  
15 succinct for me, that would be awesome. And then we'll  
16 move it forward.

17 COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: Yes. As the first Chair of  
18 the whole gang here, I was total trial by fire. And  
19 there are two -- as a Chair, there are basically two  
20 things. There's the administrative part and there's the  
21 agenda part. And on the administrative, what I believe  
22 we should do is create -- and this would basically be a  
23 task of the previous Chairs, of what are the  
24 administrative tasks? List them out. This is what  
25 happens. Bing, bing, bing, bing, bing. Assign several

1 of those to the vice Chair in terms of collecting who  
2 goes next, that sort of thing. There's certain  
3 delegation of tasks.

4 And then, as far as the agenda items to keep these  
5 flowing all the way through and from one meeting to the  
6 next into the next meeting, we need to be diligent about  
7 keeping going, that agenda items list, which we have  
8 created on a shared document. That should be kept up to  
9 date. Therefore, you know what's coming. You can see  
10 it.

11 We need to be diligent about adding to that because  
12 the Chair then ultimately then can take that group and  
13 know what they need to do because the Chair does have to  
14 deal with the staffing, getting the things involved.  
15 It's as Commissioner Akutagawa said. But having a list  
16 of what the standards and procedures are per meeting in  
17 terms of the public comment, when the breaks are, the  
18 timing of all that stuff.

19 If you start out with a list of that, it takes away  
20 the problems of the administrative and the headache part  
21 of that. So I think we should put these -- put this  
22 together in a process similar, you know, Commissioner  
23 Fornaciari has said, let's try to write a few things down  
24 and get -- and have that standardized. So every Chair  
25 comes in does that.

1           And then I like the two meetings, it was two  
2 meeting. I didn't mean like per month because that is  
3 entirely too much. I meant by two meeting. It's just  
4 where we make the break, I think we have a look at. And  
5 then the other -- the only other item I would say is the  
6 one thing to move our meetings along is, as opposed to  
7 listing, now, who put their hand up next and next and  
8 next, we need to come back to follow up, because that  
9 will eliminate --

10           CHAIR FORNACIARI: Commissioner Andersen, can I stop  
11 you there because we're going to have that conversation  
12 after the break.

13           COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: Oh, okay. Because that  
14 that's the one thing I would add to --

15           CHAIR FORNACIARI: Yeah, okay.

16           COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: -- recommend and then I'm  
17 done.

18           CHAIR FORNACIARI: All right. Thank you. And can  
19 you send me, like, a summary of what you just proposed?

20           COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: Sure.

21           CHAIR FORNACIARI: Thank you. Okay. I'll go to  
22 Commissioner Vazquez and then I think. I think we've got  
23 our answer.

24           COMMISSIONER VAZQUEZ: Yes. Sorry, I was going to  
25 endorse Commissioner Andersen's plan. And also offer --

1 we might want to think about having a board -- or a  
2 board -- a Commission secretary who is third in line for  
3 Chairing and that person's sole job is tracking the  
4 agenda items because they, you know, two weeks out is  
5 their agenda. So again, in dividing some of the some of  
6 the labor up that a Commission secretary on the  
7 Commission could track those items.

8 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Okay. So it sounds like I think,  
9 I mean, I just want to get some kind of thumbs up kind of  
10 consensus. But it sounds like we're kind of thinking two  
11 meetings would be appropriate kind of -- okay?

12 And so Commissioner Kennedy, do you want to, I mean,  
13 We're -- about, you know, I guess it would be on you if  
14 you want to start it or if we want to start with.  
15 Commissioner Le Mons. Where are you?

16 Where are you at Commissioner Kennedy?

17 VICE CHAIR KENNEDY: I just go back and say, you  
18 know, it wasn't in my plans. That in and of itself isn't  
19 a problem. It just means that I have to kind of reopen  
20 that part of my brain and start thinking, okay, what is  
21 that agenda for the 1st through the 3rd of December going  
22 to be? I don't know how far Commissioner Le Mons might  
23 be in conceptualizing an agenda for that meeting. If  
24 he's already, you know, making progress on, you know,  
25 conceptualizing what he would like to do with that

1 meeting, I'm perfectly happy for him to proceed.

2 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Well, it sounds like he's  
3 shaking -- go ahead, Commissioner Le Mons.

4 COMMISSIONER LE MONS: I was just saying, no  
5 progress. But I'm more than happy to start it, if that's  
6 where you want to start it.

7 So whichever way Commissioner Kennedy wants to go  
8 because I am working with him. So I really am  
9 comfortable either supporting him in vice-Chairing two in  
10 a row or picking it up and starting it. So I really am  
11 very comfortable -- but I have made no progress on the  
12 agenda. Zero.

13 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Okay. So why don't -- how about  
14 this? We'll let you two figure it out, and then whatever  
15 you two decide, we'll go with, okay?

16 VICE CHAIR KENNEDY: Yeah, let's have -- let's have  
17 a chat over the weekend, if you have time.

18 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Okay. So we are up against a  
19 break at this point. And so it's 11:02. We went a  
20 little bit long. But -- so I'm -- I like round numbers,  
21 so 11:20, we'll come back.

22 (Whereupon, a recess was held)

23 CHAIR FORNACIARI: All right. Well, welcome back.  
24 For Commissioner Sinay who had to step out for a meeting,  
25 we spent the entire time discussing the Chair and the

1 Chair role and came up with some ideas about how we might  
2 ease the -- you know, balance the administrative and the  
3 facilitative role that the Chair has.

4 And we decided to change the duration of the Chair's  
5 responsibility to two meetings instead of three days, or  
6 one meeting. And so Commissioner Kennedy and  
7 Commissioner Le Mons are -- since they're Chair and vice-  
8 Chair at the next meeting, they're going to make a  
9 decision on how they want to move forward with that,  
10 whether Commissioner Kennedy takes two or it starts with  
11 Commissioner Le Mons.

12 So Commissioner Yee?

13 COMMISSIONER YEE: Yes. Thanks for that summary.  
14 Just to remind ourselves, the language of the rotation is  
15 "generally" and "normally", you know. So you know, we  
16 each have different outside Commission lives, and by  
17 personality, I think Chairing is more effortful or less  
18 effortful for different ones.

19 So it's perfectly okay, I think, going forward -- I  
20 mean, this could -- this will be our ordinary practice,  
21 but it's perfectly okay to opt to Chair only one meeting  
22 rather than two. Just make that known well ahead of  
23 time, right? Especially for us first-timers. I don't  
24 know, that -- I'm thinking maybe I'll -- I don't know.  
25 Maybe I might want to opt for just one meeting, at least

1 the first time.

2 But there's no requirement that -- I mean, it -- you  
3 know, it can be different for each one, and it can -- you  
4 can drop out of the rotation as well or not -- or you  
5 know, drop in or out.

6 So also just want to -- since nobody's mentioned it,  
7 I just want to also say I think it really helps having  
8 different personalities Chair. You know, I -- you know,  
9 too much of any one of us -- I don't -- I don't want to  
10 listen myself on and on. So that is a real, real plus, I  
11 think, and another reason to not make it too long.

12 So I -- so the language can be generally two  
13 meetings, and we can just go forward with that. I think  
14 it can be a proposal and not -- it doesn't have to be a  
15 motion, I don't think.

16 CHAIR FORNACIARI: I don't -- I think we've -- I  
17 don't -- I don't think so. I think -- I mean, it's just,  
18 you know, how we're going to run our meetings, so I think  
19 it's fine.

20 Commissioner Sinay, did I -- did you have your hand  
21 up? Oh, I see Commissioner Vazquez. I'm not sure who  
22 was first. Commissioner Sinay?

23 COMMISSIONER SINAY: I just wanted -- I know that  
24 Commissioner Akutagawa volunteered to, you know, pay  
25 attention to who was next in line and use the chat. I

1 thought that was a great idea. And since I have not --  
2 did not step forward to be on the -- on the -- on the  
3 rotation, I'm willing to, you know, help with that as  
4 well at any point, just keeping track for whoever's --  
5 who's ever Chairing.

6 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Okay. Thank you. Commissioner  
7 Vazquez?

8 COMMISSIONER VAZQUEZ: I do think Commissioner  
9 Yee -- I appreciate the offer for flexibility for people  
10 wanting to drop out. I had asked to drop out in the  
11 middle of the rotation and was not able -- was not  
12 allowed to by the Commission, and it would have really  
13 helped me had I been able to sort of table my time for  
14 when I was feeling better, because I was really sick last  
15 month.

16 But I think if that option can be afforded to folks,  
17 especially looking at their schedules, especially health  
18 thing come -- health things come up, family things come  
19 up. I think officially being able to -- ahead of -- if  
20 you know ahead of time, being able to pull yourself out  
21 of the rotation and have folks knowing that they're going  
22 to be facilitating earlier.

23 Because I think also what happened with Commissioner  
24 Akutagawa was that I just had to tap out after three days  
25 and she was sort of shoved into facilitating a full day,

1 which I think was -- that was a less-than-ideal outcome  
2 for both of us. So I think especially if we afford grace  
3 and do so sort of in the out weeks, I would appreciate  
4 that.

5 CHAIR FORNACIARI: And -- well, thank you for that.  
6 Yeah. Thank you. And thank you for Chairing when you  
7 weren't feeling well.

8 Okay. I -- so the pre-read that I sent out for this  
9 action item was -- did I pull it out yet? I have it  
10 here. You know, just some thoughts that I had, and the  
11 way I've organized it was just kind of around general  
12 meeting -- around meeting procedures, a conversation  
13 around meeting procedures, and then a conversation around  
14 ground rules. And so I thought we'd go into the meeting  
15 procedure part of the conversation. We've already  
16 begun -- we've already touched on that.

17 And I just want to say, you know -- let's see -- I  
18 recognize that all of us are different and have different  
19 ways of learning and taking in information, and you know,  
20 this might be kind of looked at as an approach to get to  
21 maximum efficiency, and that might sacrifice  
22 effectiveness, if you will. And that wasn't my intent,  
23 you know. My intent -- I want to make sure everyone's  
24 heard. I want to make sure we're all on the same page.

25 I think, you know, the last -- or whatever it was,

1 Wednesday afternoon, when we were having the discussion  
2 about the roles of the different teams, I mean, I feel  
3 like I kind of got the conversation off the rails because  
4 I didn't -- I wasn't getting it. You know, I think I get  
5 it now. But I think -- I mean, I think it's important  
6 that we allow the space for people to be on the same  
7 page, but you know, while we balance, you know, moving  
8 things along. So I mean, it's kind of a tough -- kind of  
9 a tough -- maybe an impossible tradeoff. I don't know.  
10 But anyway, that's kind of what I was thinking.

11 I have the document here. I was going to share it,  
12 if you will, or -- but I'm going to have to ask for a  
13 volunteer to keep track of hands being raised. And  
14 again, I just threw this -- just throwing it against the  
15 wall and see if it sticks. It's just Neal's idea. So  
16 you know, whatever, you know, you guys -- I mean,  
17 we'll -- we need to own this together.

18 And I saw Commissioner Kennedy raise his hand.

19 VICE CHAIR KENNEDY: Just as vice-Chair, I'm  
20 volunteering to be spotter.

21 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Okay. Okay. So I'm going to  
22 share my screen, then, and if that would be -- oh, wait a  
23 minute here. That's not how I do it. I think I can do  
24 this, actually, too.

25 COMMISSIONER SINAY: You're sharing, in case you

1 were wondering. It worked.

2 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Okay. I'm also -- I put all of  
3 you all on my other screen, and it's completely at a  
4 different angle.

5 So on the -- in the -- so I want to give you guys  
6 just a little background, too. And so I kind of wanted  
7 to capture what I thought were sort of our general  
8 meeting procedures, and the second one is providing  
9 context. So I'll start with that.

10 You know, we've been wanting to have this  
11 conversation for a while. You know, we didn't have the  
12 space for it for a lot of meetings. And this was kind of  
13 the first meeting I thought that we could -- we could fit  
14 it in -- we could fit it in the agenda, so I did.

15 And again, so the conversation's going to be about  
16 meeting procedures and ground rules, if we want to do  
17 that. And so I just kind of thought we'd go through, you  
18 know, maybe section by section and have a little bit of a  
19 conversation, if there's things I'm missing, if there's,  
20 you know, other stuff folks have in mind that they want  
21 to put in or throw out or you know, if I -- if I caught  
22 the gist of what we have in mind here close enough, then,  
23 you know, we could move to the next session or whatever.

24 So -- but I -- you know, I think this needs to be a  
25 real kind of dialogue here somehow, if -- you know, it's

1 tough on Zoom. But you know, I just really encourage  
2 everyone to chime in as best we can. Or you know, it's  
3 such a brilliant document, we could just accept it as it  
4 is. Probably not.

5 So the -- does anyone want to break the ice and kind  
6 of chime in? Commissioner Fernandez.

7 Oh, sorry, Commissioner Kennedy, that's your role.

8 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Before you called on me, I  
9 figured I should raise my hand. I'm not sure if you're  
10 going to go over, like -- I didn't really have issues  
11 with the general meeting procedures, but with the voting.  
12 And I don't know, with present versus abstain, is that,  
13 like, a common way to vote? Because I know when I was on  
14 the board, we would just say abstain instead of --  
15 because that's what you were doing, was abstaining. And  
16 I'm trying to think of, you know, common language, but  
17 maybe present is abstain.

18 But I'm trying to think for the public out there. I  
19 didn't know that present meant abstain, and it might be  
20 easier just to put abstain, because if we're -- once we  
21 go out there into the -- if we ever go out to the  
22 community or even at -- even our meetings, I don't want  
23 there to be confusion. That was my just comment on that  
24 piece.

25 CHAIR FORNACIARI: You're in charge, Commissioner

1 Kennedy, so you can call on yourself.

2 VICE CHAIR KENNEDY: Thank you, sir. Since I've  
3 been probably the one who's made most use of that, I will  
4 say that, you know, this is something that I clarified  
5 with Amanda Saxton when she was our temporary counsel.  
6 "Present" is the -- is the verbiage in Robert's Rules,  
7 which, you know, we were under and I always thought all  
8 of us were under. So that's why I've used it that way,  
9 and that may be why it appeared this way here.

10 CHAIR FORNACIARI: But we're okay with abstain? I  
11 think it's -- I think it's a good point. I think it's  
12 clearer. Okay.

13 MR. MANOFF: I'm sorry to interrupt, Chair. This is  
14 Kristian. If you make your zoom fit to width, it may be  
15 easier to read.

16 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Okay, yeah. It's -- yeah, okay.  
17 Zoom, okay. How do I do that? I don't -- I'm not --

18 MR. MANOFF: I think in the view menu of Word, you  
19 can do that.

20 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Oh, view. Okay, got you.

21 MR. MANOFF: And then under zoom. Much --

22 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Or I can just zoom a little more,  
23 too.

24 COMMISSIONER VAZQUEZ: That's much better, Chair.

25 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Okay. Yeah, good. Sorry. It

1 was good for me, but I appreciate the feedback.

2 VICE CHAIR KENNEDY: Commissioner Ahmad?

3 COMMISSIONER AHMAD: Thank you. This is great. I  
4 love that you put this together for us as a starting  
5 point for our discussion.

6 One thing, if we scroll back up to the meeting --  
7 general meeting procedures, something that I've noticed  
8 that could be helpful for us as a group is the way we  
9 communicate direction to staff. I've seen several times  
10 that, you know, we tend to have a great idea and we want  
11 to get it to staff as soon as possible, and then we will  
12 just throw it out to staff rather than funneling it  
13 through the Chair, and then following a recommendation or  
14 a direction, someone else will give an opposite  
15 recommendation or direction.

16 So I think it might be confusing in terms of how we  
17 are delivering what we need to staff and could be  
18 potentially a way to alleviate some of the  
19 miscommunication that happens. So my recommendation  
20 would be that us as a Commission communicate what we  
21 would like from staff to one person, probably the Chair,  
22 and the Chair make that direction to staff.

23 VICE CHAIR KENNEDY: Commissioner Andersen?

24 COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: I said two -- but on  
25 clarification, that -- is that just events that occur at

1 a meeting that you're just saying this, Commissioner  
2 Ahmad? Because the reason I want a clarification is  
3 subcommittees do work directly with staff, and that would  
4 put another step in there, and I don't think that's what  
5 you're implying. Is that -- could you clarify that?

6 COMMISSIONER AHMAD: That's a great question, if I  
7 may answer that question. I -- this recommendation I  
8 think is just for these open public meeting sessions. I  
9 hadn't thought of the other avenue, which I think would  
10 warrant a different conversation in terms of how we all  
11 keep the Chair up to date, given our Bagley-Keene  
12 requirements of less than two people communicating about  
13 any item outside of a public meeting. So thank you for  
14 asking that question and requesting that clarification.

15 COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: And then my item is actually  
16 on number 5, creating -- this is minutes. And this has  
17 come up, and we were actually -- I believe Ms. Sheffield  
18 is the person who is now going to be assisting us with  
19 minutes. But in terms of -- I -- again, this is the  
20 Robert's Rules of Order, which I'm pretty sure we are  
21 supposed to be under a modified version of which. That's  
22 a separate issue, but -- and minutes have a certain  
23 requirement.

24 And the way we had been doing it is -- this, again,  
25 with -- eight under much more rigid rules. But we had

1 minutes come out, and the edits -- that was all done in  
2 open session. So in terms of, you know, edits will be  
3 returned after -- that all happened at open session,  
4 because the minutes came out to everybody and then were  
5 modified.

6 Now -- and I might ask counsel if she might be able  
7 to -- you know, who knows more about the Bagley-Keene  
8 requirements and possibly how this works, if the proposal  
9 here might not be in line with that. So that was my  
10 issue, if you could -- thank you.

11 VICE CHAIR KENNEDY: Commissioner Yee is next,  
12 followed by Commissioner Fernandez. Actually,  
13 Commissioner Yee, could we have Marian first?

14 COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: Perfect. Thank you.

15 MS. JOHNSTON: There is no requirement that you  
16 follow Robert's Rules. That is totally up to you all.  
17 Customarily, a lot of agencies and commissions decide to  
18 follow them or follow them to some modified extent. But  
19 whether or not you want to follow them or how much you  
20 want to follow them is within your purview.

21 CHAIR FORNACIARI: So if I can just chime in --  
22 sorry -- take the Chair's prerogative here, the -- you  
23 know, just to let everyone know, we were informed by  
24 counsel -- the first eight were informed by counsel that  
25 it was a legal requirement for us to use Robert's Rules

1 of Order, and they suggested a lite version of Robert's  
2 Rules of Order. But I looked into it. I asked Marian.  
3 There is no legal requirement for us to use Robert's  
4 Rules of Order.

5 And the other point is Ms. Saxton made it crystal  
6 clear in her instructions to us that a vote during the  
7 first eight, to use this lite Robert's Rules of Order,  
8 did not translate to the entire Commission, because the  
9 first eight could not take an action that encumbered the  
10 entire Commission, is my recollection of that -- of how  
11 that conversation went.

12 MS. JOHNSTON: And I just wanted to add about  
13 minutes, the only Bagley-Keene requirement for minutes is  
14 for closed sessions. So to the extent you want to have  
15 meetings kept of your open sessions, that's up to you to  
16 decide how you want to direct staff.

17 VICE CHAIR KENNEDY: Okay. So Commissioner Yee,  
18 Commissioner Fernandez, Commissioner Andersen,  
19 Commissioner Sinay.

20 COMMISSIONER YEE: Following up on that, and then a  
21 different point. So some minutes -- I mean, don't -- so  
22 Marian, minute -- or Counsel, minutes have -- don't  
23 minutes have a legal standing? I mean, number 5 is  
24 asking for basically notes, but those are not minutes,  
25 right? I mean, minutes have to be approved and all that

1 kind of thing.

2 MS. JOHNSTON: Well, if you're following Robert's  
3 Rules of Order, yeah. But again, minutes in Bagley-Keene  
4 only says you have to report actions taken -- first of  
5 all, to go into closed session, you have to notice what  
6 you're going to be talking about, and then you have to  
7 report out actions taken. If you want to have minutes,  
8 you decide what you want to have included in them and  
9 what form you want to have them in.

10 COMMISSIONER YEE: Right. But otherwise, there's no  
11 actual official record of actions taken, right? I  
12 mean --

13 MS. JOHNSTON: Well, we keep --

14 COMMISSIONER YEE: -- other than --

15 MS. JOHNSTON: We keep -- I keep the copies of all  
16 the minute -- of all the votes.

17 COMMISSIONER YEE: Right. Yeah, I'm just -- I'm  
18 just wondering -- yeah. And those are publicly  
19 accessible? You know, I mean --

20 MS. JOHNSTON: Well, no, because they're my notes.  
21 But --

22 COMMISSIONER YEE: Yeah.

23 MS. JOHNSTON: -- the video transcript is publicly  
24 accessible, and that has always been in lieu of  
25 particular minutes. But if you want to have minutes,

1 Wanda is certainly capable of doing that.

2 COMMISSIONER YEE: Right. So the question is how to  
3 document officially taken actions in a publicly  
4 accessible manner. Can they just be this basically memo,  
5 or do they need to be officially approved minutes?

6 MS. JOHNSTON: That is up to you all.

7 COMMISSIONER YEE: Okay. That probably bears  
8 further discussion. But quickly, can I also mention --  
9 so with numbers 1 and 3, can we insert the word  
10 "generally" or perhaps "ordinarily", just so that we have  
11 a little more flexibility there?

12 CHAIR FORNACIARI: There?

13 COMMISSIONER YEE: Yeah, perfect. And then 3 as  
14 well, I'm thinking, because, you know, sometimes we just  
15 can't get it in two days before. Thanks.

16 VICE CHAIR KENNEDY: Okay. Commissioner Fernandez.

17 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Thank you, Commissioner  
18 Yee, for that in terms of the number 1, because when  
19 we've been in closed session, we haven't adhered to that.  
20 So thank you for bringing that up.

21 And then the other thing on the minutes -- so on the  
22 school board for many years. The first board secretary  
23 just took detailed minutes -- I mean, put everything out  
24 there. But then you kind of -- I didn't agree with that  
25 because you really -- it should really just be action

1 items that were taken.

2       So I think as a Commission, if we want minutes, my  
3 recommendation would be that the minutes would only  
4 contain action items. I mean, and what we did is it was  
5 similar to how the agenda is, and then if there was -- so  
6 there was -- normally, there weren't any comments on  
7 anything other than action items. And at that point, it  
8 was just, like, who made the motion and who seconded. So  
9 that's how we did it. I feel that's appropriate. If  
10 anyone wants additional detail, they can then go to the  
11 audio recording.

12       And then could I also get some clarification on what  
13 would be the difference of following Robert's Rules  
14 versus not following Robert's Rules? That would be  
15 helpful in terms of deciding if we're going to move  
16 forward with the simple Robert's Rules or whatever we're  
17 going to do. So I would just like some education on that  
18 piece of it. Thank you.

19       VICE CHAIR KENNEDY: Okay. Commissioner Andersen is  
20 next, but could I ask -- could I call on Marian first?

21       MS. JOHNSTON: Just in addition about what has to be  
22 required if you're -- if you are reporting actions taken,  
23 when it's a special vote, you have to indicate who voted  
24 for which item because that clarifies whether an action  
25 is legally taken or not, if a special vote is required.

1 VICE CHAIR KENNEDY: Okay, thank you. Commissioner  
2 Andersen?

3 COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: I -- Commissioner Yee really  
4 sort of helped bring this to a line. I thought we did  
5 indeed say we would like some sort of minutes, and I  
6 think I -- rather than -- I understand the need to put --  
7 to work out a procedure. I am always extremely cautious  
8 about writing everything down because then we are hung by  
9 these. So I'm -- I really like the adding generally,  
10 generally, generally.

11 These are -- these are ideas and proposals. I don't  
12 want us to have to, like -- you didn't do it this way, so  
13 therefore, everything you've done is invalid. I'm a  
14 little concerned about that overall and specifically on  
15 the minutes. We have talked about this several times  
16 before, and I would like us to decide what we do want to  
17 have and the implications.

18 And also, I think on that, we will have public  
19 comment because part of the idea where minutes came from  
20 is we've had other people who are watching our -- you  
21 know, who are following us but not watching every single  
22 day, and they wanted to see, well, what happened? And  
23 they had no way of looking unless they watched the  
24 entire, you know, video transcript. No way of knowing.

25 And so I'm a little concerned. I -- yes, actions

1 taken, but -- and I understand the -- I think we need a  
2 little bit more. Like, we need either actions taken,  
3 general -- you know, not -- topics are obviously an  
4 agenda. But just a short summary of what was discussed,  
5 you know, just, again, short, but just a little bit of --  
6 you know, did -- because sometimes we discuss things and  
7 come to an idea, but we didn't actually vote on it,  
8 there's no action item.

9       And the idea -- so someone who was following us but  
10 doesn't have the time to watch all of it can, you know,  
11 quickly kind of understand what we actually did, which is  
12 part of the purpose of the minutes, to document, you  
13 know, all, obviously, actions taken and -- as well as a  
14 general idea of what we actually did as opposed to just  
15 the agenda.

16       VICE CHAIR KENNEDY: Okay. Commissioner Sinay.

17       COMMISSIONER SINAY: Thank you, Vice-Chair. Minutes  
18 to me are a pain for many different reasons. But I do  
19 believe in having a summary and an action item.

20       The -- where things have gone, the evolution, just  
21 so that people understand, is it used to be you wrote  
22 down everything. And then we were able to do video, and  
23 the public demanded video, and that's how -- and some  
24 school boards were like, we're not going to do it, and  
25 some city councils said, we're not going to do it. But

1 things moved on to video. What they didn't realize was  
2 they were going to have to watch eight hours or three  
3 days of video when they demanded that.

4       You know, and so I would -- I -- we need to be -- I  
5 don't want -- the one thing I don't want is for us to  
6 have to review the minutes in the meeting and correct  
7 them in the -- in the meeting and take that hour to  
8 debate everything again that took place last time,  
9 because that to me is the big -- that's my big enemy with  
10 minutes, is the amount of time people -- you're supposed  
11 to -- the right -- if you're going to follow -- you're  
12 supposed to write minutes, send it out to everybody right  
13 away, everybody sends their comments back, and by the  
14 time it's presented to the public, it's already gotten  
15 all those corrections. But no one does it that way, and  
16 I just don't want to spend our valuable time going  
17 through the minutes when we've got the video of it.

18       I do see it would be helpful if we took the agenda  
19 and we were able to say, at the -- you know, put the  
20 agenda by time and date, you know, just -- so say this  
21 item was discussed on Tuesday at 2:00, and people can  
22 find it in the video quicker, and maybe a summary. And  
23 that way, you can go to the video to Tuesday at 2:00 or  
24 whatever it is, or at .1 whatever.

25       But I just -- I would like us to get away from

1 calling them minutes and maybe summary and action items  
2 and -- so we stay away from that legal terminology of  
3 minutes. Minutes can be -- you can be held all sorts of  
4 things in minutes too, but I'm sure you can in any  
5 writing thing. But I just don't want to spend time in  
6 meetings talking about them.

7 VICE CHAIR KENNEDY: Okay. I'm next. I haven't  
8 seen any -- and then Commissioner Vazquez after me.

9 I generally agree with Commissioner Sinay on this.  
10 Something that is a summary and list of taskings -- we  
11 had our discussion this morning and trying to come up  
12 with, well, when did we ask, you know, that a draft press  
13 release be prepared before the end of the Ogilvy  
14 contract? It would be very handy to have a summary and  
15 taskings list that we could quickly refer to and find out  
16 when that happened, and I think it would help all of us  
17 to have something very short, crisp, that lays out the  
18 essentials for us.

19 My other concern is we understand that minutes have  
20 been taken of closed session, but we've never seen them.  
21 And so I, looking ahead, could anticipate a time when,  
22 you know, for some reason the minutes became relevant,  
23 and we read them, and somebody says, well, that's not how  
24 I remember it. So I'm wondering if we should have the  
25 opportunity to review the minutes of the closed session.

1           So Commissioner Vazquez.

2           COMMISSIONER VAZQUEZ: Generally in agreement with  
3 Commissioner Sinay and Commissioner Kennedy. I feel like  
4 with a summary -- I'm not really a fan of having a  
5 summary of discussions leading up to any next steps.  
6 Someone is always going to be unhappy about how the  
7 discussion -- how their portion of the discussion is  
8 going to be framed in the minutes and that's -- those are  
9 conversations that are probably not particularly valuable  
10 to be had given everything else we have going on, so.  
11 And I forgot where I was going with that. But yes,  
12 basically, I'm not super thrilled at the idea of  
13 summaries.

14           Oh, I would say if -- for these discussions, I think  
15 it comes back on the -- particularly the committees --  
16 the subcommittees -- to have your board -- or your  
17 Commission reports and materials thoroughly fleshed out.  
18 And so with each of these agenda items, we'll have --  
19 people have handouts and materials, and then any next  
20 steps that follow from that, and I just -- I don't think  
21 summarizing the discussions and the back and forth is  
22 especially valuable as long as we have appropriate  
23 meeting handouts and materials, and then next steps.

24           VICE CHAIR KENNEDY: Chair, I'm seeing no other  
25 hands.

1 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Okay.

2 VICE CHAIR KENNEDY: Marian's hand is up.

3 MS. JOHNSTON: Just to your comment, Commissioner  
4 Kennedy, about what -- what's transpires during closed  
5 session. That is the purpose of reporting out in open  
6 session any actions taken during closed session, and at  
7 that point, if someone disagreed with it, they could  
8 speak up. But other than that, the minutes are not  
9 publicly disclosed unless there's some litigation as to  
10 that requires them to be disclosed.

11 CHAIR FORNACIARI: So I just want to clarify that  
12 point. So minutes are being currently taken in closed  
13 session?

14 MS. JOHNSTON: That record actions taken, yes.

15 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Okay. So we're just recording  
16 actions taken in closed session?

17 MS. JOHNSTON: That's correct.

18 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Okay.

19 So Zack (ph.). Go ahead, Commissioner Kennedy.

20 VICE CHAIR KENNEDY: Do you have something?

21 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Who? Me?

22 VICE CHAIR KENNEDY: Yes.

23 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Oh, no, I just -- did you want to  
24 comment on that?

25 VICE CHAIR KENNEDY: Commissioner Yee has raised his

1 hand.

2 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Oh, I'm sorry. I lost you. Go  
3 ahead.

4 COMMISSIONER YEE: Yes, I did. That was a mistake.  
5 But I mean, generally, we want publicly-accessible  
6 records of actions taken and just some accessibility to  
7 what we're doing, right, without having to watch through  
8 hours and hours of video. I mean, that seems like a very  
9 desirable and obvious and uncontroversial part of our  
10 work, I would think.

11 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Okay. Well, so what I've got for  
12 item 5 now is staff will create, distribute, and post to  
13 the web a brief summary after the completion of each  
14 meeting that will include all actions taken; a summary of  
15 discussions with question marks because I think some  
16 people want that and some people don't, and we need to  
17 decide; a list of actions given who is responsible when  
18 they are due; dates and times when the agenda -- the  
19 dates and times when an agenda item was discussed; and  
20 then finally, edits by commissioners will be returned  
21 within three business days after the initial draft is  
22 distributed, so we will review it off-line and not during  
23 the meeting is the proposal. Did I catch it?

24 VICE CHAIR KENNEDY: Okay. Commissioner Andersen.

25 COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: Just a quick -- I hear what

1 people are saying about this summary discussion, and I  
2 meant just a general summary, not a who did what, who --  
3 no. This was talked about and -- like, it was tabled,  
4 you know, because that would never even come up if it  
5 wasn't -- only action items, or you know, just a general  
6 kind of idea is what I was trying to put in there.

7       And on item D, dates and times, I understand that  
8 would be very helpful, but that means someone has to  
9 go -- the staff person has to go through the video and  
10 then log all that at the time, and you know, I don't know  
11 if we want to do that. I mean, that strikes me as a lot.  
12 That's where I was kind of going at the summary of  
13 discussion is a quick -- it's a much -- a few lines is  
14 much easier than having someone go through the dates and  
15 times on the whole video. So that's what --

16       CHAIR FORNACIARI: So --

17       COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: -- I was saying on that one.

18       CHAIR FORNACIARI: I mean, on that one, I would -- I  
19 mean, Wanda's in the room the whole time, and she's got  
20 the agenda in front of her, and I would think that she  
21 would just note as we're going along on her agenda when  
22 it happened.

23       COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: I would ask on the video  
24 recording if that's how it's marked. I don't know. I  
25 think it might be beginning of time on the video, which

1 case, she'd have to have a stopwatch to do that.

2 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Well, I meant -- I thought we  
3 were thinking time of day, not time on video.

4 COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: My interpretation was --

5 VICE CHAIR KENNEDY: That's correct.

6 COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: -- time on video so someone  
7 could look at the video to kind of go, oh, this is where  
8 they were talking about that, so I'll go to that point in  
9 the video. That's where I thought that line was coming  
10 from. If it is just time of the day during the meeting,  
11 yes, that -- then I certainly let it stand.

12 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Well, that was my interpretation.  
13 Time of day. Our meetings start at 9:30, so you can  
14 fast-forward.

15 VICE CHAIR KENNEDY: Commissioner Yee, is your hand  
16 raised?

17 COMMISSIONER YEE: It is intentionally now, yes.

18 VICE CHAIR KENNEDY: Okay.

19 COMMISSIONER YEE: For summary of discussions, how  
20 about just topics discussed? Because I agree, we don't  
21 want all the back and forth.

22 And then I think I have a question for Kristian  
23 then. On the video, is it timestamped time of the day,  
24 or is it just timestamped the minutes into the video?  
25 Because it's just a matter of accessibility.

1           And then I would -- at minimum, I'd want time and  
2 day -- some accessibility -- timing to make motions  
3 accessible. And then if it's easy, if Wanda's always  
4 there, if it's trivial to usually include other timings,  
5 then sure, why not? But not if it's a big chore.

6           But Kristian, how are the videos marked?

7           MR. MANOFF: So to answer your question,  
8 Commissioner Yee, the video is marked in time code and so  
9 that is not associated with clock time. Now it is  
10 possible to put a clock in the lower right-hand corner of  
11 the screen, and I can explore options for that and report  
12 back to the Commission.

13          CHAIR FORNACIARI: Okay. That would be great.  
14 Thank you.

15          So I have a question for Commissioner Yee. How is  
16 topics discussed different than the agenda items?

17          COMMISSIONER YEE: Because sometimes it's not  
18 identical. I mean, of course, it needs to be in the  
19 realm, but you know, agenda item might just be a  
20 subcommittee report, and then, you know, it really  
21 doesn't tell you that much, right? When the topic ends  
22 up being a specific -- well, it will end up being  
23 something specific, that it just makes it easier to tell  
24 what actually -- what we actually talked about. Because  
25 on subcommittee reports sometimes have specifics

1 associated with them, but they very often don't, so.  
2 Just trying to think what makes it -- what makes our  
3 meetings more publicly accessible? If somebody wants to  
4 find out when we talked about this, I -- how can we help  
5 them find it without making an onerous amount of overhead  
6 for ourselves?

7 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Okay. I see.

8 VICE CHAIR KENNEDY: Commissioner Fernandez, did you  
9 have your hand up?

10 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: I did, but Chair Fornaciari  
11 asked the question of what's the difference? I mean, I  
12 can -- I still would prefer to just have agenda items and  
13 not go into topics discussed or anything like that.  
14 Thank you.

15 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Okay. Commissioner Akutagawa.

16 COMMISSIONER AKUTAGAWA: I think I was just going to  
17 give an example. I think I'm of the school that, you  
18 know, the simpler the better to just give, like -- for  
19 example, I'll just use the current one. So we're on  
20 agenda item number 14, and somebody could just say:  
21 Discussion in agreement on ground rules for working  
22 together and procedures for meeting management. And then  
23 perhaps there could be a bullet point underneath that  
24 that part of this discussion was that Commission  
25 discussed and agreed to have Chair preside over two

1 meetings, and then second bullet point: Commission  
2 discussed ground rules. To me, it seems like that's good  
3 enough. I don't know if people -- if we're talking about  
4 more detail.

5 I mean, I think there's going to be -- I think  
6 what's going to be hard is there's going to be different  
7 schools of thought. I'm sure there's people that are  
8 watching right now that are saying, I want more detail,  
9 and then there are other people who are like, yeah, I  
10 just need the summary and what action was taken. I think  
11 this is kind of like it speaks to the different styles of  
12 how much information we want, what we prefer. I think  
13 what we're trying to do is make it as easy as possible.

14 I think to Commissioner Yee's question to Kristian,  
15 I think on the video recording versus time of day, I  
16 think what is going to be helpful having looked back  
17 through sometimes video recordings of other things,  
18 whatever the video time marker on the video is, I think  
19 that that's what's going to be most helpful because then  
20 if anybody wanted to go to that place in the meeting, it  
21 could just say go to video marker one hour, thirty  
22 minutes into the meeting or something like that, or  
23 whatever it is. So then they'd just know how far to  
24 fast-forward and then at what point do they start the --  
25 watch the recording. So I think time of day isn't going

1 to necessarily be helpful; it's going to be what the  
2 video marker is.

3 MR. MANOFF: This is Kristian again. Just to  
4 interject to that point, it's a common practice to  
5 provide time code the way that Commissioner Akutagawa is  
6 suggesting. We see a lot of commissions do that. The  
7 big question is, normally somebody is going to have to  
8 review that video and come up with those time code  
9 markers afterwards, and that's typically done by the  
10 commission's secretary or whoever is monitoring those  
11 different items.

12 CHAIR FORNACIARI: So I guess I just want to check  
13 in. Do we feel comfortable enough with where we're at on  
14 this item to just give it a try and then see how it  
15 works? And we could -- so we'll try to just kind of very  
16 brief topics discussed. And is that okay to give it a  
17 try and see how it works?

18 VICE CHAIR KENNEDY: Commissioner Yee had his hand  
19 up.

20 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Oh, sorry. You're muted.

21 COMMISSIONER YEE: Thank you, Kristian.

22 So right. And the other option would be having  
23 someone start a timer at the end of each meeting to  
24 collect those timings, which seems unworkable. I'm  
25 wondering if it's close enough just to at least narrow it

1 down because -- so it'd just say morning or afternoon, so  
2 forth. Because if somebody really wants to find  
3 something, we're just trying to be reasonably helpful.  
4 It doesn't have to -- I can't imagine that we'd want  
5 someone to actually go through every single video and  
6 collect timestamps, you know? So what's a reasonable way  
7 to make our decisions and important discussions publicly  
8 accessible?

9 VICE CHAIR KENNEDY: Okay. I have Commissioner  
10 Ahmad, Commissioner Fernandez, Commissioner Sinay,  
11 Commissioner Le Mons.

12 COMMISSIONER AHMAD: Thank you. I can, first of  
13 all, volunteer myself to explore this, but I would like  
14 to offer a solution for this potential conversation.  
15 City of San Jose actually ties their agenda to video  
16 recording, so you can scroll through the agenda and click  
17 on whichever agenda item you want and it will bump you to  
18 that section of the video, so that kind of solution is  
19 possible. It is not something that doesn't exist or is a  
20 novel idea. I'm sure there's other local governing  
21 bodies who use similar technology or potentially even  
22 more advanced technology. And if that's something the  
23 Commission would want more information on, I would  
24 volunteer myself to go explore that and come back with  
25 more information on that if the Chair so wishes.

1 VICE CHAIR KENNEDY: Commissioner Fernandez.

2 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: I think on a meeting if  
3 somebody is talking and they don't have -- if they have a  
4 mute button, I think it should be like a dollar into a  
5 bowl or something, you know what -- just kidding.  
6 Anyway.

7 A question for Kristian. Kristian, can you see the  
8 timestamp as it's going?

9 MR. MANOFF: The time code is generated in post-  
10 production. So --

11 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Oh, okay.

12 MR. MANOFF: -- the recording is taken, and then  
13 basically it starts at zero, but zero is relative. Like,  
14 if we start exactly at 9:30, then zero would be at  
15 exactly 9:30, but if we start at --

16 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Okay.

17 MR. MANOFF: -- 9:36, then zero is at 9:36, so. I  
18 hope that answers your question.

19 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Yes. I was trying to  
20 think of -- I don't know, I was trying to think of  
21 another way of doing that, but. Okay. Thank you.

22 VICE CHAIR KENNEDY: Okay. Commissioner Sinay?

23 COMMISSIONER SINAY: Thank you. Building on what  
24 Commissioner Ahmad said, we have talked about this so  
25 many times, and now we have some of the administrative

1 staff. So I'm wondering if we could please do something  
2 about our dockets so that they're better put together,  
3 they're more professional, they're easier to access,  
4 they're stored somewhere in the cloud where we can go  
5 back to them. And it would be great if we could also  
6 have it the way Commissioner Ahmad had (audio  
7 interference).

8 Our meeting packets and -- it's -- are just a mess  
9 right now. They're very un -- they're hard to use. And  
10 so there's a lot of different programs out there; I don't  
11 think they're that expensive, and if we can find one that  
12 does what Commissioner Ahmad was saying, that would be  
13 great. But I wanted --

14 Chair, if you could ask staff if we have the right  
15 staff now to please explore this because we -- this is --  
16 this was a top priority item when we first started  
17 several months ago.

18 CHAIR FORNACIARI: So what -- I mean, so what do you  
19 mean by -- you said, docket? What is that?

20 COMMISSIONER SINAY: A docket --

21 CHAIR FORNACIARI: What does that encompass?

22 COMMISSIONER SINAY: A docket is our whole meeting  
23 packet. So usually --

24 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Okay.

25 COMMISSIONER SINAY: Like, when I was on the school

1 board -- I know -- Commissioner Fernandez and I keep  
2 going back to our school board experience -- but you have  
3 the agenda, you click on an item on the agenda, and it  
4 takes you to all the background information and stuff,  
5 and then you click back, and it goes back to the agenda,  
6 and then you click -- so it goes back and forth, and  
7 we're not looking for all the different handouts; it's  
8 just very nicely put together. And then in the future  
9 when you need to go back to reading an -- a policy or  
10 something, it's there as well.

11 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Okay. I mean, so you click on an  
12 agenda item, it takes you to, like, another page where  
13 you have access to the video of that section of that  
14 video -- the list of documents that go with it that --

15 COMMISSIONER SINAY: Um-hum.

16 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Okay. That's what you're talking  
17 about? Okay. That's fine.

18 COMMISSIONER SINAY: Yeah, and so the docket  
19 would -- wouldn't have the video at the beginning, but  
20 the docket -- we -- instead of us having to go find the  
21 email that had the agenda, and then the handouts, and  
22 then this, it's just we go to one place that's just for  
23 the commissioners, and we hit -- so we click on the  
24 button "Meeting", and it's all there, and we can move  
25 back and forth very easily. There's plenty of programs

1 that do that.

2 CHAIR FORNACIARI: So you're thinking that's just  
3 for the commissioners and not for the public, too?

4 COMMISSIONER SINAY: It can be used both, but my --

5 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Okay.

6 COMMISSIONER SINAY: -- priority is we need a better  
7 docket for us, the commissioners, and we need a place  
8 where all our documents are, and we can find them quickly  
9 versus, this we each have to have responsibility of where  
10 everything is.

11 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Okay.

12 VICE CHAIR KENNEDY: Commissioner Le Mons.

13 COMMISSIONER LE MONS: Pass.

14 VICE CHAIR KENNEDY: Commissioner Velazquez.

15 COMMISSIONER VAZQUEZ: Yes. I believe I gave two  
16 possible services to Director Claypool a couple of weeks  
17 ago. BoardDocs is probably the one that is most used.  
18 It does all of the things several commissioners have  
19 talked about, including, I believe there is a video  
20 component where you can upload and then link timestamps  
21 to agenda items and the materials. So it's both public-  
22 facing, and there's also an internal-facing component so  
23 that things that are items for closed session remain sort  
24 of firewalled from public view. But it is a whole  
25 database and system that keeps everything organized. And

1 I agree, we really need that sooner rather than later,  
2 especially the more information we start to gather, the  
3 more we're going to need that super organized.

4 And if we were in person, I would expect that we  
5 would have printed board packets, but since we're not, we  
6 need -- and those -- I know because I have been staff for  
7 developing and putting those board packets together; it's  
8 a ton of work -- so since we're not doing that, I would  
9 hope sooner rather than later that we can get a process  
10 for digital board packets.

11 VICE CHAIR KENNEDY: Okay. Commissioner Fernandez.

12 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: And along that same line, I  
13 would appreciate if we could go back to our prior  
14 meetings and also put -- have that also be under the same  
15 where you just click on it.

16 And then, as long as we're talking about prior  
17 meetings, I appreciate that this -- starting with this  
18 week's meeting we actually are noting who the Chair and  
19 vice Chair. I would also recommend that we go to the  
20 prior meetings' agendas and put who the Chair and vice  
21 Chair were because in the future we're going to forget  
22 who did what. But I would like to instill whatever we're  
23 going to -- whatever process we're going to use for these  
24 dockets moving forward, that we also go backwards with  
25 the prior meetings.

1           VICE CHAIR KENNEDY: Just wanting to touch base and  
2 see if Commissioner Taylor has anything that he wants to  
3 add to the discussion at this point.

4           Chair?

5           CHAIR FORNACIARI: Okay. As I mentioned before  
6 earlier, sir, we have a hard stop at 12:15, so we can  
7 have our lunch and be back in time for public comment  
8 into -- and then have time for our speakers.

9           So I've got three proposed actions. I wanted to  
10 have Director Claypool look at -- and his team -- look at  
11 tools to do what we're talking about, that one of those  
12 items -- or one of those potential tools is BoardDoc  
13 (sic) and how we might incorporate that into our system.  
14 And once we get that type of system, to go back and do  
15 the dockets for the prior meetings as well as the ones  
16 moving forward, and then adjust the -- or add to the  
17 prior agenda is who was the Chair and vice Chair because  
18 I think that captures the proposed actions that we would  
19 have the staff take care of.

20           So I just want to go back in and ask, does that  
21 change what we're looking at whether we need a brief  
22 summary or not? If we have that, is that -- does that  
23 suffice? Do we need a written summary of the meetings?  
24 Or does that suffice because it allows people to tie  
25 agenda items directly to documents and the video clip

1 where that was discussed?

2 Commissioner Ahmad. Oh, sorry.

3 COMMISSIONER AHMAD: I think for me that would  
4 suffice. I think it would just be redundant to put  
5 together a summary as well as having a more efficient way  
6 to reach the item on the agenda if that system existed.  
7 So I would propose -- my recommendation would be to  
8 eliminate the writing of summaries from our meetings and  
9 just leave it as that tool in which folks, including  
10 ourselves, can go back and revisit the videos.

11 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Okay. Can I get a feeling of  
12 support here?

13 VICE CHAIR KENNEDY: Commissioner Andersen?

14 COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: One quick thing. Basically,  
15 we sort of decided we're not doing the summary, right?  
16 We're just listing topics. So rather than doing the  
17 summary, just say -- we'll just have a list after the --  
18 I mean, it says -- number 5 says, write a brief summary  
19 after completion that includes these two items, but we're  
20 not really summarizing anything. We're just going to  
21 list the actions taken -- list of actions given -- who is  
22 responsible and what they are, and then there's this  
23 tool -- if it's a -- if we have access to it, and then we  
24 can reference the tool, and that's that.

25 VICE CHAIR KENNEDY: Commissioner Le Mons.

1           COMMISSIONER LE MONS: I was wondering if we're  
2 trying to move on this particular document that  
3 Commissioner Fornaciari has put forward, can we just  
4 table all number 5? Because it sounds like we're looking  
5 for a solution. And I think the question he had asked a  
6 little bit ago was what can we move forward with trying  
7 this out? I'm assuming he was referring to the various  
8 elements here and see how it goes. It seems like 5 is  
9 kind of the sticking point, and we don't really have a  
10 solution. So why don't we just take 5 off the table for  
11 right now? Like, table it for the recommendations that  
12 are put forward with the action items to staff so that we  
13 could at least make a decision as to whether or not we  
14 want to move forward with the items that we are  
15 comfortable with.

16           VICE CHAIR KENNEDY: Yeah, that -- or do the other.  
17 I don't care. I don't care.

18           CHAIR FORNACIARI: Does that sound like a reasonable  
19 approach? Kind of gives some heads up. I really want  
20 reactions. I want to know. Okay. Thank you.

21           Okay. We're going to take our lunch break at this  
22 point, and then we will take public comment, and then  
23 have our guests join us, so.

24                           (Whereupon, a recess was held)

25           CHAIR FORNACIARI: Okay. Well, welcome back to the

1 after-lunch portion of our meeting today. And as is our  
2 tradition, we are going to invite public comment --  
3 general public comment -- at this time.

4 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: In order to maximize  
5 transparency and public participation in our process, the  
6 commissioners will be taking public comment by phone.

7 To call in, dial the telephone number provided on  
8 the livestream feed. The telephone number is 877-853-  
9 5247. When prompted, enter the meeting ID number  
10 provided on the livestream feed. It is 93489457215 for  
11 this week's meeting.

12 When prompted to enter a participant ID, simply  
13 press pound. Once you have dialed in, you'll be placed  
14 in a queue from which a moderator will begin unmuting  
15 calls to submit your comments. You will also hear an  
16 automated message to press star nine. Please do this to  
17 raise your hand indicating you wish to comment.

18 When it is your turn to speak, the moderator will  
19 unmute you, and you will hear an automated message that  
20 says, the host would like you to talk, and to press star  
21 6 to speak.

22 Please make sure to mute your computer or livestream  
23 audio to prevent any feedback or distortion during your  
24 call. Once you are waiting in the queue, be alert for  
25 when it is your turn to speak. And again, please turn

1 down the livestream volume. These instructions are also  
2 located on the website.

3 The Commission is taking public comment at this  
4 time.

5 (Pause)

6 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Okay. The livestream just caught  
7 up, so we'll wait another minute or so. Oh, looks like  
8 we have a caller in the queue.

9 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Good afternoon. Caller,  
10 please state and spell your name for the record, please.

11 MS. HOWARD: Good afternoon. This is Deborah  
12 Howard, D-E-B-O-R-A-H H-O-W-A-R-D.

13 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Thank you, caller. Your  
14 time begins now.

15 MS. HOWARD: Thank you.

16 Hi, Commissioners. Good afternoon. I am Deborah  
17 Howard, and I am calling on behalf of the California  
18 Senior Advocates League. I have a couple of messages --  
19 two compliments, and one comment that actually may make  
20 your conversation slightly more challenging. I want to  
21 thank you again for stepping up, each of you, to tackle  
22 this humungous task of redistricting California. It is  
23 an enormous commitment -- personal commitment -- specific  
24 engagement, and the intensity and the seriousness with  
25 which you're approaching this is evident in every

1 conversation.

2       My second compliment is to you for the conversation  
3 that you are having just before you broke before lunch  
4 about how you're going to work together as a Commission  
5 and approach some of these issues about relationship  
6 building. This is the part where I might make your  
7 conversations more difficult, and that is because I want  
8 to frame or suggest the opportunity that you frame that  
9 conversation as a -- that relationship building is in  
10 fact the work of the Commission. It is not something  
11 that happens outside of your meetings, outside of the  
12 purview of the public.

13       And so I don't exactly know how to tell you what  
14 that looks like from this end, but at the very least, I  
15 think it looks like as you make these conversations about  
16 how you work together, that you think through that in the  
17 capacity that there's a Chair at the Commission table for  
18 the public. In this really contrived environment where  
19 we have to meet by Zoom, you have to meet for the work  
20 that you're doing, we have to participate by not being  
21 seen. We're invisible voices over the telephone at  
22 prescribed times. That, I think, can be improved.

23       I noticed that you had already posted some of your  
24 videos from previous meetings online. I think getting  
25 those online faster is a conversation that you had just

1 before you broke about having your agendas link back to  
2 the videos and being able to link to those handouts that  
3 you have. As much as that benefits you and your  
4 decision-making, that also will benefit the public, and I  
5 mean the public with a big P and the small p, because  
6 there's a whole constellation of organizations that care  
7 about this as intently as you do and have made similar  
8 commitments, and we're looking for ways to participate as  
9 well. And so I want to leave that with you. And the  
10 goal of all of that is it's just a really basic point  
11 that fair lines create fair districts and fair districts  
12 will create a responsive government, and I think that's  
13 the end goal that we all want to get to.

14 I understand the hesitation of wanting official  
15 minutes. And I know one of the comments right before you  
16 all broke was there are some people that are going to  
17 want official minutes and know exactly where on the video  
18 this is, and others are just going to want, here's this.  
19 Regardless of what most people want, I think the default  
20 position of the Commission has to be what I think  
21 Commissioner Yee was stating so articulately is we have  
22 to make this as easy as we can to the public.

23 And I think I've gone over my two minutes, and I  
24 thank you for your time and appreciate the opportunity to  
25 comment.

1 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Thank you very much. We  
2 appreciate your comments and your participation in the  
3 process.

4 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: There are currently no  
5 more callers in the queue, Chair.

6 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Okay. So it's been a few minutes  
7 after the -- let's see -- after the video caught up, so I  
8 think we will move ahead. We're about at 1:30. And I  
9 don't see Commissioner Akutagawa.

10 Commissioner Fernandez.

11 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Yes, and we're still  
12 missing a couple of other presenters. We do have Eric  
13 here.

14 Hi, Eric. Thank you for coming. Hopefully you can  
15 hear me.

16 But we've got a couple more that should be joining  
17 us, hopefully soon, and hopefully, they're not having  
18 issues.

19 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Okay. And do you know if Linda  
20 is going to be joining us, too?

21 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Yes.

22 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Or are you going to be acting as  
23 host, or is Linda?

24 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: So what we were thinking,  
25 if it's okay with you, is Linda was going to introduce

1 them all, and then when they're done, I could, like,  
2 moderate it in terms of if anybody has questions.

3 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Okay.

4 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Unless you wanted to do  
5 that in terms of, like, order and all that stuff. That's  
6 fine.

7 CHAIR FORNACIARI: No, that would be great.

8 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Okay. Oh, and she's  
9 getting -- Linda said she's getting -- just getting off a  
10 call, so she'll be with us shortly.

11 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Okay. Very good.

12 COMMISSIONER SINAY: One of the other participants  
13 was on, and then she dropped. I don't -- earlier before  
14 Mr. Harris showed up, there was another participant.

15 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Oh, okay.

16 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Eric, is Russell and Tho  
17 Vinh are still going to join us? Yes? I think so,  
18 right? Eric Harris? I don't know if he can hear us.  
19 Oh, there's Russell. Okay.

20 Can you hear me, Eric, okay?

21 MR. HARRIS: Yes, I can. Sorry.

22 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Oh, okay. And Tho Vinh's  
23 going to come, too, right?

24 MR. HARRIS: Yes.

25 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Going to join us? Okay.

1 And then we still have Rahmo and --

2 COMMISSIONER AKUTAGAWA: Tavae.

3 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Yes.

4 COMMISSIONER AKUTAGAWA: And Jeanine.

5 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Yes. Yes, and Jeanine.

6 Yeah.

7 COMMISSIONER SINAY: Hi, Jeanine.

8 MS. ERIKAT: Hi, everyone. Good afternoon.

9 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Welcome. Thank you for joining  
10 us.

11 MS. ERIKAT: Thank you for having us.

12 COMMISSIONER SINAY: We're just waiting for one more  
13 participant.

14 COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: Could I just ask which  
15 presentation happens to be going first? Or if that's too  
16 early, that's okay. Thank you.

17 COMMISSIONER AKUTAGAWA: Commissioner Andersen, I  
18 think we could go in the order that's on the agenda, so  
19 we'll go with Rahmo and Jeanine. We're waiting actually  
20 for two. We're also waiting -- we're waiting -- actually  
21 three. We're waiting for Rahmo, and then also Tavae and  
22 Tho Vinh.

23 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: I think Tho Vinh's getting  
24 on right now. There she is.

25 COMMISSIONER AKUTAGAWA: Okay. Oh, there she is.

1 Okay. Great.

2 MS. BANH: Hi.

3 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Hello.

4 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Welcome.

5 MS. BANH: Thank you. Hope I'm not late.

6 COMMISSIONER AKUTAGAWA: Nope, you are on time.

7 We're just getting everyone on.

8 (Pause)

9 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: I remember Rahmo saying  
10 that she had internet issues. I'm hoping she's not  
11 having any internet issues right now.

12 MS. ERIKAT: No, no, she's -- she went to the -- our  
13 office today so we -- we're on, like, an alternate  
14 schedule --

15 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Okay.

16 MS. ERIKAT: -- and so she should be -- she's just  
17 settling in.

18 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Okay.

19 Is that one yours, Tho Vinh? Wait.

20 MS. BANH: Whoops. Are you guys seeing my share  
21 screen?

22 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Yep.

23 COMMISSIONER AKUTAGAWA: We are.

24 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: I don't know how to use it.

25 MS. BANH: I'm not the most techie, so I'm like, let

1 me make sure this thing works.

2 COMMISSIONER AKUTAGAWA: I mean, if it's easier  
3 since you have it up, we could just go backwards, and  
4 we'll start with you.

5 MS. BANH: Yeah, if you guys wouldn't mind that,  
6 because I know we have a commitment at 3 as well.

7 COMMISSIONER AKUTAGAWA: Yes. And we'll be done  
8 before that because we have another speaker coming in at  
9 3 o'clock, so we'll be stopping at around 2:45 so we can  
10 take a break for our sign language interpreters, and so  
11 we'll be -- we will be wrapping up at 2:45 so we can take  
12 that break and then be ready --

13 MS. BANH: Okay.

14 COMMISSIONER AKUTAGAWA: -- for a speaker.

15 MS. BANH: That's great. Let me stop sharing here.  
16 All right. I know it works now. That's why I'm, like,  
17 Raul, save me, okay, if I need help.

18 COMMISSIONER AKUTAGAWA: Okay. Looks like we have  
19 Rahmo, who's just coming on, so we have almost everybody  
20 here.

21 MS. ABDI: Hello, everyone.

22 COMMISSIONER AKUTAGAWA: Hi there.

23 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: There we go.

24 COMMISSIONER AKUTAGAWA: Okay. Great. Looking  
25 good. And I did promise everybody 1:30, so we have one

1 more minute. Hopefully Tavae will be joining us right at  
2 that time. Perfect. Right on time.

3 Hi, Tavae. Thanks for joining us. You're just  
4 perfect on time. Okay.

5 Chair?

6 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Yes, welcome. And thank you all  
7 for joining us in sharing your knowledge and thoughts.  
8 We appreciate your time. And I'll turn it back over to  
9 Commissioner Akutagawa to kick things off.

10 COMMISSIONER AKUTAGAWA: All right. Thank you very  
11 much, everyone. So just for everyone's just following  
12 along, we're on agenda item number 13, the general access  
13 panel. I'm pleased to be able to introduce our esteem  
14 panelists. And just for the sake of our format, what  
15 we're going to do is we're going to ask each of the  
16 presenters to present first, and then we'll open up for  
17 Q&A, and that will be moderated by Commissioner  
18 Fernandez. Okay. So we're doing some tag-teaming here.

19 So let me first briefly introduce each of our  
20 panelists, and then I'm going to -- I'll be asking our  
21 presenters from the Partnership for the Advancement of  
22 New Americans to start with their presentation first.  
23 From PANA, as their acronym is known, we have Rahmo Abdi,  
24 who is a community organizer, and Jeanine Erikat, who is  
25 a community organizer also at the Partnership for New

1 America -- Advancement -- for the Advancement of New  
2 Americans.

3 We're then joined by Tavae Samuelu, who is the  
4 executive director of Empowering Pacific Islander  
5 Communities, or EPIC, as they are also known.

6 And then we're also joined by Tho Vinh Banh, who is  
7 special counsel, Strategic Partnerships and Community  
8 Engagement for the Disability Rights California. And  
9 we're also joined by her colleague, Eric Harris, who is  
10 special advisor for Strategic Partnerships and Community  
11 Engagement with Disability Rights California. They are  
12 also joined by Russell Rawlings, who's the statewide  
13 community organizer for the California Foundation for  
14 Independent Living Centers.

15 We're going to go ahead and we'll start with Rahmo  
16 and Jeanine with their presentation.

17 MS. ABDI: I'm on mute, sorry.

18 Okay. Thank you all. Good afternoon the  
19 Commissioners. Thank you for the opportunity for us to  
20 present to you today. My name is Rahmo Abdi, and I am  
21 community organizer with PANA, the Partnership for  
22 Advancement of New Americans. PANA, our mission is to  
23 fight and advance for full economic, social and civic  
24 inclusion of refugees in the San Diego region and  
25 throughout California and across the county -- country.

1           Our mission is to envision the world where refugees  
2 are connected global leaders building transcontinental  
3 movement, advancing meaningful freedom for all. There  
4 have been over 86,000 refugees or so in San Diego County  
5 since 1975. Recently, we had an increase of newcomers  
6 from Syria, and 2.6 of San Diegans are refugees.

7           A little bit about PANA. At PANA, we serve Arab,  
8 Middle Eastern, Muslim, South Asian, and African  
9 communities. We're also serving over thirty languages  
10 across the county -- San Diego County. The most common  
11 language are Somali, Swahili, Amharic, Tigrinya, Arabic,  
12 and Farsi.

13           So under Trump administration, we have seen the  
14 lowest number of refugees allowed in United States, and  
15 still, the largest population are coming from Africa with  
16 forty-two percent of Democratic Republic of Congo.

17           If I'm going too fast, please stop me, so. And as  
18 you can see on this chart, Swahili and African language  
19 are the fastest-growing language in United States. So as  
20 of 2019, 178,000 Black immigrant leaving California.  
21 There are over sixty languages that are spoken at home by  
22 Black immigrants in California, and Amharic has been the  
23 most spoken language by Black immigrants in California,  
24 followed by Crow, French, Swahili, Somali, Asian, and  
25 Arabic.

1 From this graphic -- this graphic shows how many  
2 Black immigrant leaving California. As you can see, the  
3 majority of East African immigrant live in Bay Area and  
4 San Diego. So despite what -- despite what most people  
5 believe, Africa is a very diverse continent with fifty-  
6 four countries, with over 2,000 languages. For example,  
7 there's over eighty languages in -- excuse me -- in  
8 Ethiopia alone. Most of people in those countries speak  
9 multiple languages. For example, I speak four  
10 language -- four African languages. I speak Somali,  
11 Amharic, Oromo, and Swahili.

12 And this language are historical oral language. For  
13 example, Somali is the -- Somali is known as an oral  
14 society and also the nation of poet. Like, in Somalia  
15 back in days when they used to communicate, they used to  
16 communicate through poetry. Like, if you seen most of  
17 Somali writings, they really -- poet is number one  
18 headline for their entertainment. So the Somali language  
19 was not adopted into Latin text until 1972, meaning  
20 Somali language was not written until 1972. And our  
21 culture is rooted through community trust.

22 So as I mentioned earlier, majority of Black  
23 immigrant in California are East African and speak in  
24 different language. There are twenty countries make up  
25 of East Africa. As you can see on the map, these

1 countries include Ethiopia, Sudan, South Sudan, Somalia,  
2 Kenya, and et cetera. The language that those  
3 communities speak are Somali, Swahili, Amharic, Tigrinya,  
4 and Nuer. Excuse me.

5       Generally, the African community -- generally, the  
6 African and immigrant refugee communities often looked  
7 because -- often overlooked because of when it comes to  
8 data, they're not marked as -- they're marked as Black  
9 and African American. For example, the city of San Diego  
10 has the second largest population of Somali people in  
11 United States -- about 20,000 people which are not  
12 represented the number you see on this slide.

13       It is widely that the Census in American community  
14 service significantly undercount the Somali-speaking  
15 population and African population. This reflects on  
16 severe under -- underdog -- undercount communities and  
17 across the state of California.

18       So I want to provide, like, some context on this  
19 next slide. I want to share these two graphs which shows  
20 that East African communities in San Diego have -- like,  
21 having a huge affordable housing crisis. We pay, like --  
22 they pay almost more than fifty percent of their income  
23 on rent. And you can see also that forty-four percent of  
24 the East African population in San Diego do not have  
25 health insurance.

1           So next slide, I want to go through our community  
2 engagement work. As you can see on this slide, in this  
3 past year, the refugee and immigrants Census have fifteen  
4 partners who are able to translate and provide support --  
5 whatever -- to help and provide and support for fifteen  
6 languages, including, like, we did flyers, videos,  
7 workshop from bankers who speak the same language as the  
8 community member.

9           So as I mentioned earlier, the language of African  
10 immigrant refugees community have been overlooked, but as  
11 PANA -- and I'm so proud to share with you guys -- PANA  
12 and (indiscernible) has been successfully advocating for  
13 the Somali interpretation to be offered over the -- over  
14 the phone at all super poll in this past election. With  
15 over 178,000 black immigrants in California, we hope to  
16 see that at statewide level.

17           Now, I'd like to go over our recommendation. We  
18 understand that you are planning on providing  
19 interpretation, which is really great. As I mentioned it  
20 earlier, specifically Somali communities are oral  
21 communities. For example, we suggest that  
22 (indiscernible) workshop in Somali. And at PANA, we find  
23 that our most successful event, like when we educate the  
24 communities and get in deeper engagement, when we provide  
25 a live interpretation or informational video with their

1 own language. So as I mentioned, like, African  
2 communities are all of this languages, so it would be  
3 more helpful to set information videos in their native  
4 language, along additional with the translated flyers.

5 And we ask the -- we ask you to partner with local-  
6 based organization on more redistricting that's similar  
7 to the Census. However, we recognize that Census was the  
8 robot asking because it was -- the community was only to  
9 complete nine surveys -- nine-question surveys. Asking  
10 the community to be engaged in the redistricting is going  
11 to be a lot more difficult because it's their first time.  
12 Many of our new American will be engaged with  
13 redistricting, and it required trusted messengers not  
14 only to educate the community, but experience organizing  
15 to get the community involved in this process.

16 So our next recommendation is to be expanding window  
17 of public comments, allowing time for translation in  
18 multiple languages. So organizations like PANA who are  
19 trusted messenger and have been doing this work, have  
20 enough time to increase translation and support  
21 communities through the public comment process.

22 And our final recommendation, that -- advance public  
23 notice and outreach materials are accessible in multiple  
24 languages, especially languages that African speaks. For  
25 example, like, if you go to a San Diego city

1 redistricting website, it's difficult to navigate. So we  
2 hope that the California Redistricting Commission will  
3 advertise their meeting beyond the website and also have  
4 the materials translated in multiple languages, as well  
5 as providing informational videos to be accessed to our  
6 community.

7       And I want to thank you all for having here -- for  
8 having me here today. PANA is happy to give you guys a  
9 resource -- to be a resource for you not only within the  
10 community, but we're also working with you. And we also  
11 work with UCSD Professor Dr. Tom Wan (ph.) on mapping the  
12 AMEMSA community, which is Arab, Muslim, Middle Eastern,  
13 South Asian, African communities. And thank you.

14       COMMISSIONER AKUTAGAWA: Wonderful. Thank you very  
15 much. That was fantastic. I so appreciate that.

16       Jeanine, I'm going to assume that you'll be helping  
17 with the Q&A portion? Okay. Great.

18       All right. Great. Thank you very much.

19       Our next presenter is Tavae Samuelu from Empowering  
20 Pacific Islander Communities.

21       And Tavae, do you want to go ahead and share screen?

22       MS. SAMUELU: Yes, let me just pull up my  
23 presentation now.

24       COMMISSIONER AKUTAGAWA: Great. Thank you very much  
25 for joining us. I'm looking forward to this.

1 MS. SAMUELU: Okay. Hi, everyone.

2 Thank you, Commissioner Akutagawa, for the  
3 invitation to speak and present to you all.

4 I want to recognize that because we're talking about  
5 redistricting that we're inevitably talking about land  
6 and space, that I am Zooming to you all from Tongva land  
7 in Long Beach. My parents originally migrated from the  
8 villages of Leulumoega in Saleimoa in Samoa and settled  
9 here just over thirty years ago. So I looked up the  
10 names of Tongva land and Tongva nation recognizing that  
11 these are not an ancient people, that they continue to  
12 work alongside us, and with the full intention and belief  
13 that we should be giving these lands back.

14 So I have here a sort of head of the presentation  
15 from Oceania to California. What I put forth here in  
16 this image, this is something that we use throughout many  
17 of our presentations in EPIC, but in particular, why it's  
18 important to me is that what you see here is what's in  
19 Tongva referred to as (foreign language spoken), and  
20 right underneath it is (foreign language spoken). So  
21 these are significant, one, because (foreign language  
22 spoken), they're often -- they're created by groups and  
23 matriarchies of Tongvan women, and on the (foreign  
24 language spoken) you can see the stories of the villages  
25 that they come from and the families who create them,

1 that there's literal DNA in these (foreign language  
2 spoken) in the storytelling.

3       And so they're given this gift, but they're also  
4 laid out as (indiscernible) when people are going to  
5 participate in Talanoa. So Talanoa means a lot of  
6 different things: to talk story, to sort of untie a  
7 knot, or to open things up. But in particular, I really  
8 like the definition from Pacific Islander scholar Inoke  
9 Hafoka, who talks about Talanoa as dialog in order to  
10 each -- reach equilibrium, so understanding that between  
11 two parties there may be an imbalance, and so that we  
12 talk and share our stories so that we can better  
13 understand each other.

14       I also offer this up because whatever I tell you is  
15 with the utmost humility and the knowledge that I share,  
16 and that it is both reflective of my own studying, the  
17 communities I come from, and my own lived expertise, but  
18 also welcome your knowledge and understand that we  
19 participate in this together. So thank you.

20       So my organization Empowering Pacific Islander  
21 Communities, EPIC, the origin stories really depend on  
22 who you ask and when you ask them. But generally  
23 speaking, we started in September of 2009, so we're about  
24 eleven years old. And as an organization, we're really  
25 focused on advancing social justice by engaging native

1 Hawaiian Pacific Islanders in culture-centered advocacy  
2 leadership development and research.

3       We want to make sure that things are culture-  
4 centered because we recognize that often in other spaces  
5 our cultures are depicted as deficit, as an impediment to  
6 our own progress as a people. We do advocacy work  
7 because we specifically want to make sure that we are  
8 building political power for our communities in order to  
9 influence policies so that decisions about us aren't made  
10 without us.

11       Our leadership development is recognizing that none  
12 of this work that we do offer community is sustainable  
13 unless we are developing the next generation of leaders,  
14 and that we do research. And you'll see some of the  
15 research that we've conducted in this presentation, but  
16 it's really about making sure that the knowledge that is  
17 disseminated about our communities is by and for us,  
18 knowing that much of what exists is actually not created  
19 by Pacific Islanders, and we see research as also part  
20 and parcel of storytelling.

21       So I love this quote; it is from one of my good  
22 friends and also a scholar/activist/poet, Terisa  
23 Siagatonu, and it says, "When people ask me where I'm  
24 from, they don't believe me when I say water." I  
25 think -- you know, and this could happen for many

1 communities of color, but in particular, for the Pacific  
2 Islander community, we're often faced with this very  
3 dehumanizing question of "what are you?"

4       And then even in responding, that there is not  
5 enough knowledge, representation of our communities to  
6 even grapple with the answer, right, so that I could say  
7 that I'm Samoan and be -- actually, the first time I told  
8 somebody I was Samoan in a college classroom, that their  
9 response was "like the cookie". So to be sitting and  
10 talking with you all is also -- much of my work is  
11 explaining who the Pacific Islander community is. So I  
12 want to offer up this quote as when Pacific islanders are  
13 faced with this notion of defining who are community is,  
14 that sometimes the definitions that we offer up are not  
15 honored or disseminated or often the ones that are  
16 propped up most often.

17       So because of the redistricting because they're  
18 talking about land in place, I also show this map. This  
19 map is because when you ask Pacific islanders where  
20 they're from this is the geography that matters most,  
21 that although we're speaking specifically to California,  
22 that this is where folks are tracing their lineage back  
23 to, and this often is the driver of many of their  
24 decisions.

25       I also offer up this map because in doing the work

1 that we do we also -- we believe and understand that  
2 reaches a social construct, and so in thinking about the  
3 social construction of native Hawaiians and Pacific  
4 islanders as a category we know it's deeply shaped by and  
5 formalized by relationships with the U.S., things like  
6 militarization, interference, and so when I'm showing you  
7 this -- oh, and colonization as well. I don't know why  
8 that was an oh and not the first thing that came out of  
9 my mouth.

10       So I'm showing you this map that you'll also see  
11 what it marks is the relationships between our home  
12 islands and the U.S., where you have folks who are U.S.  
13 citizens, right, because Hawaii is a state or because  
14 they're part of U.S. territories. You've got the Compact  
15 of Free Association, which is also known as COFA  
16 migrants, so these three island nations each have their  
17 own compacts, and what is unique about the COFA nation is  
18 that their agreements allow them to live, work, study,  
19 and travel throughout the U.S. without a visa and without  
20 any expiration.

21       However, that's done in exchange for strategic  
22 military positioning and that although -- and this is,  
23 you know, because it's -- we are still in sort of an  
24 elections hangover, I also want to note that in some of  
25 these spaces citizenship and relationship to the U.S.

1 does not formalize and mean voting or voter  
2 participation.

3       Until -- I note that, too, because I know that it  
4 also is -- goes hand in hand with conversations about  
5 redistricting. Also to say that the Compacts of Free  
6 Association are currently in renegotiation and are  
7 supposed to be renewed in 2023, so we are looking at how  
8 those compacts and those agreements could change and that  
9 what is sort of top line for many of the COFA communities  
10 that we work with are the fact that things that they were  
11 promised in the original compacts that were signed in the  
12 1980s have been stripped.

13       So healthcare or access to Medicaid was taken away  
14 in about '96 under Welfare Reform which is particularly  
15 devastating for these communities who because of nuclear  
16 testing that was done in the 1950s and '60s by the U.S.,  
17 that many of them have lands that are uninhabitable as  
18 well as generations of the highest rates of cancer. I  
19 don't want to say that casually, so I just want to have  
20 that sit.

21       I also want to note that you have American Samoa.  
22 We have U.S. nationals. American Samoa is the only U.S.  
23 land that you can be born on and not be born a citizen,  
24 that U.S. national is a unique --is a unique status in  
25 and of itself.

1           Then you have regions that have zero formal  
2 relationship with U.S. which is not to say that they  
3 don't have any interaction. You will still see many  
4 markers of American imperialism in these lands, but it is  
5 not a formal relationship.

6           These are also the islands that tend to have higher  
7 rates of undocumented when they are here in the U.S.,  
8 and then as we are talking about language access that  
9 you'll see that LEP rates tend to be higher in these  
10 communities. So yes, we'll -- I'll be referencing back  
11 to this map throughout the presentation.

12           So zeroing in on California, California has the  
13 largest NHPI population on the continent. So there, as  
14 of 2017, are about 361,000 NHPIs living in California.  
15 The top five counties are LA, San Diego, Sacramento,  
16 Alameda, and Orange County.

17           So there are different things that drive these  
18 numbers that drive sort of the gathering of folks in  
19 these places. In particular we are clear that a lot of  
20 it does have to do with military and different  
21 industries. What is nuance and should be marked -- and  
22 I'll talk more as we talk about the ethnic breakdown of  
23 those populations, is that NHPIs are a majority mixed  
24 race population, where sixty-nine percent of native  
25 Hawaiians are mixed race, and fifty-five percent of

1 Pacific islanders overall.

2       The reason that this is worth noting is that often  
3 ethnic or racial breakdowns that include the NHPI  
4 community are either aggregated with Asian and Asian-  
5 Americans or were marked as some other racial category.  
6 So I wanted to show -- these are numbers from 2010. They  
7 are featured in the demographic profile that EPIC worked  
8 on and created in partnership with Asian-Americans  
9 Advancing Justice LA, but I note these things so that you  
10 could see the population or percentage of NHPIs who are  
11 foreign born as of 2010 as well as those who are limited  
12 English proficiency. So this was in 2010.

13       Now, I also want to show the breakdown of population  
14 by ethnic group where you'll see that the largest number  
15 of NHPIs is actually native Hawaiians which is to be  
16 expected given that they are a state -- or that Hawaii is  
17 a state and so that you often see an easier pathway or  
18 migration from Hawaii as a state to the continent. I'll  
19 just sort of sit with this here.

20       It's also worth noting to be really clear that the  
21 largest population growth amongst ethnic groups was for  
22 the Fijian community. Now, what's not clarified here --  
23 so Fijian -- so there are Indo-Fijians but there's also  
24 indigenous Fijians, and so when we're talking about the  
25 Pacific islander community and when we as Epic say Fijian

1 we mean indigenous Fijians who also refer to themselves  
2 as iTaukei. Now, in being iTaukei we also see that in  
3 2010 some about twenty-three percent were marked as LEP.  
4 So we're showing some of the highest translation needs.

5 Now, this data is a little more recent. It shows  
6 that the population growth for foreign born between 2010  
7 and 2017, so you'll see a marked growth. We are  
8 expecting to update some of this data once 2020 census  
9 data has been released, but it's worth noting that you'll  
10 see that the growth for Pacific islanders overall is  
11 twelve percent.

12 Now, what I also want to note, is there is a  
13 distinction between when we talk about NHPI and when we  
14 talk about PI that NHPI as a category was created in '96  
15 with the passage of OMB 15 which is a federal -- is a  
16 federal policy out of the Office of Management and  
17 Budget. And so with OMB 15 native Hawaiian or Pacific  
18 islanders category.

19 Now, when we talk about foreign born, when we talk  
20 about immigration, we're clear that we are really marking  
21 Pacific islanders in order to honor the indigeneity of  
22 native Hawaiians. That is not to say that there aren't  
23 native Hawaiians who are foreign born. It is just  
24 recognizing that Pacific islander is a separate category  
25 from native Hawaiian sometimes, although often aggregated

1 as NHPI, but we can go into more depth about that later.

2 That's complicated.

3       So then here you'll see the foreign born population  
4 broken down by ethnic group where I've highlighted or  
5 sort of write out the NHPI ethnic groups where you'll see  
6 the largest are Samoan, Romania Chamarro, and native  
7 Hawaiian. So some of this can be explained by  
8 militarization. We also want to note that although  
9 American-Samoa and Guam are U.S. territories, sometimes  
10 in self-reporting people will still consider themselves  
11 foreign born if born on these islands.

12       Now, NHPI foreign born population growth where you  
13 see that the top states are California, Hawaii, and  
14 Washington which is to be expected. You can ask  
15 questions about that later. So coming to -- because this  
16 is the language presentation I want to make sure I hit  
17 this point that forty-five percent of foreign born  
18 Pacific islanders show limited English language  
19 proficiency. So this is as of the latest data that we  
20 have. The top translation needs in California are  
21 Marshallese, Tongan, and Samoan.

22       So this is a really important point because I think  
23 it sort of flies in the face of myths that people may  
24 have about the NHPI population; one, the notion that all  
25 NHPIs are in Hawaii, and two, that because they're in

1 Hawaii they must all speak English which as you can see  
2 is not true, that nearly half of the population is  
3 actually LEP.

4 Now, I wanted to talk about this distinction between  
5 language access and language justice. This is really  
6 important for the Pacific islander community in  
7 particular because, one, as colonized people, we're often  
8 super good and we are English language proficient but  
9 only because so many of our languages were suppressed and  
10 that when we talk about language justice in relationship  
11 to access but also more than access it's about choosing  
12 the language that people are most comfortable speaking  
13 in, the language that actually communicates, right, that  
14 when we are interpreting things or translating we don't  
15 translate words. We translate concepts.

16 So one of the key studies that we have for this was  
17 our census work. So this most recent census the Census  
18 Bureau decided not to translate any of the materials or  
19 provide any support in NHPI languages, and their argument  
20 for not doing that is that we did not meet the threshold.  
21 What became very circular about that argument is that if  
22 you don't make the materials accessible then fewer NHPI  
23 folks will be able to actually participate.

24 So Epic in partnership with Asian Americans  
25 Advancing Justice, or AAJC, that's a DC based national

1 organization, we were able to translate and provide  
2 materials in Chamorro, Chuukese, Marshallese, native  
3 Hawaiian, Palauan, Tongan, Samoan and Vakaviti. Vakaviti  
4 is the indigenous language of the iTaukei or the  
5 indigenous people of Fiji.

6       So why so many languages, why so many things? We  
7 recognize that when we are talking about or trying to  
8 figure out how or why or when to interpret or translate  
9 things is that it is a matter of education,  
10 understanding, and motivation, that when you do translate  
11 something or have something in Samoan or in sort of in  
12 language for our people, that what it communicates is  
13 that that thing is for them, that it is culturally  
14 relevant, that it's not solely about understanding  
15 something or understanding in English. It's about them  
16 understanding that it's part of our culture. It's part  
17 of our community, that seeing something in Samoan tells  
18 Samoans that it is for them. Now, in saying that I do  
19 recognize there is a priority for Tongan and Marshallese  
20 communities where there is a gap in understanding in LEP  
21 or English language proficiency.

22       And that's all I've got for you. I'm sure we'll  
23 talk more during Q and A, but here is my contact  
24 information if you need it. Thank you.

25       COMMISSIONER AKUTAGAWA: Wonderful. Thank you,

1 Tavae. All right. Right on deck; I am pleased to  
2 introduce our next presenters, Tho Vinh Banh, Eric  
3 Harris, and Russell Rawlings, who are representing  
4 Disability Rights California and the California  
5 Foundation for Independent Living Centers. So --

6 MS. BANH: All right.

7 COMMISSIONER AKUTAGAWA: So I think you're going to  
8 be showing us your slides, right?

9 MS. BANH: I am.

10 COMMISSIONER AKUTAGAWA: Okay.

11 MS. BANH: Before I do that I want to say wow, what  
12 great presentation. I learned so much. And then also to  
13 Commissioners Akutagawa and Fernandez, thank you for the  
14 opportunities for us to present today.

15 We're going to -- you know, we're going to share  
16 things very broadly because I know time is limited. So  
17 let me -- there we go, slide show. So don't mind me. I  
18 am -- okay, can everybody see that okay?

19 COMMISSIONER AKUTAGAWA: Yes.

20 MS. BANH: Excellent. Okay. So we're going to  
21 speak about basic concepts and general areas so that the  
22 commissioners have a good sense around disability, just  
23 as an introduction. So topics for today -- so I'm Tho  
24 Banh.

25 The topics that we're going to hope to cover

1 today -- so you know, we tell you what we're going to  
2 cover, and then we're going to cover it, and then we'll  
3 tell you what we covered. We're going to go through the  
4 California disability population so you get a general  
5 sense of how big we are and who we are.

6 We're also going to talk about diverse types of  
7 disabilities. I think oftentimes people think of  
8 disabilities as deaf, blind, and perhaps don't go too  
9 much further out than that. So we want to kind of share  
10 all the different examples, the different types of  
11 disabilities.

12 We're also going to talk about building a culture of  
13 access so -- and in part of that conversation we'll share  
14 about accessible materials and communications and also  
15 accessible virtual and in-person meetings as part of that  
16 dialogue.

17 Then we're going to share about working with  
18 internal/external partners, who they are, so that you'll  
19 have resources that you can lean on, contact, connect  
20 with if you have any questions. If you have certain  
21 populations you want to connect with, we want to provide  
22 those resources to you.

23 And then we're also going to leave you with some  
24 general outreach ideas and in closing, in questions and  
25 answers, all the contact information. So we're going to

1 have three speakers today for you. So it's myself, Eric,  
2 and Russell.

3 So Eric is going to kick us off first. So Eric, if  
4 you're ready, all you.

5 MR. HARRIS: Yes. Hello, everybody. My name is  
6 Eric Harris. I am with Disability Rights California, and  
7 I'm really excited to be able to present to you today.  
8 First I wanted to give an introduction and let you guys  
9 know who we are, who Disability Rights California is and  
10 what our task is for people with disabilities in the  
11 State of California.

12 Every state and territory in the country has a  
13 protection and advocacy organization or protection and  
14 advocacy agency that advocates on behalf of people with  
15 disabilities. We advocate at several different levels in  
16 terms of with attorneys. We litigate. We have advocates  
17 who push for legislation on the -- at the statewide level  
18 in the state capitol, and we also have individual  
19 advocates who communicate directly with patients at state  
20 hospitals and in other -- in regional centers as well.

21 We have 300 staff members and about a hundred  
22 attorneys total, and we are located in different offices  
23 throughout the state. So we're a pretty big agency,  
24 pretty big nonprofit organization, and we are known and  
25 recognized as the largest disability rights organization

1 in the world. We have, as I said, offices throughout the  
2 state from Southern California and San Diego, Los  
3 Angeles, all the way up through the Central Valley,  
4 through the Bay Area, Oakland, as well as in Sacramento.

5 One thing that I really -- and Tho mentioned it, and  
6 I really wanted to -- and you'll see kind of throughout  
7 our presentation the California disability population is  
8 very diverse, and it is very expansive. It is difficult  
9 to get an exact number, and we'll talk a little bit about  
10 that later because people with disabilities do not  
11 necessarily have to disclose if they choose not to  
12 disclose that they have a disability.

13 So one of the things that Disability Rights  
14 California has recognized as well as other disability  
15 rights organizations throughout the country is that  
16 people with disabilities, the numbers can range. There  
17 have been numbers given by the American Community Survey  
18 which is a well-recognized organization, and they've  
19 given numbers as far as people with disabilities in the  
20 State of California being somewhere around ten percent of  
21 the state's population, and that would be about four  
22 million people because, of course, the State of  
23 California has forty million people.

24 On the other hand, the Center for Disease Control  
25 and Prevention, the CDC, has given a much higher number,

1 a number closer to twenty-five percent of the state's  
2 population, which would, of course, be closer to around  
3 ten million people. So as you can see, the range is  
4 pretty big, and most of us because disability -- because  
5 there are so many different types of disabilities, we as  
6 advocates and -- disability rights advocates believe  
7 that the number is probably even higher just because, as  
8 I said earlier, many people might not disclose. Many  
9 people might not have been diagnosed with their  
10 disability at an early age, so there are a lot of  
11 different factors.

12       And just to give you a brief list of disabilities  
13 that people have, of course you have the sensory  
14 disabilities like being deaf and blind, but you also  
15 have, you know, mental health disabilities. You have  
16 learning disabilities, and just a wide range, mobility  
17 disabilities. I'm a wheelchair user. I was born with a  
18 dislocated hip, and I have nerve damage in my left leg,  
19 my right foot, my right ankle, so I use a wheelchair.  
20 There are different types, of course, mobility  
21 disabilities, spinal cord injuries, people who have  
22 amputations, and all the different ranges of mobility  
23 disabilities, and that's just lower limb.

24       Of course you have folks who have, you know, other  
25 forms of mobility disabilities, other forms of limb

1 impairments or disabilities. Developmental disabilities  
2 is another category. Traumatic brain injury is an  
3 interesting one because it is included as far as a  
4 physical disability, but it can also impact a person's  
5 cognitive response, and we talk about it all the time,  
6 and I'm sure we'll talk about it later in our  
7 presentation, but most people with disabilities actually  
8 have multiple disabilities.

9       People often do not just have one disability, but  
10 they develop more as they age, and it's especially  
11 true -- and I -- we can all speak to this. We all  
12 recognize this if we have older family members or as we  
13 age, developing more and more disabilities as we age,  
14 whether it's hearing loss or vision loss and other forms  
15 of disability. And it's important to recognize that  
16 these forms of disabilities can impact people in a lot of  
17 different ways.

18       MS. BANH: All right. Thank you, Eric. So I'm  
19 going to then speak a little bit about culture --  
20 building a culture of access. So as the prior speaker,  
21 Tavae, she spoke about language justice, so in some ways  
22 this is about disability justice, right.

23       So we don't -- you know, we don't want it just be a  
24 means of accommodating -- a reasonable accommodations  
25 which is -- you know, you follow the law when you do

1 that, but we want -- we want the commissioners and we  
2 want this Commission to go beyond that to think about  
3 including people with disabilities because we are such a  
4 big part of the California population. By not including  
5 people with disabilities you're leaving a big group of  
6 folks out -- out of the process.

7       So I appreciate the commissioners' interest in being  
8 transparent, interest in reaching all these diverse  
9 communities, inviting all these different diverse  
10 communities to come speak. So for the disability  
11 community, you know, I think what's going to be important  
12 is that understanding is not monolithic. As Eric was  
13 sharing, it's just a really broad, broad community.

14       So I think inquiring about access needs is going to  
15 be important, but each person -- each communities may  
16 have different needs, so there's not an understanding or  
17 thinking that everybody needs the same thing. I think  
18 what else is going to be really important to build this  
19 culture of access for people with disabilities is  
20 identifying dedicated staff for access provisions,  
21 identifying a dedicated staff that would know how to --  
22 you know, would know of the ins and outs of the  
23 technologies, would be the one that you would designate  
24 as a contact person if individuals with disabilities or  
25 other communities have issues trying to get in or trying

1 to speak or needing more time to comment or  
2 accommodations that might be needed. So I think  
3 dedicating a staffer for that process is going to be very  
4 helpful.

5 I think, of course, the Commission is going to have  
6 an attorney that you guys will consult with and to ensure  
7 that the attorney is aware of ADA, is aware of Section  
8 504, is aware of civil rights -- the California  
9 Government Code of Section 11135, the Unruh Civil Rights  
10 Act, Disabled Person's Act, so there's diverse federal  
11 and state laws that would apply to access. So we want to  
12 make sure the Commission is at least aware of that,  
13 touching on that, and ensure that the attorneys that you  
14 consult with is aware of that and would, you know,  
15 provide you with cogent advice around how to ensure to  
16 include people with disabilities in a way that's not  
17 discriminatory.

18 And then of course we want to let you know that  
19 there are lots of disability agency -- lots of  
20 disability-oriented advocacy groups and organizations  
21 that are -- that are -- have deep ties with different  
22 disability communities and would be more than -- more  
23 than willing and available to provide assistance and  
24 thoughts and ideas about how to reach certain communities  
25 and thoughts and ideas about insuring that these types of

1 meetings and these types of processes are inviting and  
2 inclusive.

3       So with that I can speak about accessible materials  
4 and communications. So you'll hear some of this echo  
5 other organizations that share the same. Plain language,  
6 you know, different -- Asian American Advance of Justice  
7 I'm sure shares this dynamic. So does Malaya and the  
8 Latino communities. So plain language is going to come  
9 up over and over again and how it helps -- and how it's  
10 more accessible for people with disabilities. We have  
11 individuals with intellectual disabilities, individuals  
12 with mental health disabilities, individuals with  
13 prominent disabilities where I think just -- and just I  
14 think all of us generally, the American public in  
15 general. I think the reading level is, like, I think 6th  
16 to 9th grade, right?

17       So I think it's helpful for materials that are  
18 printed, spoken materials, any materials that you put out  
19 have it start be plain language. Have it start, be plain  
20 language before you translate it. Have it start, be  
21 plain language before you create other -- other formats  
22 for them so that you're starting at a good point already.

23       Accessible Chairs and communication also includes  
24 American Sign Language and captioning, and I know what I  
25 provided -- the input last time when I came on and spoke

1 very briefly, American Sign Language is what -- is the  
2 sign language that is used in the U.S., but there are  
3 also essentially Mexican Sign Language, Chinese Sign  
4 Language, Japanese Sign Language, any number of countries  
5 is going to have their own sign language. So we forget  
6 about those intersections. So I -- you know, I really  
7 appreciate -- I'm going to mispronounce her but Ramal  
8 (ph.) and Kavahi (ph.) because they speak on all of these  
9 diverse intersectional communities that may not be  
10 thought about. So in that vein, ASL is in that umbrella.

11       And in captioning, there's closed captioning and  
12 open captioning, so open captioning is you see that text  
13 underneath that runs across and that everybody can see  
14 whether they choose it or not, and closed captionings are  
15 when individuals can choose, click on CC and then they  
16 alone see it on their screen, not everyone else. So I  
17 want to be mindful -- aware of that so that could be more  
18 subsequent -- those who are deaf and hard of hearing.  
19 Acceptable document formats, so just be mindful of  
20 certain formats are more accessible than others.

21       So just plainly speaking today Word format tends to  
22 be more accessible. PDF, if there's a screen meter  
23 accessible also is okay. And there's these things called  
24 RTFs, text documents that are very simple that are easier  
25 to read when screen via technologies that helps people

1 who are blind or are low vision.

2       We would advise, you know, generally get printed  
3 materials that have it in fourteen point and Aerial is a  
4 type of font that is a sans-serif, so serif's all those  
5 squiggly things that goes on top of letters, on the side  
6 of letters, so sans-serif just means without all those  
7 squiggly things, so it's easier to see for those who have  
8 visual impairments who are blind or low vision. The  
9 screen would be easier, have easier opportunities to read  
10 it and also those who are visually impaired can actually  
11 read it more easily.

12       And then, you know, font materials as you can see, I  
13 tend to use pretty large font, so printed -- presentation  
14 materials we would recommend them to be twenty font so  
15 that folks with visual impairments can see it more  
16 readily. And not to forget, there -- there are  
17 individuals asking for other -- Braille is another way of  
18 providing informations for those who are blind, so just  
19 to be mindful of these -- of these different types of  
20 ways to ensure that different communities with  
21 disabilities can feel welcome and feel -- they think --  
22 they're invited to this conversation and to these  
23 meetings.

24       In the descriptions -- so images shows up, just  
25 ensure that there's text of it so it describes it -- what

1 the image shows up so that -- because sometimes screen  
2 viewers won't read images. And then auto description is  
3 a person that speaks over a video that's being shown. Of  
4 course individuals who are deaf are not going to be able  
5 to hear it, right? I'm sorry, individuals who are blind  
6 are not going to be able to -- see, I get all my  
7 disabilities -- individuals who are deaf are not going to  
8 be able to hear it, right? Individuals who are blind may  
9 not be able to see it.

10 So if anything you have visual you want to -- you  
11 also want to describe it auditorily and anything you have  
12 in audio you want to also ensure that there's visual  
13 representation so that different communities can actually  
14 access all.

15 And then the clear, slow communications is just  
16 being mindful that -- like today we had an ASL  
17 interpreter, so to make sure that we speak slowly enough  
18 and clearly enough so that the interpreters can interpret  
19 in time and the captioners can caption in time, and also  
20 to be mindful to not speak over one another, so it's one  
21 speaker at a time so that the captioners and the  
22 interpreters would know -- so that the folks who are  
23 following along could actually know who is speaking. So  
24 that's assessable materials and communication.

25 So just to break it -- to break it down a little

1 further, I know that the Commission is going to have a  
2 lot of -- because of the -- because of where we are now  
3 with COVID-19, you're -- you'll likely find yourself  
4 having virtual meetings like -- like now rather than in-  
5 person meetings. So with that, we just want you to be  
6 mindful of if folks are signing on to speak or signing on  
7 to provide comments to really make the registration  
8 process of get on these meetings and to provide those  
9 comments to be as simple as possible. Maybe have it  
10 tested it out, but ensure their simplicity so that more  
11 people can access them.

12 Accessible platform. I mean, there's no platform  
13 that's accessible in all realm and arena, but we find  
14 that Zoom generally is relatively more accessible than  
15 other web platforms. We spoke about ASL and captioning  
16 obviously to be provided so that folks with different  
17 disabilities can access it.

18 And we would recommend that when you have these  
19 meetings and you have and -- there are individuals with  
20 disabilities who are attending really to take a little  
21 bit of time to explain all the accessible features. So  
22 on the bottom, if you want closed captioning, please  
23 click on the CC. If you're using ASL your -- and your --  
24 and so please pin the ASL interpreter so that you can see  
25 the ASL interpreter more -- bigger than -- than other

1 speakers. Provide them with copies of shortcuts to that  
2 if they aren't using a mouse and they using the keys,  
3 they can shortcut to go to comments, go to chat, go to a  
4 different functions.

5 Meeting agenda and time is just so that folks have  
6 a -- a chance to know where the breaks are and know  
7 when -- when they -- they can provide comments and so  
8 forth, if they're not able to sit for a long period of  
9 time or -- or their disability prevents them from being  
10 in one space for a long period of time.

11 And then plain language recovery rating, that  
12 includes not using jargon, if possible, not using  
13 acronyms as possible. So if we talk about describing  
14 visual content -- and then the thing that I want to  
15 really pay some attention to -- and I think this also is  
16 brought up by other -- other groups is the phone-in  
17 options.

18 So just like with other populations, people with  
19 disabilities, there may be some who may not have Wi-Fi.  
20 There may be individuals who may not be able to -- may --  
21 may not be able to pay for Wi-Fi, may not have computers,  
22 may not have access. So a phone-in option may be their  
23 only means to get in to provide comments. So please to  
24 always have that option available. And again stressing  
25 the staff available to access support when it's needed.

1           And then the in-person meeting. So I'll -- I'll  
2 just share some of the pieces that might be different  
3 than the virtual meetings. So really make sure before  
4 you pick a location to ensure that they're not only ADA  
5 accessible but really it accommodates for folks who are  
6 or you're hoping to intend to come, right? So you want  
7 to make sure that people with disabilities --  
8 disabilities still welcome. So making sure there are  
9 navigational spaces within the structure is -- is clear,  
10 that wheelchair folks who uses wheelchair, folks who uses  
11 scooters are able to navigate through all the different  
12 places, including the bathrooms, the entrance, the  
13 hallway and -- and so forth.

14           Being really mindful of parking, ensuring that there  
15 is accessible parking so that those who use accessible  
16 cars, accessible vans, and who need accessible parking  
17 spots have them available.

18           Public transportation. So some individuals with  
19 disabilities would need to use public transportation. So  
20 finding locations that are -- that are close to public  
21 transportation would help encourage more folks to be able  
22 to come.

23           Same with the meeting agenda. The thing that might  
24 be different also is developing process to request to  
25 speaks. So if there are of individuals who are attending

1 the meeting, please explain how they would engage to  
2 provide comments, to really explain that. And in -- also  
3 in-person meetings. Not here, but ensuring that there's  
4 microphones, microphones for everybody so that people who  
5 are hard of hearing can -- can hear.

6 I know oftentimes we go to meetings and we're like,  
7 well, I speak loud enough, I don't need a microphone. We  
8 would really discourage that because you may start loud,  
9 but then you often drift and get softer and then people  
10 can't hear. So we really would recommend there's a -- a  
11 means of a microphone for everyone who's going to be  
12 speaking.

13 So there it is. Assistive listening devices. So  
14 people who are hard of hearing having devices that will  
15 help them amplify sound, amplify the speakers, and help  
16 them hear better.

17 The describing visual content we mentioned. So  
18 that's all the same. So there's some things that are  
19 shared between virtual and in-person meetings. But  
20 overall, all these elements will help create spaces for  
21 people with disabilities to feel invited, for people with  
22 disabilities to feel -- to feel like they can engage as  
23 everyone else.

24 So -- so I -- we want to leave you with all of those  
25 specific ideas. I mean, there's more we can go in-depth

1 and there's a lot of resources. But with at least that,  
2 so that you can start thinking about accessible spaces.  
3 With that, I'm going to turn it over to Russell, who's  
4 going to speak about working with internal/external  
5 partners and outreach.

6 Russell.

7 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: And I --

8 MR. RAWLINGS: Thanks.

9 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: -- just wanted to -- I'm  
10 sorry to interrupt. I just want to be conscious of how  
11 much time we have left. And we want to make sure that we  
12 also give time for Q&A, too.

13 MR. RAWLINGS: Right. Thanks, (indiscernible).

14 My name's Russell Rawlings. I am the statewide  
15 community organizer at California Foundation for  
16 Independent Living Centers. I am a white male with  
17 glasses, a mustache, and brown hair. I'm wearing a green  
18 shirt. And I have cerebral palsy and use a power  
19 wheelchair.

20 Here we have a slide discussing our partners, some  
21 great resources. First of all, ourselves, Disability  
22 Rights California and California Foundation for  
23 Independent Living Centers.

24 Just very briefly, California Foundation for  
25 Independent Living Centers is a network organization of

1 California's twenty-eight independent living centers.  
2 Independent living centers are not places where you live.  
3 They are service organizations that provide information  
4 and resources to California's disability population to  
5 help them live complete and fully integrated lives in the  
6 community.

7       And I'm already seeing all of the great work that  
8 the other organizations are doing, and really eager to  
9 partner with all of you, because as we said at the  
10 beginning, people with disabilities are truly  
11 intersectional and part of every community.

12       Next slide, please.

13       Here's two other really helpful links that we  
14 believe will be really helpful to commissioners. First  
15 of all, there is a list of disability organizations that  
16 we worked with through -- the through our census work.  
17 CFILC and DREDF were partners in the California Complete  
18 Count Committee state level and did a lot of really great  
19 census work. So some of your organizations may have seen  
20 some of the work that we did with the census.

21       And the second link here is Disability Access  
22 Services, which is a program of the Department of  
23 Rehabilitation. The Department of Rehabilitation is a  
24 great resource. This disability access services, if you  
25 have any like how do I make this particular document

1 accessible or I have a question about accessibility.  
2 They're a really great partner because they're available  
3 to you for free and can consult with you.

4       Of course, here at CFILC, we also do a lot of work  
5 in the community and have done a lot of training on Zoom  
6 on how to make meetings more accessible. And I'm really  
7 happy to see that there is an ASL interpreter here. But  
8 sometimes there's a little bit more consideration that  
9 has to go into making that fully accessible and making  
10 sure that the interpreter is always visible.

11       Next slide, please.

12       Couple of other additional outreach ideas. We  
13 recommend that you use disability resources to identify  
14 regional disability organizations. And again, here at  
15 CFILC, because we have a network of twenty-eight  
16 independent living centers in California, there is  
17 definitely one in every region of the state. In fact, an  
18 independent living center serves every county in  
19 California. So please use us as a resource to find local  
20 information and local connections to the disability  
21 community.

22       Also we recommend consulting with Disability  
23 Partners to develop outreach for virtual and in-person  
24 meetings and workshops. And here is a link that will  
25 help you find a independent living center in your

1 community. Can actually use by city, state -- city,  
2 county, or ZIP code.

3 And then finally, use social media. We often create  
4 hashtags. We were just using the Disability Counts 2020  
5 hashtag quite widely and also using our partner hashtags,  
6 right? So it's important that we all look to amplify our  
7 own messages and understand that all of the work that we  
8 do touches every community.

9 Next slide, please.

10 And then finally, we're going to move on to Q&A.  
11 And thank you so much for allowing us this opportunity to  
12 present to all of you.

13 MS. BANH: Great. Thank you so much to everybody  
14 who presented.

15 I'm going to go ahead and turn this over to  
16 Commissioner Fernandez.

17 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Yeah. So if you want to  
18 echo the same -- very good information for all of us.  
19 And so I'm going to open it up to my fellow  
20 commissioners, if anyone has questions?

21 Commissioner Kennedy.

22 VICE CHAIR KENNEDY: Thank you. I've been on the  
23 Riverside County Voting Accessibility Advisory Committee  
24 or advising them for the last five years. But I do have  
25 a couple of questions. One is, there was a mention of

1 screen readers, and I understand the basic concept of  
2 screen readers. Is it useful for us to still provide  
3 audio files on our site? Or are we okay just relying on  
4 people who need materials in audio format using their own  
5 screen reader technology? So that's question 1.

6 Second is, I'm -- I'm used to working overseas where  
7 Braille literacy tends to be very low. So we can -- we  
8 can invest in Braille materials but it'd be -- it'd be  
9 good to have an idea of how high the Braille literacy  
10 level is.

11 And third, I think we would really appreciate your  
12 advice on where we can obtain plain language services. I  
13 reached out to one organization in the state. I haven't  
14 gotten an answer yet on who they would advise. But we  
15 can make something as simple as we think it can be. But  
16 I think it's good for us to send it out, particularly  
17 some of our core public information resources. I really  
18 want to -- to send them out to someone who specializes in  
19 putting them in simple English or plain reading, those  
20 sorts of formats before we start getting into the  
21 translation part of it. So thanks.

22 MR. RAWLINGS: Thank you, Commissioner. I'll just  
23 quickly recommend that The State Council on Developmental  
24 Disabilities is a great place to go for assistance with  
25 plain language. And I'm happy to provide a direct

1 contact with someone that I know would be happy to -- to  
2 talk about plain language. Thank you for thinking of  
3 plain language on the front end.

4 I think that that highlights one of the things  
5 that's really common in the disability community is we --  
6 we like to say disability is not a condiment that you put  
7 on at the very end of a thought. It's the thing that you  
8 start with at the very beginning. Accessibility is  
9 really integral to a whole planning process.

10 And so thank you for thinking about how to structure  
11 communication before thinking about making sure that all  
12 of the types of communication are available.

13 MS. BANH: Like to ad is we may not know the answer  
14 to everything, but we know where to go to get the answers  
15 for almost anything. So we want to be that resource for  
16 you.

17 So in terms of the screen reader, at least have  
18 materials that are in Word or that are screen reader  
19 accessible. So at least there's that option in the -- in  
20 the things that are in PDFs and things that may not be  
21 accessible on screen reader.

22 And I think also, I think that's what designating a  
23 person is going to be so important so that if they're --  
24 because everybody -- the needs may be different, right?  
25 So that there's a person that has those needs that

1 there's someone that they can go to and say, hey, this is  
2 my need. And then -- and then their -- their needs can  
3 be met, right? So I think -- I think thinking ahead and  
4 having that person so that -- because you can't think the  
5 universe of things that can come up, right? I think it's  
6 great that we're having this conversation initially,  
7 right? But I think having that person is going to be  
8 helpful.

9       And then Braille, same thing with Braille.  
10 There's -- at least knowing that there's some individuals  
11 that may need the materials in Braille, right? And being  
12 cognizant of it so that if there's a request for it,  
13 there's a means that the Commission has already thought of  
14 a means to provide it to them in that format.

15       So I think thinking ahead of all these things and  
16 these concepts and maybe identify a good person that can  
17 learn it up or that we can then partner with or that you  
18 as a Commission think through all these aspects so that  
19 we can help out.

20       But the resources -- Commissioner Kennedy, the  
21 resources that's on the list that we shared, is broken  
22 down by all the different disability groups, the deaf and  
23 hard of hearing communities, the blind committees, the  
24 intellectual developmental disabilities communities. So  
25 you'll find a wealth of organizations that can then

1 provide even more in-depth information and answers and  
2 responses to -- to the questions that the Commission may  
3 have. But we are -- we're there to help you all along  
4 the way.

5 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Thank you.

6 Commissioner Sinay?

7 COMMISSIONER SINAY: I think when it comes to  
8 accessibility, we're -- we've started there and we want  
9 to make everything as accessible as possible. And I  
10 really appreciate how you've all defined accessibility,  
11 be it cultural language, are we an oral society or a  
12 visual, all those things are really critical.

13 And I appreciate what Ms. Banh just said. We can't  
14 meet everybody's everything. And so I wanted to check if  
15 I heard correctly and here from Ms. Abdi and -- there you  
16 are, Tavae, sorry, if it's not necessarily that we have  
17 everything at our fingertips right now completely  
18 accessible, but that we are able to make it accessible if  
19 it is asked of us.

20 Now, having said that, there is certain languages  
21 and things that we should be doing, but with all the  
22 different -- well, anyway, I just wanted to see if I  
23 heard that correctly. I see some heads nodding, but I'd  
24 love to get some input.

25 MS. BANH: EPIC and PANA want to share thoughts

1 first? And I can follow. I can follow.

2 MS. ERIKAT: Yeah, I can -- I can jump in. My  
3 name's Jeanine. I'm a community organizer at PANA. I've  
4 been working with Rahmo this presentation. Yeah, so  
5 you're right. I mean, we mentioned specifically at PANA  
6 the diversity in the African communities and cultures and  
7 the variety in languages. We did emphasize that Amharic  
8 is the most spoken language throughout California.

9 But I think for us at PANA, what's really important,  
10 and I think others can speak on this, is for the  
11 Commission to work with these local hubs of like ethnic-  
12 based organizations who have been doing this work, right?  
13 Like at PANA for our census outreach, which we partnered  
14 with as part of the county 2020, the statewide campaign,  
15 we were able to provide census materials in fifteen  
16 languages. That includes Amharic, Oromo, Somali,  
17 Swahili, Arabic, Farsi, Kurdish, Nuer, Haitian, like all  
18 these languages.

19 So we understand that the state just didn't  
20 necessarily have the capacity to do all of that. And  
21 that's why we ask that you partner with us and we can  
22 provide you with resources. Because I mean, as Tavae  
23 shared, like when it's not in language, you're telling  
24 those communities they don't matter, right?

25 So we really ask that you are -- that if it's not

1 something you can work on, you can provide. I mean,  
2 beside the languages where we have high, high numbers  
3 like Amharic and Somali, that you work with us to be able  
4 to fill that gap.

5 And like Rahmo mentioned, like for the African  
6 community specifically and amongst the community, it is a  
7 trusted messenger way, right? So it is that connection  
8 also. Like we're going to have to go in and do that work  
9 regardless to fill in the gaps in education with cultural  
10 nuance. And I'll cut my time short so others can jump in  
11 because I could go on, I mean, we all could, that's why  
12 we're here today. So thank you for bringing that up.

13 COMMISSIONER SINAY: Thank you.

14 MS. SAMUELU: Good. Agreed with all of the points  
15 that were made. And I think there's another piece of  
16 what I think I heard you say was like, if it's asked for,  
17 then you can do it. And that's a little bit --

18 COMMISSIONER SINAY: Yeah.

19 MS. SAMUELU: -- that puts a lot of onus on me as an  
20 organization to go ask you for it, but also to -- and --  
21 and from my understanding of what PANA did, which is  
22 amazing work on the census, was also that it was heavily  
23 reliant on volunteers.

24 And correct me if this is wrong, so I understand  
25 that you all may not have the capacity, but maybe you

1 have the resources for us to go and make those  
2 connections. Because I also don't expect you to know who  
3 are the Samoan and Tongan and Marshallese translators in  
4 our community.

5       Also worth noting is that the Pacific Islander  
6 community doesn't really have ethnic enclaves. We're  
7 not -- we're a highly dispersed community, right? That  
8 although those numbers are the highest in L.A. County,  
9 L.A. County is 500 square miles. So that's a huge space  
10 that you can -- that we're sort of sprawled across. And  
11 so that when there's a conversation about redistricting,  
12 that there's the notion of like this is where this  
13 community lives, that we are clear that when we want to  
14 reach a community that like this is where this community  
15 worships and how faith-based communities and those  
16 networks are often the cultural institutions that we have  
17 to turn to in order to reach as many people in one --  
18 like efficiently, for lack of better terms.

19       There's also this piece, too, where, like everything  
20 that we did as written material, we also had to do a  
21 video for or a PSA because we can't assume what the  
22 literacy level is in those communities. That just  
23 because you can't read or understand English doesn't mean  
24 that you can read and write in your native language. And  
25 so that that pairing was also to make sure that in

1 addition to plain language, that you weren't making any  
2 assumptions about how people consume their information.

3       And then echoing the trusted messengers piece. But  
4 in knowing too, like, this is the statewide redistricting  
5 commission, that the languages that would be needed for  
6 different regions varies, right? So I say we prioritize  
7 Tongan, Samoan, and Marshallese, but that's also because  
8 of L.A. County that if I'm looking at Sonoma and  
9 Sacramento where the largest populations are Fijian that  
10 I would have prioritized (indiscernible). If I'm mostly  
11 in the Bay Area, I prioritize Tongan.

12       And so that's the other nuance that you actually may  
13 not even have data sources that show you that, that those  
14 are things that we know because we're on the ground and  
15 in the community.

16       COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Is this the -- that's  
17 interesting that you bring that up because Commissioner  
18 Akutagawa and I were talking about that yesterday because  
19 we were reviewing various reports and it actually does  
20 show -- because we're going to come up with a  
21 recommendation and our recommendation will vary on what  
22 area we're in terms of what language we need.

23       Because it was very apparent that -- I think it was  
24 Armenian was very heavy in the Los Angeles area. But  
25 throughout the rest of the state it wasn't. So maybe we

1 just need it for that area. So I really appreciate you  
2 sharing with us and -- and kind of just reinforcing that  
3 information. So thank you.

4 Do you have any other question?

5 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: I -- I --

6 MS. BANH: I mean (indiscernible, simultaneous  
7 speech)-- if I could --

8 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: -- I'm sorry --

9 MS. BANH: -- respond to the disability --

10 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: -- respond?

11 MS. BANH: Yeah, no worries. So for Commissioner  
12 Sinay, I think that can -- that -- it -- we have to be  
13 careful with that also because if you're waiting for  
14 someone to say, I need the meeting space -- I need the  
15 meeting space to be accessible, then you're in violation  
16 of the law because really when you're picking out the  
17 space -- so that -- that can only -- I mean, that can  
18 work within certain context.

19 And also you may not know who's going to call in.  
20 So having ASL interpreter, for example. And so I think  
21 it's broadly thinking about language justice, disability  
22 justice in that mind frame. and we're so glad we're here  
23 today so we can share our thoughts.

24 And you may not know what you don't know. Just so  
25 you can start thinking about all these different

1 populations so that we can share with you all the  
2 different ways that could create a more inviting, more  
3 inclusive space for -- for Californians.

4 Commissioner Fernandez.

5 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Thank you.

6 Commissioner Sadhwani. And then Sinay.

7 COMMISSIONER SADHWANI: Oh, did Commissioner Sinay  
8 just have a follow up? Oh, somebody said that. Okay.

9 So mine is to some extent a follow up of the  
10 previous question.

11 But first, I just want to say thank you so much to  
12 all of the speakers who came today. I really appreciate  
13 you all being here and sharing all of this expertise.  
14 And it definitely gives us a lot to think about in terms  
15 of how to really create this access of culture. And I  
16 kind of love that terminology because it covers so many  
17 different kinds of access that we want to ensure.

18 And I definitely love the idea of having a dedicated  
19 staff person whose kind of the point person for access  
20 issues.

21 On the piece around working with you all and other  
22 organizations also in terms of our outreach, this is  
23 actually more of a comment/question. I think one of my  
24 concerns is that we're on a very tight timeline. And so  
25 I wonder I -- and I guess this -- is is a question, how

1 nimble are your organizations to be able to kind of turn  
2 around some of our requests?

3 I think as we move forward, things are going to  
4 start moving very quickly on our side. That's just the  
5 nature of our timelines, I think. And I mean, a typical  
6 RFP process might last a couple months. There's time to  
7 respond.

8 And I think that we do have subcommittees and  
9 definitely looking at how can we get resources to  
10 partners on the ground to help us with these kinds of  
11 outreach components. So it's definitely something we  
12 want to do. But I think that the turnaround time is  
13 going to be fairly fast and quick. And so as a question  
14 or comment, how able will many of your organizations  
15 be -- to what extent will your organizations be able to  
16 kind of work on those kind of tight timelines that we  
17 very well might end up having?

18 MR. RAWLINGS: Oh, I was just going to quickly say  
19 that I think that's why building the relationships is so  
20 necessary. And Tavae really said something that's really  
21 important to our community also is the concept of nothing  
22 about us without us.

23 There's really I think an importance that -- that  
24 the kind of a mantle that the Commission has to make  
25 sure that everyone is included in as many spaces and as

1 many rooms as possible.

2       And I would even maybe look at, for example, the  
3 Secretary of State's office has really done some  
4 innovative work around voter education. And in doing so,  
5 they developed community-based voter accessibility  
6 advisory commissions and also language accessibility  
7 advisory commissions. And both of those exist to help  
8 the county registrars and elections offices produce  
9 culturally relevant information. And they're really  
10 highly effective bodies because they get to review every  
11 piece of communication that the county elections office  
12 puts together and think about strategically their own  
13 communities and how to reach them.

14       I understand what you're saying. And yes, it would  
15 be very difficult if we just became, I think, seen as  
16 dumping grounds for access. And I'm sure our partners  
17 that presented in front of us would also be different --  
18 it would be difficult if we were seen as just translation  
19 services, which we don't want to be.

20       So I think maybe the answer to your question is  
21 build relationships now early, make sure that you're  
22 inviting those partners and us and others as it's  
23 appropriate. I would really, again, lean on the  
24 Disability Access Services at Department of  
25 Rehabilitation, maybe identify someone that could serve

1 as a partner to you all. But those are my  
2 recommendations.

3 MS. BANH: I forgot to share that I'm a governor-  
4 appointee -- appointee on the California Complete Census  
5 2020 as well. And I would say, oh, my gosh, do not start  
6 anything from scratch, right? Like reserve your  
7 resources because they got a whole structure. A lot of  
8 the -- a lot of us have worked on the census. So there's  
9 a whole structure that we just got built that we built up  
10 with the committee that you can tap into and find out  
11 from them how certain things were done, which communities  
12 they reached out to, what materials they may have  
13 already, who did they consult to get the materials. So  
14 don't start anything from scratch.

15 A lot of what you do has -- very similarly structure  
16 has been done by (audio interference) --

17 MS. ERIKAT: Yeah. If I could add one thing really  
18 quick, I think what Russell and Thou really like to  
19 really uplift what they said not to reinvent the wheel.  
20 But also just adding that piece of funding, right? Like  
21 our organizations do have limited -- like there is a  
22 capacity thing, but if we able to have funding -- and  
23 that's why I think why our census work was so great is we  
24 were able to partner with fifteen other organizations and  
25 have PANA lead this refugee and immigrant census hub.

1           And we also know that we're still need to do  
2 education, right? And I think the important part is,  
3 yes, there's tight deadlines, of course, and a lot of  
4 things are changing, are moving. But our people are  
5 living in these -- like we're going to be most impacted  
6 by the redrawing of these state and local lines. So we  
7 don't want to be left out. That's why we're here talking  
8 today. We don't think we should be left out. But  
9 funding is a crucial piece.

10           And to build those relationships. I think now's a  
11 good start. We have until January before it really picks  
12 up. So if we could keep these channels of communication  
13 open, I think that would be a great way to go too.

14           COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Thank you.

15           And I have Commissioner Sinay, but Chair Fornaciari,  
16 I think we're at the -- are we at the hour and a half  
17 mark for a break?

18           CHAIR FORNACIARI: Yes, we are. We don't have a  
19 speaker coming in at 3. We had to reschedule that. So  
20 if our speakers are willing, we could come back and  
21 continue this conversation. But we are at a time for a  
22 required fifteen-minute break.

23           COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Yes. I'm not sure if  
24 they're able to sit. I think (indiscernible) And Eric  
25 and Russell had another meeting. But I'm also not sure

1 if Rahmo and Tavae and Jeanine can stay until about --  
2 we'll probably resume a little after 3?

3 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Is it possible to keep going  
4 longer? Are -- are we -- are we ---

5 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: I think we're required  
6 because of the ASL interpreter.

7 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Yeah. We're required to take  
8 a -- a fifteen-minute break every hour and a half.

9 But -- but again, the speaker -- the -- the planned  
10 speaker for 3:00 is not -- has been rescheduled. So  
11 it's -- it's up to our up -- up to our guests if they --  
12 if they wish to remain with us over our fifteen minute  
13 break.

14 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Sure. That's fine with me.

15 MS. ERIKAT: No, that's no problem. We --

16 MS. SAMUELU: Yeah, I can do that.

17 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Okay. Well, that would be great.

18 MS. BANH: We would love to.

19 CHAIR FORNACIARI: So --

20 MS. BANH: Oh, man, we would love to. We won't be  
21 able to, but we would love to. We hope that Commissioner  
22 Fernandez, Commissioner Akutagawa has our PowerPoint as  
23 well, so please, reconnect.

24 CHAIR FORNACIARI: We will definitely do that, and  
25 we really, really appreciate your time today, and the

1 information that you shared with us. You've given us an  
2 awful lot to think about, and some really good advice on  
3 how to get started, you know, on the right foot down this  
4 road we're headed. So thank you so much.

5 And with that, we will resume at 3:05.

6 (Pause)

7 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Well, welcome back. Thanks again  
8 to our presenters for sticking with us over the break.  
9 Just to provide some clarification, the breaks are for  
10 the captioners, because the captioners work alone, so  
11 they work for an hour-and-a-half straight and need a  
12 break, but we want to express our appreciation for all  
13 the folks who help us out, the ASL interpreters, the  
14 captioners, the video team, and thank you all. And I  
15 think all of us need a break after about an hour-and-a-  
16 half.

17 Anyway, I will turn it back to Commissioner  
18 Fernandez to continue to moderate the discussion. So  
19 thank you, Commissioner.

20 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Thank you.

21 (Indiscernible).

22 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Okay, you got really quiet all of  
23 a sudden.

24 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Did I?

25 Commissioner Sinay? Maybe I should pull it closer.

1           COMMISSIONER SINAY: Commissioner Sadhwani basically  
2 asked my question, which is, what do you all need to be  
3 successful in engaging in the redistricting. And I think  
4 we heard from everyone except for you, Tavae, and I  
5 apologize if I've said that wrong again.

6           But I -- if you -- and also if you thought of other  
7 things, please share them because this is the time to  
8 share what you all need to be engaged with us, or to help  
9 us engage your communities.

10          MS. SAMUEL: Thank you. It's Ta-VIE. So I think  
11 that there was also a specific question around how nimble  
12 our organizations can be, given your fast turnaround.  
13 And so I do want to acknowledge that the ability to move  
14 quickly on some of these things also requires trust and  
15 resources, and that for the Pacific Islander community in  
16 particular, in the ways that we serve and network with  
17 each other -- please excuse the ice cream truck in the  
18 background -- is that there is protocol in how we do  
19 things.

20          And so even the ways that we created the materials  
21 for census, like, that process took about seven months.  
22 Like, that is the reality for us of getting community  
23 buy-in, and in some cases, permission from elders in  
24 order to do things the way that we did, right? That like  
25 if -- I think and this is an Adrienne Maree Brown quote

1 of like, change moving at the speed of trust, is that we  
2 had to move really slow.

3 I think now, as far as the capacity of the Pacific  
4 Islander community, another lesson learned, I do want to  
5 echo what Tho Vinh stated about there being  
6 infrastructure that was created by the census that can be  
7 leveraged for redistricting, but that is also an  
8 infrastructure that often disadvantage the Pacific  
9 Islander community, in particular because it relied  
10 heavily on CBOs, and Pacific Islanders don't have a CBO  
11 infrastructure in the State of California that's that  
12 deep, especially so in LA County, where our population is  
13 the largest.

14 Where many of the CBOs are completely volunteer run,  
15 that EPIC is rare and unique, in that we're one of the  
16 few that has paid staff. And so I wonder if there's  
17 another equity piece to your process in understanding,  
18 like, the pacing of your involvement and engagement of  
19 folks is indicative of your understanding of, like, what  
20 the communities -- that you may actually need to move  
21 slower with the Pacific Islander community, and that our  
22 processes do tend to take longer; however, what they  
23 produce are long-lasting relationships.

24 I also want to note, there's a whole pandemic still  
25 happening, and we also notice that COVID has

1 disproportionately impacted the Pacific Islander  
2 community, where in some places in California, Pacific  
3 Islanders are twelve times more likely to get COVID than  
4 their white counterpart.

5       Knowing this, and how that comes up in your  
6 redistricting process, is also going to dictate capacity  
7 and pace, not just of EPIC as an organization, but also  
8 the Pacific Islander community as a whole. That one of  
9 the goals of our work in census, and continues to be our  
10 goal, is like, how do we build out the infrastructure of  
11 the Pacific Islander community, knowing that everything  
12 that we do impacts this broader NHPI ecosystem that we  
13 function in.

14       COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: I love that background. I  
15 think they wanted to go to the ice cream truck.

16       Commissioner Toledo?

17       VICE CHAIR KENNEDY: Thank you. I mean, having  
18 lived in Fiji and the -- essentially, the North Solomons,  
19 Bougainville and PNG, I, you know, certainly have a good  
20 understanding of the pace of things.

21       The issue is that we have statutory deadlines, so  
22 you know, I have, as a member of the Lessons Learned  
23 subcommittee, I've already taken note that the 2030  
24 Commission should probably be formed even earlier, so  
25 that there is more time to develop relationships and

1 develop materials for education and so forth, so that it  
2 doesn't run headlong into this wall of deadlines that we  
3 have to meet, and I appreciate Commissioner Vazquez's  
4 enthusiastic support.

5 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Thank you.

6 Okay, I don't see any hands so I'm going to ask my  
7 question now. I was hoping that --

8 COMMISSIONER SINAY: Commissioner Fernandez?

9 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Yes.

10 COMMISSIONER SINAY: It's very hard to hear you.

11 Oh, there we go. It's like --

12 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Oh.

13 COMMISSIONER VAZQUEZ: -- the way -- your mic  
14 doesn't seem to quite pick up your voice unless you're  
15 speaking directly at the computer.

16 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: It's right --

17 COMMISSIONER VAZQUEZ: Oh, yep, there we go.

18 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Okay, thank you.

19 Oh, if you could both -- so what I was curious  
20 about -- because I know that Tavae has brought up the  
21 census for Oregon, and I'm hoping Rahmo and Jeanine have  
22 also. If you could give us, like, your experience with  
23 that effort, and in terms of the resources that you  
24 needed. And then also maybe if you can talk a little bit  
25 about, you know, coming off the heels of the census; can

1 we use maybe that momentum, in terms of trying to use  
2 that network for the redistricting piece of it?

3 MS. ERIKAT: Yeah, I can speak -- thank you for that  
4 question. I can speak upon our census work.

5 So as Rahmo mentioned, at PANA, we launched this  
6 larger hub called the Refugee and Immigrant Hub in San  
7 Diego, where we partnered with 15 other ethnic-based  
8 community organizations. And so that worked -- and for  
9 most of -- I'd like to say most of the communities that  
10 we're working with, this is the first time they've  
11 engaged with the census. It was the first time they'd  
12 ever heard of the census; it was a completely new process  
13 to them. So that required for us to do a lot of  
14 background and education on what is the census; what does  
15 it mean; you know, why are we doing it.

16 And we feel that yes, there's going to be a lot of  
17 momentum with -- leading into redistricting, but again,  
18 like Rahmo mentioned, a lot of our communities, this is  
19 the first time that they've been experiencing that  
20 process, and it's a longer process, right? And so we're  
21 anticipating that we're going to need more education  
22 materials.

23 And that's where, like, support from the state comes  
24 in, right, is that we have access to these resources.  
25 It's in plain language; it's something that we can easily

1 translate. It's things we can redirect to help our  
2 community, show them how does, like, the COI tool work,  
3 the app, and everything like that.

4       What worked really well was that we were able to,  
5 like Rahmo mentioned, we had workshops in language,  
6 right? It was directly, there wasn't, like, someone was  
7 coming and they had to wait for an interpreter. They got  
8 that information; they're able to answer their questions  
9 right at the moment. It was with people that they  
10 trusted, people that they knew, and that we were really  
11 able to support the other organizations that we worked  
12 with financially to be able to have staff who could carry  
13 this on, right, because it was a very long effort.

14       At PANA, we were able to pay for our twenty-team  
15 phone banker of youth who were calling community in  
16 language, explaining the census, helping them fill out  
17 the census right there on the phone with them, walking  
18 through the steps. It was creating informational videos  
19 in a variety of languages, and it was really building  
20 that trust and letting community know that they can ask  
21 us in a language that they feel comfortable in. We can  
22 explain it to them, you know, walk them through that  
23 process, explain to them why it's so important.

24       And that's why, I mean, I set -- not to keep going,  
25 but I think funding would be a really huge, huge way to

1 get other communities involved. Because all of our  
2 ethnic-based, like, CBOs are really impacted. We're  
3 doing direct services with the pandemic, right? Some of  
4 our organizations are working on immigration cases.  
5 We're working on just housing crisis, right? Like Rahmo  
6 mentioned, East African communities, specifically in San  
7 Diego, is spending upwards of 50 percent of their income  
8 on rent, and a lot of our communities that -- I'm  
9 speaking more broadly on the Arab/Middle Eastern/South  
10 Asian/Muslim/African communities were in, like -- were  
11 Uber drivers or Lyft drivers, or these gig workers who  
12 lost their job, lost their income.

13 So there's all these other factors coming in, and  
14 that's why I think being able to fund organizations like  
15 PANA, which have those trusted messenger relationships,  
16 would be really where we could work together, being able  
17 to have more education material, in-language materials, I  
18 think.

19 And really, like, explaining, like, if -- I think  
20 if, like, for example, like Rahmo said, the State hosted  
21 a -- like a mapping workshop in Somali, that would be  
22 huge. I mean, right? Like, it would be something that  
23 the community can ask questions, can learn, can  
24 understand what is this process that they've never  
25 engaged with before.

1 MS. SAMUEL: So I do, you know, and just I think  
2 there was a previous comment. I fully understand that  
3 there are a lot of statutory deadlines. This is also  
4 something that we run into a lot as EPIC in our, you  
5 know, our statewide and national advocacy work is that  
6 we're, you know, that a letter will go out to sign on to  
7 support a bill, or a resolution, and we'll have 24 hours  
8 to turn it around and get as many people signed in as  
9 possible.

10 So I think the internal mapping that I've done, as  
11 well as, like, power mapping the PI community is  
12 recognizing who are the elders who can move quickly, when  
13 as a younger person in the community, I can't. And so I  
14 think that's my own -- and this is also the partner --  
15 where the partnership comes in of, like, that lived  
16 expertise and wisdom of like, all right, I know if I hand  
17 it off to this elder or this trusted messenger, that they  
18 can get people to move quickly on something.

19 To that effect I think the other lesson learned from  
20 the census was -- one was this was the first time I've  
21 ever been counted. Two is that we were able to lean on  
22 elders who've been working with, you know, and doing  
23 census work since NHPI became a category in 2000. So  
24 this is the other thing to recognize, right, that we are  
25 a fairly new census community. And in that -- and that's

1 not that we were new to the U.S., right, we've been here,  
2 especially our Native Hawaiian folks.

3 But that as a newer community, it's also newer to  
4 these processes and navigating these systems, so whereas  
5 for the census, we were able to lean on elders who had  
6 long been in relationship to the bureau, to where, you  
7 know, partnership specialists; that's not true for  
8 redistricting. And in some ways, we would be starting  
9 from scratch with this information with understanding and  
10 translating that.

11 The census makes sense because there's this notion  
12 of resources, needing to count everyone. Redistricting  
13 is a little bit harder. I think what was also difficult  
14 is that many NHPs who wanted to apply sort of in Long  
15 Beach City or in LA had been disqualified or ineligible  
16 because they worked for the City in the last five years,  
17 or they worked for the County, which, in a community as  
18 small as the Pacific Islander community, it's those who  
19 work in those positions who are the most civically  
20 engaged and are the most adept at the systems, right?  
21 And so that if you -- if those folks are those that are  
22 ineligible, you just disqualified the most engaged and  
23 the most equipped to participate in these processes.

24 And that's the difficulty, that for the Pacific  
25 Islander community, being as small as we are, those sort

1 of ineligibilities are felt far more acutely and  
2 severely.

3 In stating that, we were also -- and really able to  
4 identify the key translators, and also because we don't  
5 have ethnic media, better equipped and aware of where  
6 people are getting their information, and how to better  
7 leverage our channels of communication, that with the  
8 census and COVID and everything being shut down, our  
9 initial plans relied heavily on in-person outreach  
10 leveraging annual cultural festivals. And when all of  
11 those were canceled, we were forced to move to a  
12 completely digital strategy, which was hard to navigate.

13 I think what also put us at a bit of a disadvantage  
14 when coming to sort of state census efforts, is that it  
15 prioritized a geographic approach. Now, why that was an  
16 issue for the Pacific Islander community is because 70  
17 percent of Pacific Islanders do not live in what are  
18 considered low response areas.

19 So what needs to be had and understood about the  
20 Pacific Islander community is the intersection of both  
21 race and place, when trying to reach out to and speak to  
22 our communities; also the intersections at which because  
23 we are not a concentrated population or have ethnic  
24 enclaves, how we talk about the intersections of, like,  
25 race and gender, age, if we're talking about

1 redistricting in schools, how we look at the other needs  
2 whether it's immigration status or healthcare needs, and  
3 how that impacts how our communities think of  
4 redistricting and place.

5 MS. ERIKAT: Yeah, and if I could just add on really  
6 quick, also just something that I forgot to mention that  
7 Tavae uplifted, is that something that was really  
8 challenging with the census for the AMEMSA community is  
9 that Arab and Middle Eastern do not have their own  
10 category, right? They're considered white, and they have  
11 to check white, and so they're completely left out of  
12 that. And so that was a lot of education, you know. The  
13 movement this year was to try to get Other, to get them  
14 to put Other. But there's a lot of, you know, a lot of  
15 confusion also just filling it out, like, them not seeing  
16 themselves, right? They don't -- I mean, when we're  
17 talking Syrian refugees, they're not seeing themselves as  
18 white, right? They're seeing themselves as displaced  
19 people from Syria.

20 And so things like that also made it really  
21 difficult; they're not showing up in the numbers. As  
22 Rahmo mentioned, a lot of African immigrants and refugees  
23 are putting black and African American, right, and  
24 they're not -- their numbers aren't -- their ethnic  
25 numbers aren't showing up, and that's a really important

1 thing to understand is that that's why they're often  
2 overlooked in the data; that's why we can't even --  
3 there's, like, issues with finding the numbers, like, to  
4 be honest, finding the numbers for the language at, like,  
5 what were the highest African languages for today's  
6 presentation was extremely difficult because those  
7 numbers aren't out there, and our communities, right, are  
8 often ignored.

9 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Thank you for that.

10 I wasn't sure if Commissioner Sadhwani had her hand  
11 up, but if not, then Commissioner Akutagawa.

12 Oh, could you not hear me again?

13 COMMISSIONER AKUTAGAWA: We're not hearing you  
14 totally clearly; you came in talking.

15 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Oh, how about now?

16 Commissioner Sadhwani, did you have your hand up or  
17 no?

18 COMMISSIONER SADHWANI: Well, I mean, kind of just a  
19 comment. I love kind of hearing all of these things.  
20 Some of the takeaways I'm getting, and they're just kind  
21 of random thoughts, and we can do with them as we want,  
22 or do nothing with them.

23 So you know, to build off of the momentum of the  
24 census, I feel like we almost need, like, some sort of  
25 campaign kind of approach of like, first we count, then

1 we map, kind of approach that we could take to different  
2 communities.

3 I know in the past, there used to be campaigns  
4 around, like, first we naturalize, then we vote, right?  
5 And so kind of in a similar sense, because all of this  
6 amazing outreach has been done in the census, I feel like  
7 having something that would like really build on that  
8 momentum that we could use broadly across communities,  
9 with a quick and easy tagline or slogan might be really  
10 great.

11 What I'm also hearing, though, I think as of right  
12 now, we've been thinking a lot about our outreach as  
13 regional, but what might make sense for us to start  
14 thinking about is, like, overlaying that with some very  
15 specific kinds of access outreach as well, since we're  
16 still in the COVID time period, right? We could do, you  
17 know, sessions that are Zoom based anyway and focus in on  
18 one community and ensure that we have translation  
19 services and materials that are already ready to go  
20 before we do that kind of outreach, right? And that  
21 could be more statewide, as opposed to going regionally,  
22 could potentially -- especially if we're talking about  
23 ensuring that we have those kinds of resources for the  
24 interpretation, et cetera.

25 And then, in terms of the resources, I mean, I --

1 you know, we have a whole subcommittee that's already  
2 working on this, so I don't need to necessarily be a part  
3 of it, but I think some sort of community partners  
4 program makes total sense, that hopefully, you know, we  
5 can start moving on it quickly, because I think this is  
6 one of -- will be one of our greatest challenges, is our  
7 time frame and like, the statutory requirements that we  
8 have, and ensuring that we can do that relationship  
9 building and have a meaningful partnership with you all,  
10 as well as a bunch of other organizations, I'm sure, from  
11 around the state.

12 So those -- just some comments, in terms of  
13 everything I'm hearing and you know, things for us to be  
14 thinking about moving forward.

15 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Great.

16 Commissioner Akutagawa?

17 COMMISSIONER AKUTAGAWA: Yeah, and I just want to  
18 also just note that it's 3:25, and I know Tavae has to  
19 leave at 3:30. I just quickly wanted to ask, for me,  
20 what's a practical question. I know I'm hearing you,  
21 I -- you know, obviously as, you know, running a  
22 nonprofit, I am totally on board with what you mean about  
23 funding.

24 I think what I want to understand, and I think this  
25 will be helpful for all of us to understand is I -- I

1 know that we have money for outreach. I think outreach  
2 and access are kind of different things, you know. To do  
3 proper outreach, we have to also ensure proper access.

4 And so I'm hearing you about, like, the community  
5 partnerships. What would be your recommendations, like,  
6 what's your thoughts on, you know, how -- you know, how  
7 do we -- we have to make the money kind of spread  
8 throughout the State. What's your thoughts on how best  
9 can we do that where we can provide resources, you know,  
10 whether it's to your organizations -- I know that there's  
11 the different partnerships, you know. I think that's  
12 where I'm getting kind of also caught up in, like, yeah,  
13 we could do this, this, and this, but then at what point,  
14 like, how much is enough, and then what's the best way to  
15 ensure that the resources -- I mean, I'll just frankly  
16 say that I know that sometimes there's these kind of like  
17 umbrella organizations that then parse out money to a  
18 bunch of smaller organizations. Frankly, I think, you  
19 know, the small organizations are doing the work, so it  
20 just seems like it makes sense to give it to the  
21 organizations who are on the ground doing it, but then  
22 that's also, like, I'm also learning quite a bit about  
23 the bureaucracy of the State and I'm not sure if that's  
24 going to be workable. I mean, so many different  
25 questions that I have, but I just would love to hear your

1 thoughts on that, from either Janine, Rahmo, or Tavae, I  
2 mean. There may not be an answer.

3 MS. SAMUEL: No, there -- I mean, there definitely  
4 isn't an easy answer, and I appreciate the question  
5 because I think, you know, as you're talking about  
6 bureaucracy, I do understand it. So I know, you know, in  
7 private foundation philanthropy, some of that trickle-  
8 down economics of large -- also happens because  
9 foundations only want to know one organization.

10 But I think in government contracting, there's also  
11 the piece that like it costs a lot more to manage  
12 government contracts. That sometimes EPIC as an  
13 organization will take on the money because we know it'll  
14 cost 12 percent for us, versus the smaller organizations  
15 that we work with that are completely volunteer run, that  
16 the overhead will run anywhere from 30 to 40 percent to  
17 manage a government contract, right?

18 And that's the unfortunate part that like it costs a  
19 lot more to start something from scratch than to sustain  
20 an administrative infrastructure.

21 Now, there's the other piece where I think needs to  
22 be understood is that the way that equity gets understood  
23 and deployed in these sorts of funding situations where  
24 there's this notion that the most equitable way to  
25 distribute funding is that it would be a microcosm of the

1 communities, right? That if there's, you know, six  
2 percent, or what it is, APIs account for six percent of  
3 the State of California, then they should get six percent  
4 of the funding.

5 I do want to challenge that notion because I need  
6 there to be an understanding that like communities that  
7 are newer, it costs more do that work, right? That for  
8 the Asian-American community because of the huge  
9 diversity of languages, translation costs so much money  
10 that that takes a lot more of the resources, right?  
11 Because you're trying to cover, I think in working with  
12 AAJC, we provide resources in 22 languages. I can  
13 imagine that the statement is true for PANA, and so  
14 wanting to think about equity in a way where you  
15 understand one, covering full costs of the work; and two,  
16 this is Lavinia (ph.), say hi -- and two, that equity is  
17 understood that people have what they need as opposed to  
18 trying to create something that is a microcosm of the  
19 State, because frankly those are also the things that  
20 leave our communities out, as well as understanding that  
21 what are the requirements for some of these funding  
22 sources.

23 So that is my cue that I need to go, but thank you  
24 all so much. I really appreciate having this time with  
25 you. Please take care.

1 COMMISSIONER AKUTAGAWA: Thank you.

2 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Thank you for joining us. We  
3 really appreciated it.

4 MS. ERIKAT: Yeah, I can answer that. I mean,  
5 really, Tavae really just hit the nail on that, and I  
6 think I just want to echo that, right? That our  
7 communities take and require more investment, right?  
8 Like Rahmo mentioned earlier, at PANA we serve over 30  
9 languages. We had to translate census material in 15  
10 languages, and 15 languages being the minimum, to be  
11 quite honest.

12 So just even thinking, like, at the most basic level  
13 of translation, which I think with redistricting,  
14 translation is the basic level, right? It's not even  
15 talking more about the outreach and the education part,  
16 all of that, that we need -- we just -- that's where  
17 funding needs to come in, that we need more funding to  
18 translate in multiple languages to make sure everyone's  
19 engaged, and I think Tavae had a really good point about  
20 the overhead costs. I mean, that's even why we took an  
21 approach with census of -- PANA was, you know, we got the  
22 money from the State, State got it from the County, we  
23 got it from the County, and we gave it out to 15 partner  
24 organizations, right?

25 And so I don't know if I have anything new to add.

1 I don't -- I know you all have a very long day, long  
2 meeting, so I'll leave it at that.

3 COMMISSIONER AKUTAGAWA: Thank you.

4 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Thank you.

5 Commissioner Le Mons?

6 COMMISSIONER LE MONS: Thanks to everyone who  
7 presented. Wonderful presentation.

8 I guess my question is, and I don't know how  
9 comfortable any of you will feel with answering this  
10 question, but we understand the funding flows, and  
11 options, and challenges. We also understand that we have  
12 a limited amount of resources. And so when we start  
13 talking about dollar amounts, and certainly we wouldn't  
14 hold any of you to these dollar amounts, but what kind of  
15 price tags are we talking? Because that really is going  
16 to make the difference. Like so to do a certain range or  
17 scope of work, to say, 15 languages, you know, are we  
18 talking about \$10,000, \$50,000, a half a million dollars?  
19 I mean, I think us having some kind of sense of that kind  
20 of helps us do our planning as it relates to our  
21 budgeting.

22 So again, and I know that one person or two people  
23 speaking to that question is not going to necessarily  
24 represent the fiscal realities of every organization. So  
25 I just want to put that caveat out there right away, and

1 by no means would we be trying to hold you to any  
2 numbers, but I think that us getting some more tangible  
3 price tags really gives us something to talk about more  
4 intentionally.

5 MS. ERIKAT: Yeah, thank you for that question,  
6 Commissioner. And to be quite honest, I don't have an  
7 answer to you in this moment, but I actually think that  
8 what you're bringing is so important, and I understand  
9 how crucial it is to your work and our work, and actually  
10 encourage you all to set up an additional meeting where,  
11 you know, we can come back, like PANA and other  
12 organizations who presented, and I know you've had  
13 multiple presentations, can come back and give you more  
14 tangible and realistic numbers, because I feel like it'll  
15 be a disservice right now for me to throw out a number  
16 and it be way off point, either too low or too high. So  
17 I would rather we have a more fruitful conversation where  
18 we can come and present, like, what -- we can give you an  
19 example of what our budget was with census, for example,  
20 with the 15 languages, you know, and other organizations  
21 across the state could do the same.

22 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Marian? I can't hear you,  
23 Marian.

24 COMMISSIONER JOHNSTON: Do you have any experience  
25 with Google Translate for documents? I know they're up

1 to, I think over 100 languages that they use now. I know  
2 several years ago they were barely adequate. I don't  
3 know if they've improved any.

4 MS. ERIKAT: I would say Google Translate works in  
5 the short-term, in the quick moment, you know, if you  
6 need it on the spot. But it's definitely not the way to  
7 go with government documents, right, or even education  
8 materials, right? There's a lot of nuance that Google  
9 Translate doesn't pick up on. It doesn't even account --  
10 like, it doesn't even account for the formal languages  
11 properly, let alone all the different dialects, like if  
12 we're just -- and I'm speaking my experience as an Arab  
13 speaker, right? When I've used -- been on the  
14 opposite -- when I've seen it translate in Arabic, formal  
15 Arabic, it's -- I don't want to say inaccurate, because  
16 it gets the point across, but I wouldn't recommend it for  
17 something so important like redistricting, where we're  
18 really making -- want to make sure that everyone is  
19 involved. I don't -- it wouldn't be feasible in my  
20 opinion.

21 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Do we have any other  
22 questions? Commissioner Kennedy?

23 VICE CHAIR KENNEDY: Yeah, I mean my -- my  
24 experience, and I've you know, worked in Jordan and  
25 elsewhere, and seen materials that have been produced

1 through Google Translate. And sometimes, not only does  
2 it not convey the nuance, sometimes it conveys exactly  
3 the opposite meaning of what you're trying to get across,  
4 so you know, it -- sometimes in some of their languages,  
5 it can give you a head start. It might cut down on the  
6 time that it takes, but you know, there's no -- you  
7 cannot rely on it, you know, for 100 percent of the  
8 solution.

9 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: I'll just talk from  
10 personal experience, not with Google Translate, but --  
11 can you not hear me? Oh, my goodness. I think --  
12 Christian, what did you do to my computer?

13 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Commissioner Fernandez, we can  
14 only hear you when you are looking directly at the screen  
15 like you are right now.

16 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Okay.

17 CHAIR FORNACIARI: When you put your head down, we  
18 can't --

19 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: All right, I can't put my  
20 head down. All right, here we go.

21 When I've used some of the translation services,  
22 it's interesting some of the words they use, and I'm  
23 sure, like some have mentioned, speaking a second  
24 language, it tends to be more of a formal type of  
25 translation versus, like, the normal speak. So I -- I

1 would hesitate to use some sort of formal translation.

2 And Commissioner Sinay?

3 COMMISSIONER SINAY: So I used it just yesterday to  
4 translate a whole thing for a parent focus group next  
5 week. And I do cheat, where I do the Google and then I  
6 go back and fix it all, and so you have to be a native  
7 Spanish -- I mean, for me it was in Spanish. You have to  
8 be a native speaker to be able to catch the nuances and  
9 the jargon, just little things, you know, to be  
10 consistent.

11 But it is a great tool. It's better than nothing,  
12 so if you're trying to learn something, you know, it  
13 plays an important role. And I think -- but for  
14 redistricting as Janine was saying, there's so many  
15 nuances that we're going to have to be careful.

16 I did want to follow up on one of Commissioner  
17 Sadhwani's point. One of the things that we did in San  
18 Diego -- hi, I'm from San Diego. One of the things we  
19 did in San Diego was we connected with the census -- the  
20 census CBO there, and when Michelle sent out her last  
21 newsletter, she actually at the bottom, it said thank  
22 you, census, everyone who did the census; this is us from  
23 the Redistricting Commission inviting you to be part of  
24 it. And so we were able to get that blurb in there, and  
25 it went out to all the CBOs and asking them to sign up on

1 our website, because that was the only action we really  
2 had right now.

3 And so as you're talking to your CBOs, if there's  
4 that opportunity, we can send you a copy of the  
5 newsletter so you can see what the language is, but we  
6 are -- and having the director of the census come in  
7 next -- to our next meeting, so we are building on that.  
8 So thank you for confirming some of our thoughts.

9 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Thank you.

10 Do we have any other questions? Okay.

11 Well, thank you again to Janine and Rahmo for coming  
12 today. This has been very helpful. We appreciate you  
13 taking the time to be with us today.

14 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Yes, thank you very much. It's  
15 been very, very helpful and enlightening. We really  
16 appreciate your partnership with us, thank you.

17 COMMISSIONER AKUTAGAWA: Thank you, Rahmo and thank  
18 you, Janine. We appreciate it.

19 MS. ABDI: Thank you, Commissioners, for your time.  
20 We really appreciate, and we're looking forward to  
21 working with you all.

22 MS. ERIKAT: Yes, thank you so much for the extended  
23 Q and A session.

24 CHAIR FORNACIARI: No problem.

25 MS. ERIKAT: Thank you for our --

1           COMMISSIONER AKUTAGAWA: Thank you for giving us the  
2 extra time and thank you for the fantastic presentation.  
3 That was great.

4           MS. ERIKAT: Thank you, all. Have a great rest of  
5 your evening.

6           CHAIR FORNACIARI: Well, thank you, Commissioners  
7 Akutagawa and Fernandez for putting that together for us  
8 and for all of the presentations that we've had. Really,  
9 really helpful and lots of great information.

10          I think -- did Commissioner Le Mons, did you have  
11 a -- want to speak? Yeah.

12          COMMISSIONER LE MONS: Yeah, what I wanted to say  
13 is, I wanted to share some of my experience in terms of  
14 tackling this issue of trying to get messages and  
15 materials and information out to the community.

16          When I was the Deputy Director of the California  
17 AIDS Clearinghouse, which was back in the '90s, actually,  
18 before we had a lot of the technology we have today, but  
19 we were the state repository of all HIV, AIDS-related  
20 prevention materials for the entire state.

21          And so just a quick little history, when the AIDS  
22 epidemic first started, there were no organized  
23 government agencies, groups, et cetera. Everything was  
24 really done at community level. And as it became a  
25 systemized operation, government intervention, funding,

1 et cetera, all of that kind of shifted.

2 And what happened in that process is, when you  
3 created something like the California AIDS Clearinghouse,  
4 who our primary customer were the Health Departments and  
5 community-based organizations in every county in the  
6 state, including Pasadena and Long Beach.

7 And so what happened is, you can only have so many  
8 different materials; you could only have them be -- they  
9 got so watered down because it had to serve 40 million  
10 people, right? So by the time you tried to create  
11 something that potentially does that, it becomes  
12 ultimately ineffective for the majority of people. And  
13 that was even securing materials from commercial  
14 producers like Channing Betes and places like that, who  
15 have enormous budgets to do R and D and all of these  
16 different things, but they still go for that sort of  
17 neutral, in the middle, vanilla, for lack of a better  
18 term, outcome.

19 And so actually, one of the things that I  
20 recommended, and we wouldn't probably need this piece,  
21 was first I created a pilot program, where we taught  
22 local organizations how to vary, you know, fly-by, one-  
23 on-one, how to develop materials. So -- because we  
24 thought it was best that we provide training, and then we  
25 provide support. And so rather than flipping it, my idea

1 was to flip it. And rather than us approach it from how  
2 do we find a product or suite of products that can pass  
3 the scrutiny of all of these different counties who have  
4 very, very different needs, et cetera; let's flip it and  
5 let's teach local communities how to develop materials,  
6 and those were both video product, print product, et  
7 cetera.

8       And because some of my background was in production,  
9 I decided that we use a multi-city training that was done  
10 via video. So we had camera, not like Zoom; this was  
11 pre, you know, the Zoom days, but you know, we had four  
12 camera crews in both San Diego, Los Angeles, and then in  
13 the Bay Area. And then that way, people who lived close  
14 to some of those communities could go to those particular  
15 hubs, and then those hubs were also broadcasting out to  
16 some of their neighboring communities for the training.

17       The key piece was the supporting it with resources,  
18 because you can give training all day long, and then if  
19 people can't really develop or have the resources to  
20 develop, and what we used was a mini-grant model. And I  
21 don't -- I think we should explore that. So it's not a  
22 contract; we're giving them a grant and calling it a day.  
23 And it really changes the game in all of the contract  
24 management that's required.

25       Certainly they couldn't be huge amounts, which was

1 sort of why I was trying to get a sense of price tags, if  
2 you will, because that's a very different model than --  
3 we're talking about contracts for larger amounts of  
4 money. I believe that at that time, those mini-grants  
5 were around 10, \$15,000 a pop, but we were able to give  
6 out a lot of them.

7       And then, the flip part that I was talking about, at  
8 that point, we allowed them to be developed on the ground  
9 in service of the communities themselves, and then we  
10 had -- part of our agreement was they submitted to us  
11 their final product. And then that way, we could take --  
12 we had this whole potpourri of types of materials that we  
13 could then look at and see how we could make them  
14 available in their original form for other parts of the  
15 state who had similar communities to the community that  
16 developed it, and how we could do minor tweaks with our  
17 resources to make them have a broader appeal, and extend  
18 the life of that product a little bit further.

19       So I think in this case, if we're doing something  
20 similar, we know what basic education we're going to want  
21 to get out, we can come up with those prongs of what  
22 information we want distributed across the state, and  
23 then work with these local organizations to be able to  
24 use the method that they want to use to communicate it as  
25 well.

1           So they would have the freedom to say this is the  
2 best way to take this information that the Commission  
3 wants to communicate to our community. They may decide  
4 to do a drum circle and communicate it. They may decide  
5 to do a piece of material, but whatever the case may be  
6 is that we would support the best mechanism for  
7 transferring the information, as opposed to trying to  
8 come up with a model that everybody has to figure out.

9           So I'm sharing this story primarily from a  
10 philosophical perspective in how we might be creative and  
11 look at how we do this.

12           And I'm happy to say that the State of California,  
13 based on the pilot, year two they were very impressed  
14 with our outcomes, and as a result, gave us \$1.2 million  
15 that second year to support another round of just going  
16 to the community. All that money went directly to the  
17 community, whereas in the past, that money would've sat  
18 with us to do the work.

19           So I just wanted to put that out there, and that  
20 wasn't -- hopefully that was just, you know, fly-by, but  
21 detailed enough to give you a sense of where I'm coming  
22 from on that. And I think the critical piece here would  
23 be for us to be able to explore whether there are other  
24 mechanisms for us to distribute this money outside of  
25 these big contract models, or RFP models.

1 So that's what I wanted to share.

2 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Thank you, Commissioner Le Mons.

3 I -- you know what, and I apologize, I don't want to  
4 interrupt. But we did -- I did forget to ask for public  
5 comment after speakers. Do we want to do that now and  
6 then -- so I'll ask for public comment for the -- from  
7 Jesse for public comment on our presenters that we just  
8 had. So if you could read the instructions, and then  
9 we'll come right back to this. I apologize; I didn't  
10 mean to -- I don't mean to interrupt, but I did want to  
11 do that part.

12 COMMENT MODERATOR: In order to maximize  
13 transparency and public participation in our process, the  
14 Commissioners will be taking public comment by phone. To  
15 call in, dial the telephone number provided on the live  
16 stream feed. The telephone number is (877) 853-5247.

17 When prompted, enter the meeting ID number provided  
18 on the live stream feed. It is 93489457215 for this  
19 week's meeting. When prompted to enter a participant ID,  
20 simply press pound.

21 Once you have dialed in, you will be placed in a  
22 queue, from which a moderator will begin unmuting callers  
23 to submit their comments. You will also hear an  
24 automated message to press star, 9. Please do this to  
25 raise your hand, indicating you wish to comment.

1           When it is your turn to speak, the moderator will  
2 unmute you, and you will hear an automated message that  
3 says the host would like you to talk, and press star, 6  
4 to speak.

5           Please make sure to mute your computer or live  
6 stream audio to prevent any feedback or distortion during  
7 your call. Once you are waiting in the queue, be alert  
8 to when it is your turn to speak. And again, please turn  
9 down the live stream volume.

10           These instructions are also located on the website.  
11 The Commission is taking public comment on the presenters  
12 at this time.

13           CHAIR FORNACIARI: Thanks, Jesse. You know, we'll  
14 give a minute for the folks to call in, but I think  
15 Commissioner Sinay wanted to -- do you want to wait, or  
16 do you want to go ahead and start your comment, and then  
17 if someone calls in, we can take their comment?

18           COMMISSIONER SINAY: Let me start -- thank you,  
19 Commissioner Le Mons. I've been getting pings from  
20 different people at different times, and I'm sure  
21 Commissioner Vazquez is as well. And we have been taking  
22 in all these different ideas and thoughts, and we will be  
23 presenting, you know, that straw -- that straw plan  
24 that's been asked, that includes a lot of these things.

25           And Commissioner Le Mons, we're completely on the

1 same page of trying to figure out -- that's why we keep  
2 asking direct -- the direct, you know, Director Claypool,  
3 what does he mean by grants and what does that -- and  
4 we've been trying to explore that option with him, but  
5 we've also been talking with Philanthropy California and  
6 others to see, how do we create the most simple -- I  
7 don't know if simple's the right word, so you all can  
8 provide a better one, but the best way to reach the most  
9 vulnerable communities. Not vulnerable, hard-to-reach  
10 communities, I don't know. Excuse the words, the exact  
11 words, but the theme is the same.

12       So keep sending us your ideas and thoughts, and  
13 we'll -- and even during the presentation, I was putting  
14 in things. So we are taking everything plus our  
15 experiences and putting it together so that we can share  
16 with you all at the next meeting and start moving on  
17 this.

18       But the key piece that's missing is that information  
19 from Director Claypool.

20       CHAIR FORNACIARI: Any other thoughts, comments?  
21 Okay, very good. We don't have any callers in the queue  
22 at this point. But any other -- Commissioner Andersen?

23       COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: Since we're sort of pausing  
24 here, I just really wanted to -- and she took off before  
25 I could say it. I really wanted to uplift Tavae -- Te-

1 VEE, Ta-VEE?

2 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Ta-VIE.

3 COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: Tavae. Thank you. Tavae.

4 Her bringing up its Samoa. It's not Samoa, as many  
5 Americans think and all different -- it is Samoa. And I  
6 really appreciate that because it's something that's  
7 misspoken most of the time.

8 Also, she did address the idea that yes, Samoans can  
9 be conscripted or, you know, join the military, but do  
10 not have the right to vote. But I just want to say for  
11 the general public, do not worry; that is not part of our  
12 redistricting process. In California, who is eligible to  
13 vote, who is not eligible to vote; that does not matter.  
14 We must count and redistrict all Californians. So that  
15 is something to bring up, in terms of justice,  
16 particularly language justice, but in terms of our  
17 redistricting, not only are we listening to people, but  
18 we're looking for people.

19 So I just wanted to really appreciate all the  
20 speakers, and I really appreciate the language access to  
21 bring in these different groups of people who often, in  
22 terms of the general public, don't know about, or don't  
23 necessarily quite even understand how to pronounce the  
24 name, so great job. Thank you.

25 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Thank you, Commissioner Andersen.

1 Any other thoughts? Okay.

2 So let's see, we left off on item number 14, we  
3 didn't get too far along on the list. Just want to kind  
4 of take everybody -- sort of a pulse of the Commission.  
5 I mean, we have to spend some time talking about future  
6 agenda items; that's also on the list. And then take  
7 final public comment.

8 So you know, it's 4 o'clock. I just want to check  
9 in with everyone; do we want to jump back in and work on  
10 item 14 for another half hour or so, and then follow up  
11 with -- then go on to discussion of future agenda items,  
12 although I think at this point, Commissioner Kennedy,  
13 your agenda is out?

14 VICE CHAIR KENNEDY: It is out, but it has a couple  
15 of flexible elements, and particularly given the  
16 discussion with the presenters just now, if we wanted to  
17 have some of them back to have this discussion of what  
18 sort of financing would they need to carry out what sort  
19 of scope of work, the global access topic says, you know,  
20 to be updated as speakers are confirmed. I, you know,  
21 I'm happy to entertain bringing some folks back and  
22 having that conversation, because I think that it is a  
23 conversation that we need to have, and one that we need  
24 to have sooner rather than later. So I'm, you know, I'm  
25 certainly amenable to making some adjustments and using

1 times flexibly and intelligently, so.

2 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Good, so what --

3 VICE CHAIR KENNEDY: I would appreciate a good  
4 discussion on future agenda items because, you know, I --

5 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Okay, well, let's --

6 VICE CHAIR KENNEDY: -- await the responses.

7 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Let's do that now. Just we -- we  
8 got to make sure we get that done.

9 And so I saw Commissioner Fernandez and then  
10 Commissioner Sinay.

11 Can't hear you.

12 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Not -- still, oh. I wasn't  
13 looking down this time; I was actually looking straight.  
14 I feel like I can't move now.

15 CHAIR FORNACIARI: It's really more, like, leaning  
16 forward is --

17 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Okay.

18 CHAIR FORNACIARI: -- required.

19 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: I'll move my computer  
20 closer to me.

21 For the global access, Commissioner Akutagawa and I  
22 are -- we have at least, I think two speakers; we're  
23 trying to get four total, because that'll be our last, I  
24 think, presentation, and then we also want to discuss  
25 some of our recommendations. So based on how long we

1 went today, if we try to fit something else in, it might  
2 make us go over. So I was just trying to give you a  
3 little forewarning right now.

4 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Perfect, thank you.  
5 Commissioner Sinay?

6 COMMISSIONER SINAY: I think it's difficult to  
7 invite just specific organizations to come and have that  
8 conversation because organizations are so different and  
9 the needs are so different. And in the sense of equity,  
10 you also have, you know, it's -- I can't remember how  
11 many millions of nonprofits we have in California.

12 What I would like us to think about is, as you're  
13 speaking in your regions, as you're doing the outreach  
14 and looking into the different groups, maybe that's a  
15 question to ask.

16 I can tell you that Philanthropy California, the  
17 grants they just made in their regions -- or they're  
18 making in their regions, are at \$75,000. And those  
19 are -- they're not local based -- they're based, you  
20 know, a region like the Bay Area or Sacramento or that  
21 type. So we -- so that's just a -- I kind of thought  
22 that using the -- you know, the census had millions more  
23 money -- millions more dollars than we all had. And so  
24 it's how do we complement what Philanthropy California's  
25 already funded, which is some of the statewide

1 organizations to do the -- how to use the tool workshops  
2 for nonprofits, and they're doing some of those things,  
3 and creating the material, and then how that, you know,  
4 so -- so there's a lot of different pieces, but I think  
5 it would be difficult to say, okay, let's invite the same  
6 groups we already had because there's so many groups out  
7 there, and the answers are going to be all, you know,  
8 varied, as they were explaining to us, based on the cost  
9 of start -- you know, starting up to --

10 CHAIR FORNACIARI: So do you know how much the  
11 census, what their budget was? I mean, the State Census  
12 office? How much did they spend? You're muted.

13 COMMISSIONER SINAY: I have it somewhere, but it was  
14 over 100 million.

15 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Oh. So I can order  
16 (indiscernible) that we have. Okay.

17 COMMISSIONER SINAY: Yes, but they want us to be  
18 able to use a lot of their infrastructure, and that's why  
19 the director's coming to talk to us about it and see what  
20 we can build on, you know. They have certain things they  
21 already created that we can build on. But yeah, their  
22 budget was a whole different world than what ours is  
23 right now.

24 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Wow, okay. All right, so any  
25 other input to Commissioner Kennedy for the agenda for

1 the meeting on the 16th or, I think it's the 16th, or  
2 even the following -- are there items for the agenda on  
3 the following meeting that we want to make sure get on  
4 there offhand.

5 Commissioner Fernandez?

6 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Not that I want -- wait,  
7 here I go. Get close. We're just going to continue to  
8 do the policies, right? So like, a couple at a time?

9 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Yeah, so you know, we --

10 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Okay, so if we can just get  
11 on the agenda for that so that there's action items.

12 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Yeah, definitely.

13 VICE CHAIR KENNEDY: And could I ask about the VRA  
14 training that we agreed to remove from the agenda for the  
15 16th through the 18th; is that something that we need to  
16 put on the agenda for early December?

17 COMMISSIONER SADHWANI: So we haven't been able to  
18 confirm anyone as of yet for the November 16th through  
19 18th; however, we do anticipate sharing with you all an  
20 RFP for review.

21 If we can possibly keep space on that agenda, if  
22 there is space, we would still love to have at least an  
23 introductory training so that before your -- before the  
24 full Commission has to approve of an RFP, that at least  
25 there's some kind of background of what we should be

1 looking for here. And so we do have a request out to  
2 Justin Levitt. We had a couple others out, and we  
3 haven't been able to confirm them.

4 I think a lot of the folks who do this kind of  
5 training and analysis are extraordinarily -- have been  
6 extraordinarily busy with the election. I think we'll be  
7 able to get more folks later, but I do -- if it's  
8 possible to maintain even just like an hour, you know,  
9 and assuming we can confirm, hopefully Justin Levitt,  
10 that would be ideal.

11 I understand, though, that we have packed agenda.  
12 So if it's not possible, I do understand. But my  
13 preference would be that all Commissioners have a little  
14 bit of training before you have to approve of an RFP so  
15 that you understand what's at stake.

16 COMMISSIONER YEE: So this is for the VRA council,  
17 the outside council for later litigation, and we also  
18 need some discussion about VRA and RP -- voting rights  
19 act and racially equalized voting analysts, and we need  
20 some discussions, decisions about how to approach that,  
21 those hires.

22 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Okay, so you got four that you're  
23 bringing forward. Then we have the line drawing one  
24 probably that we'll be reviewing, so that's five. And is  
25 that all five? There's no other ones? Okay.

1           Okay, Commissioner Sinay?

2           COMMISSIONER SINAY: I just looked up my notes. I'm  
3 terrible with numbers; I always told my students, only  
4 quote my numbers if it's on a slide. It was \$187 million  
5 that the census had.

6           CHAIR FORNACIARI: Wow, okay. That's a pretty good  
7 budget.

8           Okay. Well, if there -- and if any other  
9 subcommittees think about needing an action, then get  
10 that to Commissioner Kennedy. It's probably a -- it's a  
11 little late for the 16th, but for the following meeting,  
12 if you feel like you're going to have a decision point at  
13 that time, then get that to Commissioner Kennedy as soon  
14 as you can frame it. That would help him a lot, too.

15           All right, very good. Okay. So it's 4:05. We have  
16 a -- we have to break at 4:45, but so what I would  
17 propose is let's go back to item number 14 until 4:30,  
18 and we'll get as far as we can. Then we'll take public  
19 comment, and we'll call it a day. Does that seem like a  
20 reasonable approach? Okay.

21           Are you okay, Angela? I mean, Commissioner -- are  
22 you okay?

23           COMMISSIONER VAZQUEZ: Yes, sorry. Sorry, I've had  
24 a migraine all day, COVID gifts that keep on giving.

25           CHAIR FORNACIARI: Sorry about that.

1           Okay, well, we'll carry on then. So let me share my  
2 screen again. Okay, can you all see that? Okay.

3           So the next topic was voting options. I mean, we  
4 touched on that already a little bit, but the real point  
5 here I wanted to just bring up was, you know, we've been  
6 doing it alphabetical and starting with the same person  
7 every time. And you know, I'm not -- so I mean, one  
8 option is to do alphabetical, but switch to the next  
9 person and so we end up going around and everybody gets a  
10 chance to be first and to be last. But we do have the  
11 pass option. But you know, that gets little awkward and  
12 then, random. I mean, I kind of like the idea of just  
13 alphabetical switching every time, just so the same  
14 people aren't going first all the time.

15           Does that sound reasonable? I mean, it'll be easier  
16 to track. We did random. I don't know how we managed  
17 that. Okay.

18           Commissioner Ahmad?

19           COMMISSIONER AHMAD: Just on that as a person who is  
20 voting first a lot by nature of my last name, I'm fine  
21 with keeping with alphabetical. Just so that it's easier  
22 for whoever is calling roll for votes, trying to keep  
23 track of the order from meeting to meeting, or from item  
24 to item, might get confusing.

25           So I'm just -- I'm okay with that if that was a

1 point of consideration.

2 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Well, I mean, it definitely was.  
3 You know, I'm throwing it out there. If we're happy with  
4 the way we're doing it now, let's just stick with it and  
5 move on, okay? We're happy? Stick with it and move on?

6 Yeah, I've got -- okay. All right, All right. Good  
7 deal.

8 Okay. So I added this --

9 COMMISSIONER SINAY: Kennedy is trying to get your  
10 attention.

11 CHAIR FORNACIARI: I'm sorry, who is?

12 Oh, you're in charge --

13 VICE CHAIR KENNEDY: I was.

14 CHAIR FORNACIARI: But you're in charge of the  
15 speaker so you can speak when you want.

16 VICE CHAIR KENNEDY: I mean, I'm okay with it as it  
17 like it is. And particularly since people do have the  
18 pass option and I, you know, I don't see awkwardness in  
19 the pass option. But another option if we did want  
20 something else is that, we start with the person after  
21 the Chair so that the Chair always votes last.

22 CHAIR FORNACIARI: That would definitely rotate it  
23 around.

24 Do you want to comment, Commissioner Andersen?

25 COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: Yes. Now, let's say

1 Commissioner Yee, who is at the bottom and always has to  
2 go last, I'd like to hear from him. Because, you know,  
3 being an A all my life, you know, you're ready. Like,  
4 oh, my God, I've got to come up with an answer. No  
5 matter, you know, they're going to call on me. And so  
6 you're kind of already attuned to that, in terms of that  
7 stress.

8 In terms of it being -- is it not being fair, if  
9 that's the issue, then let's hear from people who are  
10 lower in the alphabet to see. But otherwise, you know,  
11 does it really matter? You know, just stick one way, and  
12 then we're done. Let's -- next, essentially, you know?  
13 Next item. So let's hear from Commissioner Yee.

14 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Commissioner Yee?

15 COMMISSIONER YEE: I'm getting called on today. It  
16 matters to me. I mean, you get a sense of how the votes  
17 going, which is you know, if you're later, that's  
18 something you get that others don't. But that doesn't  
19 seem to matter to everyone equally either. I like it but  
20 you know, very happy to share the blessings of that.

21 And I mean, pretty sure Kennedy's proposition would  
22 be probably the easiest to implement and would ensure,  
23 you know, circling around fully, whereas to just go down  
24 to up, up to down, you know, then everyone in the middle  
25 is always in the middle. But don't feel strongly about

1 it, yeah. But yeah, I feel that it does give me a slight  
2 advantage of knowing how the wind is blowing.

3 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Dose anyone with the letter V in  
4 their last name have a comment?

5 Commissioner Vasquez?

6 COMMISSIONER VASQUEZ: Yeah. I like being last in  
7 this case. It drove me nuts in school when I always had  
8 the right answer. But yeah, I like it. And so I would  
9 be happy for others to experience that. I rarely  
10 experience the Commissioner Andersen and Ahmed problem of  
11 getting called on first. And I do think Commissioner  
12 Kennedy's proposal would be the easiest to implement if  
13 we wanted to do something different.

14 So yeah, I think trying to make it easy and not  
15 particular challenging for whomever is calling the roll  
16 is also a priority. Because I don't think this that much  
17 of an issue whichever way we go.

18 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Okay. Well, how would you guys  
19 feel about -- let's try Commissioner Kennedy's suggestion  
20 and if we feel like we need to do something different  
21 down the road, we can revisit it; is that okay?

22 Okay. And we'll add that to the list. Beautiful.

23 I don't know that this next part is controversial.  
24 I just want to kind of capture it. I just thought it was  
25 important that we -- because we had a few times where

1 we -- the break we had to take was right in the middle of  
2 our speakers. And today, we went long and you know,  
3 didn't have a choice. But you know, I'd like to see if  
4 we can try to sync up our breaks with our speakers.

5 Commissioner Fernandez?

6 I'm sorry. Commissioner Kennedy, I'm stepping all  
7 over you.

8 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Oh, it's fine, yes.

9 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Are you -- okay, go ahead.

10 VICE CHAIR KENNEDY: I'm just a spotter. He called  
11 on you more than letting me talk.

12 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: No. I do like that number  
13 2 and that's what Commissioner Akutagawa and I have been  
14 working with. So we were trying, you know, plan out when  
15 the breaks would be so that they're going to make a 15  
16 minute beforehand. And I think that's a really good idea  
17 because it, you know, they are going out of their way to  
18 come to speak to us. I appreciate you putting that in  
19 there.

20 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Commissioner Le Mons?

21 COMMISSIONER LE MONS: I just wanted to say that I  
22 support that as well. And Commissioner Kennedy and I's  
23 discussion about planning the upcoming agenda, we talked  
24 about the importance of having them come so that they're  
25 not in the middle of breaks and things like that. So I

1 think that it's respectful. At least it's thought  
2 through, you know, in the front end. Sometimes we will  
3 go a little over, whatever. But if we're thinking about  
4 it, we'll minimize that kind of disruption or having them  
5 just waiting.

6 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Okay. I don't think it's  
7 controversial or anything. So I just propose that we  
8 move on. Okay.

9 All right. So this is where I've kind of captured  
10 some ideas that I heard from the fellow Commissioner on  
11 kind of have managed discussion. You know, again, I  
12 certainly don't want to -- it's important that everyone  
13 is heard. I'm not sure how everyone kind of feels about  
14 these ideas or not. But I want to kind of throw it out  
15 there because it's come up and some folks have suggested  
16 some ideas.

17 So thought we could just go by and through them one  
18 at a time. So I think this was -- one was from  
19 Commissioner Kennedy the other day. Although, this  
20 meeting we kind of plowed through the subcommittee  
21 reports. I think that was partly due to the fact that it  
22 was two days, you know, we had two days between meetings.  
23 So nothing really happened.

24 Now, that we're going to be having two weeks between  
25 meetings, you know, this might be valuable. I think it

1 just helps folks really focus on what's important. But  
2 you know, again, I don't want to be in a place where  
3 we're limiting -- people feel like they're limited.

4 So Commissioner Kennedy and Fernandez?

5 VICE CHAIR KENNEDY: Yeah. I mean, just to say that  
6 at five minutes per and we -- I think I counted. We  
7 actually have thirteen but we'll soon have twelve once we  
8 are finished with the Deputy Executive Director  
9 subcommittee. But twelve subcommittees at five minutes  
10 each, that's an hour.

11 And you know, for the foreseeable future, the  
12 Lessons Learned subcommittee isn't going to have much to  
13 say, other than, keep the lessons learned coming. You  
14 know, others will have more. But you know, I think once  
15 we spend -- if we need to spend more than hour on  
16 subcommittee reports, people need to let the Chair know  
17 that they're going to need additional time.

18 It's not necessarily or I wasn't necessarily  
19 proposing that only those subcommittees requiring a vote  
20 on something would need to schedule additional time. My  
21 idea was that anybody who needs more than five minutes  
22 should, you know, just let us know whether there's a vote  
23 involved or not.

24 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Yeah. Okay, thank you.

25 I have something to say after, I think Fernandez,

1 who's going to go and then, Sinay.

2 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Yes. I'd to visit them.  
3 It makes it easier to determine how many items you can  
4 have. Also, maybe if we just -- I just looked down,  
5 sorry -- if we just change it to stay along that kind of  
6 five minute, unless approval of an action item is  
7 required? Is that what you meant, like unless approval  
8 of an action item is required?

9 VICE CHAIR KENNEDY: No. I think any subcommittees  
10 that feels like it's important to have a discussion on a  
11 subject, that it's going to last more than five minutes,  
12 have that opportunity. But I would propose that we  
13 schedule those separate from subcommittee reports.

14 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Oh, I see.

15 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Oh, okay.

16 VICE CHAIR KENNEDY: Discreet items.

17 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Okay.

18 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: I just want to run it out  
19 there. I like the way they did it in this agenda, where  
20 if it was -- an approval was like on the policies and  
21 procedures, that it was discussed then, instead of making  
22 it a separate action item. I don't know.

23 CHAIR FORNACIARI: I'm just writing it down. It's  
24 not etched in stone or not.

25 COMMISSIONER SINAY: Is it okay if I go?

1 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Yeah. I don't really like the  
2 way I'm facilitating this discussion. But yes, you can  
3 go on.

4 COMMISSIONER SINAY: You're doing fine.

5 CHAIR FORNACIARI: No, I'm not.

6 Go ahead, Commissioner Sinay.

7 COMMISSIONER SINAY: I just want to remind us that  
8 this is the area that is our flexible area and it's  
9 actually where we do the most work. And the reason we  
10 set up the agenda this way is so that we could bring  
11 things that we might have been able to -- we didn't know  
12 two weeks ahead of time.

13 So my concern is, I think people have really,  
14 actually managed this piece really well. And that just  
15 said, okay, we have nothing, or we'll talk about it. I  
16 haven't seen this be the area where we have the most  
17 problems. And I do see, as we were talking on Wednesday,  
18 there is a lot of intersection between the subcommittees.

19 And so this is a time to actually to have some of  
20 those intersection conversations. And I would, you know,  
21 it would great for us to bring up those, you know --  
22 think about, hey, we're thinking about this but we know  
23 that it's part of over here. So to me, this is the heart  
24 of our work, is what all the subcommittees are doing.

25 And this is when the committees -- subcommittees get

1 to bring it to the full commission, and get a little bit  
2 of input or a lot of input, and take it back, work on it  
3 a little more. So I would -- I'm kind of opposed to  
4 putting that time limit on it.

5 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Okay.

6 VICE CHAIR KENNEDY: The intent is not to limit it.  
7 The intent is to facilitate the Chair in building the  
8 agenda knowing how much time is going to be needed. So  
9 let me rephrase this and say, not schedule it as a  
10 separate item. But if a subcommittee needs more than  
11 five minutes, I think it's important for the Chair of the  
12 meeting to know beforehand, while the agenda is being put  
13 together so that, you know, it can be planned  
14 accordingly.

15 CHAIR FORNACIARI: So are you --

16 VICE CHAIR KENNEDY: May I -- okay.

17 CHAIR FORNACIARI: So can I follow up with  
18 Commissioner Sinay, first?

19 VICE CHAIR KENNEDY: Yes.

20 CHAIR FORNACIARI: So are you thinking that -- so I  
21 could envision that you might be thinking that there's a,  
22 you know, we're having a cross conversation with two  
23 committees that have intersecting responsibilities and we  
24 don't know that it's going to be an extra time that we're  
25 going to need to do that or not? Okay, yeah. I can see

1 that.

2 Marian?

3 MS. JOHNSTON: The reason for having the agenda with  
4 the notice requirements is to give the public advance  
5 notice of what's going to be discussed. And if it's just  
6 a comment update from whatever committee, that really  
7 doesn't give much notice. If it's just a brief  
8 announcement, that's fine. But if you're going to be  
9 having a substantive discussion or anything, that topic  
10 really needs to be identified in the agenda to give the  
11 public notice.

12 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Okay. All right. So what I  
13 don't like about the way I'm facilitating this  
14 conversation is I said, this is just my list. And then,  
15 I'm going through my list. I haven't left space for  
16 anybody to provide kind of input on this and, you know,  
17 and thoughts on this. And I don't think that's a very  
18 good idea.

19 And I saw Commissioner Andersen and then,  
20 Commissioner Vasquez, and I don't think -- I don't know  
21 who had their hand up first.

22 COMMISSIONER VASQUEZ: Go ahead, Commissioner  
23 Andersen.

24 COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: Okay. I can't actually see  
25 you because of the shared screen. So I apologize. I was

1 just going to say, the way Commissioner Kennedy is  
2 describing it is basically, it's a time -- assume five  
3 minutes per subcommittee report. And if deeper  
4 discussions are warranted, please notify a Chair.

5       And you know how we've been putting a little bullet  
6 under? And it says something as simple as, you know --  
7 where is one of them -- you know, report on, or potential  
8 approval of, or action, maybe, or it could be something  
9 else. But it's generally five minutes because I totally  
10 agree with Commissioner Sinay, that usually like in a  
11 case, I actually did that specifically.

12       I connected with other subcommittees. So I think it  
13 was very fruitful. But I did have a bullet, like a  
14 little bullet below my item, thinking it's going to be  
15 more than five minutes. And that sort of incorporated  
16 different ideas. And I think the -- sometimes it might  
17 go seven, eight because you know, something happened and  
18 people wanted to talk about it a little longer.

19       I think that's okay because several items, as  
20 Commissioner Kennedy just said, usually say Lessons  
21 Learned said the idea is coming. Great, next. So I  
22 think it allows for -- the idea here is, we know it's  
23 about an hour. And if we have bullets, it's going to be  
24 more than an hour.

25       And so it's the idea of the Chair can come up with

1 what they think. So then, I think in terms of typing up  
2 the actual wording here, that's slowing us down. Maybe  
3 we could just sort of say, unless, Commissioner  
4 Fornaciari, you're okay with the way this is happening  
5 but I think you're not.

6 So I would sort of recommend let's have a quick  
7 discussion. Well, we can't really come back with -- and  
8 then, can we come back with this on next meeting, in  
9 terms of just then approving everything? Or if that's  
10 too long, we can continue. But --

11 CHAIR FORNACIARI: No. This is obviously a much  
12 longer than we have time for at this time. And again, I  
13 mean, I don't to want to ram my thoughts down the  
14 Commissions' throats. You know, I'd like to provide an  
15 opportunity for folks to maybe think about this a little  
16 more and provide their thoughts, if they're so inclined.  
17 I mean, we're not going to have time to get through this  
18 today, you know? We're just not. And so you know, I  
19 think we made a good start here. But I would just  
20 suggest at this point, since we're, you know, just a few  
21 minutes before 4:30 anyway, that we table this at this  
22 point and add it to, you know, a future agenda.

23 Commissioner Fernandez -- I am sorry. Commissioner  
24 Vasquez and then Commissioner Fernandez.

25 COMMISSIONER VASQUEZ: I was actually just going to

1 actually offer that we do that, Commissioner Fornaciari,  
2 because I do think this is a larger conversation. And  
3 I'll just say, my impression of this managing discussion,  
4 I think I'm of sort -- I'm of the mind of that we -- I  
5 would like to allow the space for the Chairs to  
6 facilitate and manage the discussion how they see fit.

7 That's sort of the Chair's prerogative. And I think  
8 that's also part of why we should continue to rotate the  
9 Chairship. Because some of us like the discussion, and  
10 the style, and how we feel most -- discussions are most  
11 productive, or when they're sort of -- they develop  
12 organically.

13 Some have a more structured facilitation style and  
14 some want to make to make sure a thread of conversation  
15 gets closed out before we open a new one. And then,  
16 there are others who are going to be very, you know,  
17 business like. And we're going to give this discussion  
18 twenty minutes and everyone's going to have a chance to  
19 do a round robin.

20 And then, we're going to vote and we're going to  
21 move on, right? And so I don't know. Maybe this is the  
22 notion that facilitation is an art. And so we should let  
23 each Chair define and discover what works best for them.  
24 And we're all going to have preferences and opinions.  
25 And we're going to like people's styles better than

1 others.

2 But I'm comfortable with that ride. Because we're  
3 going to have moments where we're uncomfortable and where  
4 we're jiving. So -- where we're like in alignment with  
5 other people's style. So I think we should --

6 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Okay.

7 COMMISSIONER VASQUEZ: -- allow space for that.

8 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Okay. And then -- thank you for  
9 that.

10 And then, Commissioner Fernandez?

11 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: At the end of today, I  
12 appreciate (indiscernible) --

13 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Put your --

14 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: I'm sorry.  
15 (Indiscernible).

16 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Look right at us.

17 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Okay. I like having ground  
18 rules. I like the business model of it. And what I was  
19 going to suggest is because it is a lengthy document, if  
20 we could all maybe go back, look at it, and then maybe  
21 provide you with feedback.

22 That way when we come back, and if we choose to  
23 discuss it again, at least it's not the first time that  
24 we're really looking at it per se, that it would include  
25 everybody's opinions, instead of going through and having

1 everybody give their separate opinion. I don't know,  
2 just trying to think of a more efficient, effective way  
3 of doing this.

4 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Yes, Commissioner Vasquez?

5 VICE CHAIR KENNEDY: Commissioner Yee?

6 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Oh, Yee?

7 COMMISSIONER VASQUEZ: Yeah. Commissioner --

8 VICE CHAIR KENNEDY: Yeah, Yee had his hand up a  
9 while ago.

10 COMMISSIONER VASQUEZ: A while ago, yeah. I do  
11 remember that.

12 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Commissioner Yee?

13 COMMISSIONER YEE: I'll pass.

14 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Commissioner Vasquez?

15 COMMISSIONER VASQUEZ: I agree with Commissioner  
16 Fernandez. Although, I will say for our ground rules, I  
17 like a lot of what is here. But what I have found works  
18 best for groups, is if we start with a blank sheet of  
19 paper, we can all refer to these, and put what we want.  
20 But I do think, particularly, the ground rules, it  
21 really -- there is something to be said about starting  
22 with a blank paper and having people put, you know, make  
23 suggestions with a blank slate for these particular  
24 things. And so that --

25 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Right.

1           COMMISSIONER VASQUEZ:  -- feels like a discussion we  
2 should make space for.

3           CHAIR FORNACIARI:  So what I was thinking of doing  
4 in that case, although, I won't be the Chair at that time  
5 but I could still lead it or whatever, was getting that  
6 Post-it board with Nero.  And just have everybody write  
7 five of them or something.  Because -- yeah, I mean,  
8 something like that, we have to own it, right?  We can't  
9 just adopt another list.

10           And I just, frankly, I'll just tell you.  I've  
11 plagiarized this list from two years of grand juries.  So  
12 it just was ideas.  But I agree a hundred percent.  This  
13 is something we need to develop and own ourselves.  But I  
14 thought it would be kind of more interactive and more  
15 kind of interesting maybe if we did the post note thing.

16           And then, we can do -- there's a voting option  
17 there.  And you can pick the ones you like, and we can  
18 kind of narrow it down that way, and do something more  
19 like we would be doing if we were all sitting in the same  
20 room.  So okay, I appreciate that.

21           So -- yeah, send me your feedback on this and  
22 thoughts.  And I'll continue to sort of mull it over.  
23 And we'll bring this back probably meeting after next,  
24 unfortunately, at this point.

25           So at this point, unless there are other

1 comments -- oh, Commissioner Le Mons?

2 COMMISSIONER LE MONS: Is it possible to segregate  
3 out the managing discussion portion and just adopt the  
4 stuff that we went over earlier so that that doesn't have  
5 to wait a couple weeks to be --

6 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Yeah, yeah. We can definitely do  
7 that.

8 COMMISSIONER LE MONS: -- implemented?

9 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Yeah, yeah. I was -- yeah, great  
10 idea.

11 Okay. I kind of felt like as we went along, we've  
12 adopted these things. So I was going to write them up,  
13 capture them in a document -- stand-alone document. And  
14 then, I was thinking we're going to work the rest.

15 Is that good, Commissioner Le Mons?

16 COMMISSIONER LE MONS: I guess, the part that  
17 confused me is, you said that we'd see this probably in a  
18 couple weeks. So like not the next meeting but the next  
19 meeting. So I didn't understand what -- I'm confused  
20 now.

21 CHAIR FORNACIARI: So --

22 COMMISSIONER LE MONS: Because if we've adopted the  
23 other things, then why do we have to wait for two more  
24 meetings to whatever that is you're describing as a  
25 process to put it forward, when it sounds like the

1 managing discussion portion is the portion is requiring  
2 additional -- and think, number 5 earlier are requiring  
3 additional discussion.

4       So I would think that we are agreeing to adopt it  
5 now and it's effective next meeting. That would be my  
6 thought. So that's why I'm confused because you said,  
7 you'll work on it, except ideas, and then you'll bring it  
8 back, not next meeting but the next meeting. So that  
9 just says to me that this won't get revisited for a  
10 couple meetings. I could have just misunderstood.

11       CHAIR FORNACIARI: So yeah, I kind of felt like the  
12 parts that we've already agreed to above, that we agreed  
13 to that. I felt like the managing discussions part and  
14 the ground rules part, we haven't talked about, and that  
15 we would talk about those two parts in a later meeting.  
16 That's what I meant.

17       Does that make sense?

18       COMMISSIONER LE MONS: Yes. So is there going to be  
19 some distribution under there with some edits earlier.

20       CHAIR FORNACIARI: Right.

21       COMMISSIONER LE MONS: This is like a working  
22 document. So I guess, is that part going to be  
23 segregated out and distributed to us?

24       CHAIR FORNACIARI: Yes.

25       COMMISSIONER LE MONS: And then we know -- so that

1 was the part that I didn't understand before.

2 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Yeah, I'm sorry. Yeah, I wasn't  
3 clear. Okay, yes. Okay. All right, great. Thanks  
4 everyone.

5 Jesse, can you read the directions for general  
6 public comment, please?

7 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: In order to --

8 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Did you have something  
9 Commissioner Ahmad?

10 Okay.

11 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: In order to maximize  
12 transparency and public participation in our process, the  
13 Commissioners will be talking public comment by phone.  
14 To call in, dial the telephone number provided on the  
15 live stream feed. The telephone number is 877-853-5247.

16 When prompted, enter the meeting ID number provided  
17 on the live stream feed. It is 93489457215, for this  
18 week's meeting. When prompted to enter a participant ID,  
19 simply press pound . Once you have dialed in, you'll be  
20 placed in a queue, from which a moderator will begin  
21 unmuting callers to submit their comment.

22 You will also hear an automated message to press  
23 star 9. Please do this to raise your hand indicating you  
24 wish to comment. When it is your turn to speak, the  
25 moderator will unmute you and you'll hear an automated

1 message that says, the host would like you to talk, and  
2 press start star 6 to speak. Please make sure to mute  
3 your computer or live stream audio to prevent any  
4 feedback or distortion during your call.

5       Once you are waiting in the queue, be alert when it  
6 is your turn to speak. And again, please turn down the  
7 live stream volume. These instructions are also located  
8 on the website. The Commission is taking general public  
9 comment at this time.

10       CHAIR FORNACIARI: Thanks for that.

11       We will -- sorry, my dog is having a something. I  
12 don't know. Anyway, we'll wait till the instructions are  
13 done then, wait a minute or so.

14       COMMISSIONER VASQUEZ: Chair?

15       CHAIR FORNACIARI: Yes, Commissioner Vasquez?

16       COMMISSIONER VASQUEZ: While we're waiting and in  
17 the spirit of our wonderful presentations today, and for  
18 transparency with the public, you may have seen me here  
19 in this meeting and also in previous meetings, I'm doing  
20 a lot of rubbing of my head and rolling, you know,  
21 rolling my neck. And that this merely a hundred percent  
22 because of some neurological and painful conditions I've  
23 developed from COVID. And so as our speaker said, most  
24 folk -- many folks don't acknowledge or aren't forthright  
25 about their disability. And I've been -- I think I've

1 been pushing myself to be more appearing of normal, but  
2 my pain is coming through. And my challenges on my  
3 nervous system are coming through. And I think again, in  
4 the spirit of being transparent both for the public, it is  
5 not a manifestation of my emotional state or how I'm  
6 responding to a discussion. It is just that being on  
7 Zoom is -- it can be physically painful and  
8 physiologically really stressful on my body. And so I  
9 actually may -- it means that I should probably be more  
10 mindful of my own stress level, and will probably be more  
11 off camera if there are discussions I'm not trying to  
12 actively participate in. Because laying down actually  
13 eases a lot of my symptoms. So spending all day upright  
14 is also especially challenging for me. So just as a flag  
15 for my colleagues and for the public, that is often what  
16 is happening is that, I'm just in a lot of pain and  
17 physiologically run down.

18 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Thanks, Angela for sharing that.  
19 I appreciate it. And, you know, sorry about your pain.  
20 That's not fun. Well, I'll just share too, since you  
21 shared.

22 I keep doing this because I'm trying to take the  
23 weight -- I'm in a wheelchair. Most I guess, you guys  
24 all know that but maybe the public doesn't.

25 But taking the weight off just sitting here, you

1 know, for six hours a day really is a pain in the you  
2 know what. And so with that, thank you all for this  
3 meeting. And I appreciate it.

4 We have no callers in the queue. And so at this  
5 point, I'm going to adjourn this meeting and we will be  
6 together -- who's --

7 VICE CHAIR KENNEDY: Commissioner Sinay had her hand  
8 up.

9 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Oh, I'm sorry. I didn't see.

10 COMMISSIONER SINAY: Oh, I just wanted to check in  
11 on Commissioner Toledo because we haven't heard a peep  
12 from him today.

13 COMMISSIONER TOLEDO: No. I'm just --

14 COMMISSIONER SINAY: I'm just calling people out.

15 COMMISSIONER TOLEDO: I've just been having little  
16 migraine the last couple of days so.

17 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Oh. Well, sorry about that.

18 COMMISSIONER TOLEDO: Oh, thank you.

19 COMMISSIONER SINAY: I'm sorry to hear that. But I  
20 just want you to know that we did see you.

21 COMMISSIONER TOLEDO: Thank you.

22 CHAIR FORNACIARI: Yes, yeah.

23 Okay. All right. Well, thank you all. And we'll  
24 call this meeting adjourned and see you all in a couple  
25 weeks.

1           And I'm sure we'll be talking in the meantime.

2           COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN:   Nice job, Chair.

3                       (Whereupon, the CRC Business Meeting adjourned  
4                       at 5:33 p.m.)

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

CERTIFICATE OF TRANSCRIBER

I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a correct transcript, to the best of my ability, of the videoconference recording of the proceedings provided by the California Citizens Redistricting Commission.



LORI RAHTES, CDLT-108

May 30, 2022

DATE