

STATE OF CALIFORNIA
CITIZENS REDISTRICTING COMMISSION (CRC)

In the matter of:
CRC BUSINESS MEETING

THURSDAY, JANUARY 28, 2021
9:30 a.m.

Transcription by:
eScribers, LLC



APPEARANCESCOMMISSIONERS

Derric Taylor, Chair
Pedro Toledo, Vice-Chair
Isra Ahmad, Commissioner
Linda Akutagawa, Commissioner
Jane Andersen, Commissioner
Alicia Fernandez, Commissioner
Neal Fornaciari, Commissioner
J. Kennedy, Commissioner
Antonio Le Mons, Chair
Sara Sadhwani, Commissioner
Patricia Sinay, Commissioner
Trena Turner, Commissioner
Angela Vazquez, Commissioner
Russell Yee, Commissioner

STAFF

Daniel Claypool, Executive Director
Kary Marshall, Chief Counsel
Marian Johnston, CRC Staff Counsel
Wanda Sheffield, Office Technician
Marcy Kaplan, Director of Outreach
Freddy Ceja, Communications Director
Cecilia Gomez Reyes, Outreach Manager

TECHNICAL CONTRACTORS

Kristian Manoff, AV Technical Director/Comment Moderator
Katy Manoff, Comment Moderator

Also PresentPUBLIC COMMENT

Renee Westa-Lusk
Maricela Morales, CAUSE
Moradon Viashin
Sophia
Vanessa Teran, MICOP
Mona
Hindia Pajedro
Moradon
Rahmo Abdi, PANA
Tahwali
Julie Marks, Asian Americans Advancing Justice
Hussein Imo
Karima Fura
Moradon

INDEX

	<u>PAGE</u>
Call to Order and Roll Call	4
Opening Public Comment	8
Outreach Plan and Materials	13
Language Access Recommendations	25
Public Comment	25
Language Access Motion Passes	70
Outreach Plan and Materials Continued	72
Data Management	76
Public Comment	116
Outreach Plan motion passes	120
Data Management motion passes	121
Future meeting dates & agenda items	121
Closing Public Comment	124

P R O C E E D I N G S

1
2 January 28, 2021 9:30 a.m.

3 CHAIR TAYLOR: Good morning, California. Good
4 morning, staff. Good morning, Commissioners. It is
5 9:30, January 28th. This is day 3 of the meeting that
6 began -- the meeting of the California Citizens
7 Redistricting Commission that began on January 26th.

8 My name is Derric Taylor. I'm your rotating chair,
9 along with Vice-Chair Pedro Toledo.

10 Ms. Sheffield, can you call the roll, please?

11 MS. SHEFFIELD: Yes. Commissioner Toledo?

12 VICE CHAIR TOLEDO: Here.

13 MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Turner?

14 COMMISSIONER TURNER: Good morning. Here.

15 MS. SHEFFIELD: Good morning.

16 Commissioner Vazquez?

17 COMMISSIONER VAZQUEZ: Here.

18 MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Yee?

19 COMMISSIONER YEE: Here.

20 MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Ahmad?

21 COMMISSIONER AHMAD: Here.

22 MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Akutagawa?

23 COMMISSIONER AKUTAGAWA: Here.

24 MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Andersen?

25 COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: Here.

1 MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Fernandez?

2 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Here.

3 MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Fornaciari?

4 COMMISSIONER FORNACIARI: Here.

5 MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Kennedy?

6 COMMISSIONER KENNEDY: Here.

7 MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Le Mons? I see you.

8 Commissioner Sadhwani?

9 Commissioner Sinay?

10 COMMISSIONER SINAY: Here.

11 MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Taylor?

12 CHAIR TAYLOR: Present. Thank you.

13 To review and preview where we are on our agenda, we
14 still need to cover item 13, language access. That will
15 be covered specifically at 10:00 a.m. We also need to
16 cover item 14, which may have been addressed in the
17 subcommittee reports. Item 15, outreach plan and
18 materials. Item 16, data management. Item -- there is
19 no closed session for this group of meetings. Item 18,
20 discussion of future meeting dates. And we will conclude
21 with public comment.

22 So right now we will go directly to public comment.
23 Katy, if you can read the -- if you can invite our public
24 in, I'd appreciate it.

25 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Yes, good morning Chair.

1 In order to maximum transparency and public
2 participation in our process, the Commissioners will be
3 taking public comment by phone.

4 To call in, dial the telephone number provided on
5 the live stream feed. It is 877-853-5247. When prompted
6 to enter the meeting ID number provided on the live
7 stream feed 976-7934-9222, for this week's meeting. When
8 prompted to enter a participant ID, simply press the
9 pound key.

10 Once you have dialed in you will be placed in a
11 queue to indicate when you wish to comment. Please press
12 star 9. This will raise your hand for the moderator.
13 When it is your turn to speak, you will hear an automatic
14 message that says the host would like you to talk, and
15 press star 6 to speak.

16 If you would like to give your name, please state
17 and spell it for the record, but you are not required to
18 give your name to give public comment.

19 Please make sure to mute your computer or live
20 stream audio to prevent any feedback or distortion during
21 your call.

22 Once you are waiting in the queue, be alert for when
23 it is your turn to speak. And again, please turn down
24 the live stream volume.

25 The Commission is taking general public comment at

1 this time.

2 And we do not have anybody in the queue.

3 CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you. We'll give pause for a
4 few minutes so that everyone can catch up.

5 (Pause)

6 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: And we do have someone in
7 the queue.

8 CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you. Invite them in.

9 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: The floor is yours. If
10 you would like to state your name, please spell it for
11 the record.

12 MS. WESTA-LUSK: Yes, this is Renee Westa-Lusk,
13 R-E-N-E-E is the first name. Last name is W-E-S-T-A, and
14 then there's a hyphen, and then it's Lusk, L-U-S-K.

15 I sent an email Monday night, January 25th in follow
16 up to Commissioner Le Mons' request to have a
17 communications and engagement plan for outreach, just as
18 an example from a small rural community. And it was
19 about a little over a page. I could not upload it into
20 an attachment on the website, so I just typed it all in
21 the email. I just wanted to know if Commissioner Le Mons
22 received it, and I also addressed it to all Commissioners
23 at the top.

24 COMMISSIONER LE MONS: Should I respond?

25 CHAIR TAYLOR: Yes. At least respond to the receipt

1 of the email, if you're able to, Commissioner Le Mons.

2 COMMISSIONER LE MONS: I don't recall seeing it. I
3 will double-check. But as of -- I don't recall seeing
4 it. I have checked my email. But I will look now. I
5 think she said that was sent on Monday evening.

6 CHAIR TAYLOR: Yes, on the 25th.

7 COMMISSIONER LE MONS: Okay, I will double-check.

8 MS. WESTA-LUSK: Yeah, it was sent to the area that
9 you can send emails to the Commission.

10 COMMISSIONER LE MONS: Ah, so staff would have to
11 let us know whether that was received.

12 CHAIR TAYLOR: Ms. Westa-Lusk, we will look for that
13 email and we are working hard to address those concerns
14 that you expressed earlier regarding a form for
15 Commissioner speaker requests, and ability to attach
16 files and PDFs to our website, or the form email -- the
17 form on the website page. So thank you. So we are
18 addressing those concerns.

19 MS. WESTA-LUSK: Okay. If we need to contact the
20 Commissioners, the only way I know how to is that email
21 where it says "Contact Us" and you put your name, and
22 data, and all that, and then you just type out. Is that
23 the only way to contact the Commissioners?

24 CHAIR TAYLOR: My understanding that our contact
25 email address is also on the agenda.

1 Commissioner Sinay, do you have an answer?

2 COMMISSIONER SINAY: Well, I think right now,
3 because with outreach I'm more than willing to email me
4 directly, and that would be my first name dot my last
5 name at CRC.ca.gov. And we'll make sure to get it to
6 everybody. Or, you know, send it to staff. But I just
7 wanted to volunteer myself since I know it can be
8 frustrating.

9 MS. WESTA-LUSK: Okay, so your full first name,
10 patricia.sinay@CRC.ca.gov. Okay.

11 CHAIR TAYLOR: Yeah.

12 COMMISSIONER SINAY: Exactly.

13 MS. WESTA-LUSK: Okay, thank you.

14 COMMISSIONER LE MONS: Chair?

15 CHAIR TAYLOR: Yes, sir.

16 COMMISSIONER LE MONS: Yeah, I just wanted to
17 respond to that. Thank you, Commissioner Sinay. I do
18 think it would have been more appropriate for staff to
19 let the caller know how to send information, particularly
20 if it was something that was addressed to me. To have
21 Commissioner Sinay step up to say to send it to her
22 directly, I'm not quite sure I understand what that
23 thinking was about.

24 So I think we need to have -- whatever is going to
25 be the way that we have people respond to us, it should

1 be clear to all of us how that works. And the staff, or
2 whomever, the executive director, our communications
3 director, I think one of those individuals should have
4 stepped up and let the caller know how to talk to us.

5 So this is nothing against you, Commissioner Sinay,
6 but I think you just filled in the silence and there
7 shouldn't have been any silence. So I wanted to say
8 that, that that's why we have a communications director.
9 And if we have these methods by which the public wants to
10 reach us, then we should do that.

11 And I didn't think that while they can email us
12 directly, I didn't think that that was really -- I
13 thought we wanted our staff really keeping track of our
14 communications and all of that. So I'd like to be clear
15 on how we're going to handle communication from the
16 public.

17 CHAIR TAYLOR: Director Ceja, do we have a response
18 to that?

19 Mr. Claypool?

20 DIRECTOR CLAYPOOL: Yes. And I apologize, I didn't
21 think Mr. Le Mons that there was a silence as much as
22 that I'd already saw that Commissioner Sinay had her hand
23 up. And so I was waiting to say that we should flag that
24 in the info mailbox that is on our website.

25 I'd like to also say that we generally respond to

1 anyone that -- or not generally, we respond to everyone
2 that sends in an email to us. And we will run that email
3 down from Ms. Lusk and then we will respond to it, and
4 make sure that it moves forward to you. So that's it.

5 CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you. And I'm also looking at
6 our agenda, on page 1 of the agenda it does state:

7 Written comments may be submitted by the Commission's
8 website at wedrawthelines.ca.gov/contact public comment.

9 So it is listed how to contact us on the front page
10 of the agenda.

11 Commissioner Kennedy?

12 COMMISSIONER KENNEDY: I think that the more
13 important is what follows that immediately: Or emailed
14 directly to info@crc.ca.gov. If someone wants to send an
15 email, and particularly an email including an attachment
16 that is where to send it, and that is listed on the
17 agenda. And as soon as the new website is up and running
18 there will be a better way to submit it through the
19 website. But the instructions for sending comment by
20 email do work and we trust that staff will be -- will
21 continue to monitor that info@crc.ca.gov mailbox and
22 distribute anything that needs to be distributed to
23 Commissioners. Thank you.

24 CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you.

25 Commissioner Sinay -- Sadhwani.

1 COMMISSIONER SADHWANI: Thanks. Just for clarity,
2 who's checking that email box? Is that communications or
3 is that -- it used to be Raul. I don't know who's
4 responsible for that at this point in time.

5 CHAIR TAYLOR: Director Claypool?

6 DIRECTOR CLAYPOOL: So we're in the middle of the
7 transition. I would assume it is still Raul, but I'm
8 writing that email right now and I will respond to Ms.
9 Westa-Lusk today, personally, and we will set up -- we
10 will set up a system so that we can make sure she can
11 upload her documents and she'll have a direct line.

12 CHAIR TAYLOR: All righty, thank you. Katy, do we
13 have anyone else in the queue?

14 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: No, Chair, that was it.

15 CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you. Seeing no one else in the
16 queue, we will move to our next agenda and close public
17 comment.

18 All right, agenda item number 13 is behind held
19 until 10:00. So that puts us at agenda item 14 and it's
20 my understanding that's probably covered in the
21 subcommittee reports, unless Commissioners Vazquez and
22 Sinay have a different opinion.

23 COMMISSIONER VAZQUEZ: No.

24 CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you. That moves us to agenda
25 item number 15, Outreach Plan and Materials.

1 Commissioner Fernandez and Commissioner Kennedy. And
2 we'll be on this agenda item until we begin the
3 conversation at 10:00 a.m. regarding language access, if
4 it's not completed.

5 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Okay, thank you. So from
6 the last meeting, and Commissioner Sadhwani was still
7 part of this process, what we did is we went back and we
8 looked at all the comments we received not only from the
9 Commissioners, but also from public comment. And we made
10 some changes on the video.

11 And then we have received some recent feedback from
12 Commissioners and obviously, we haven't had time to make
13 any changes or discuss those recommendations.

14 Before I get started, I do want to thank our Deputy
15 Executive Director Hernandez, Communications Director
16 Ceja, and Communications Manager Gomez Reyes, they've
17 just been very helpful and just great in terms of
18 updating the information, and providing feedback. So
19 thank you so much.

20 And then one thing, I just wanted to make a
21 clarification. One comment that was made last time is we
22 wanted a short video and a long video, given the length
23 of time that we would have. And so what we came up with
24 is we came up with a long video that would be about
25 thirty minutes long. And that we felt would be

1 sufficient time to keep the audience engaged, as well as
2 allow sufficient time for questions, in case you only had
3 an hour.

4 And so then what we did from that thirty minutes, we
5 cut some of the slides out to make it a fifteen-minute
6 video. And then, also we don't have the script because
7 we are making an assumption that there's going to be
8 other comments. So we felt once we agree on the video in
9 terms of the size we can go, you know, work our way
10 backwards and finalize the script.

11 And then also what we're going to have are some
12 collateral documents, the frequently asked questions, our
13 fact sheet, and also our flyer. Again, as we go through
14 that if there's any grammar type changes, please just
15 forward that to us. We just kind of want to make sure
16 that we have the information that we need to -- that's
17 appropriate to convey to the public.

18 And you know, I'm trying to think if there's
19 anything else. Commissioner Sadhwani, did you have
20 anything else to add before you hand it off to
21 Commissioner Kennedy?

22 COMMISSIONER SADHWANI: No, I think that's it. I
23 think you covered everything. And I just wanted to say
24 I've so enjoyed working with you. I think it's been
25 wonderful and my apologies for stepping back. But I

1 think Commissioner Kennedy is going to do a marvelous
2 job. I know his attention to detail will be impeccable.

3 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Yes. And the feeling is
4 mutual.

5 So I'm going to hand it over to Communications
6 Director Ceja, and we're going to walk through the long
7 video. Right?

8 DIRECTOR CEJA: Yes, we're going to go through the
9 PowerPoint presentation.

10 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Yes, I'm sorry, it's a
11 PowerPoint presentation. I keep saying video, but it's
12 PowerPoint.

13 DIRECTOR CEJA: I know. I was like we're not there,
14 yet, but we will be.

15 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: I know. I'm sorry, my mind
16 was kind of -- oh, that's okay we don't need to know
17 where my mind was.

18 DIRECTOR CEJA: Thank you so much. So talking about
19 the videos just shortly, we have retained the services
20 for a videographer so we will start producing some of
21 those in the following weeks. We have our first meeting
22 tomorrow.

23 I'm going to share my screen so that you all can
24 follow the presentation. So we have had different
25 iterations of this. This is not the first time we're

1 seeing this. We started with a general presentation that
2 was really basic, and then we had the idea from
3 Commissioners to create multiple PowerPoint
4 presentations, a fifty-minute, a thirty-minute, forty-
5 five, and an hour. But the committee decided that it was
6 best to do a long and a short version.

7 Today I'm going to present the long version because
8 I think Commissioner Kennedy has an idea that we should
9 do an even larger presentation than this, and then have
10 Commissioners pare it down as needed for their
11 presentations.

12 So I'll go through this. And then, at the end if
13 you have suggestions on what needs to be included in
14 here, we'll have that conversation and any additional
15 changes.

16 But like Commissioner Fernandez said, if it's
17 wordsmithing or typos, just email us and we'll make the
18 changes.

19 So on this page if you look here, if you look at the
20 pictures you'll see that it's a little more diverse. We
21 did try to get an agricultural worker in there, a person
22 wearing a ceremonial headdress or a scarf, and then
23 various other individuals that represent, really,
24 California, keeping in mind the gender balance as well.

25 We changed the title to California Redistricting

1 Basics, no longer the 101 title we were using.

2 When we talk about what is redistricting, we wanted
3 to have a very basic definition. We did have different
4 suggestions from legal to change the wording, but the
5 committee decided that this was -- it was good as is.
6 And we did include Commissioner Taylor's design here to
7 explain what we are doing. We're going from Census to
8 redistricting, and then to vote in 2022. So that's
9 really the bulk of the work that we're doing here.

10 The third slide -- let my computer catch up here.
11 The third slide is really explaining the differences in
12 redistricting efforts throughout the state because we
13 want to delineate that we are really in charge of the
14 state redistricting process, but at the same time we will
15 have county redistricting processes, city redistricting
16 processes, and school districts. And if you look at the
17 numbers here, this is going to become very confusing to
18 the common resident in California to know that there's
19 four different -- or there are four different
20 redistricting efforts going on at the same time, with 58
21 counties, 482 cities, and 977 school districts.

22 So at every opportunity we have throughout this
23 presentation, we will be explaining that we are in charge
24 of the top level, the state, which will be charged with
25 congressional Board of Equalization, Senate and Assembly

1 districts redrawing.

2 The next slide really talks about why independent
3 redistricting matters. We have used examples of other
4 states. In 2012, Pennsylvania, the Democrats receives 51
5 percent of the vote for congress, but won only five of
6 its 18 seats. And it's really talking about
7 gerrymandering, without necessarily spelling out
8 gerrymandering on the slide, but we can work that into
9 the narrative to let people know why this process has
10 developed.

11 And in 2016, Maryland Republicans received 37
12 percent of the votes for congress, but won only one of
13 its 8 congressional seats.

14 And in California, from 2002 to 2010, only one
15 California congressional seat changed parties and only
16 two incumbents lost in all 253 races, which means people
17 are keeping their seats and not making it competitive.

18 The graphic here illustrates if you had, in a state,
19 sixty percent blue which is traditionally Democrat, and
20 forty percent red, these are two different ways to split
21 it up so that blue wins, and another way for red to win.
22 And it's just, again, illustrating the different ways
23 that we can divide up a district so that it gives one
24 party a competitive advantage over the other.

25 Redistricting factors, we retitled this slide. It

1 talks about the Census and the fact that redistricting is
2 the next step after the Census. Reapportionment, when
3 the federal government reallocates the number of house
4 seats among states. And then, fair representation. The
5 fact that some communities have been left out on purpose,
6 and fair representation is really when you have
7 individuals who represent the community that they
8 represent.

9 The next slide talks about why we redraw district
10 maps. And of course, this is something that we had
11 prior. I did make changes to the little stick figures
12 here so that they're a little more diverse. It's not
13 just a male/female. Wanted to be very sensitive to that.
14 The fact that the diversity of the state is not just
15 geographically, but the people that live in California.

16 So people are born, they die, they move.
17 Communities grow in strength areas where there was once
18 roughly the same number of people become lopsided, so
19 communities change. And accordingly, we have to change
20 the districts that encompass these communities.

21 And then, going through the history. Prior to 2010,
22 Proposition 11 in 2008, the Voters First Act that gave
23 birth to this Commission and this process. Prop. 20, in
24 2010 that added congressional districts. The move from
25 Census to redistricting. The 2010 Commission, which was

1 the inaugural Commission. The 2020 Redistricting
2 Commission. And other states that have similar
3 processes, like Arizona, Colorado, Idaho, where
4 independent commissions draw the lines.

5 Then we walk through the Commissioner selection from
6 the application process to the number of people that
7 actually submitted, the people that were screened and
8 interviewed, the legislative strikes and that process,
9 the lottery giving you your first eight Commissioners,
10 and then the selection of the final six.

11 And who we are. We finally have a complete series
12 of pictures for all the Commissioners, so thank you so
13 much, Commissioner Andersen with an "e". We will not
14 make that mistake again.

15 We have your city where you come from and your
16 political party just to demonstrate that this is really
17 divided equally so that there's representation from
18 Republicans, Democrats, and no party preference.

19 Now, in previous conversations we talked about
20 actually demonstrating what a Board of Equalization, a
21 Congressional, a Senatorial and an Assembly district look
22 like to give people an idea of what we were really
23 drawing.

24 So we here talk about Commissioner duties, the
25 outreach and public input meetings, which is the heart

1 and the bulk of the work that we're going to be doing,
2 and then drawing the maps. The fact that you're going to
3 be drawing four maps, four different maps. Roughly
4 fifty-three for Congress, four Board of Equalization
5 maps, forty Senate, and eighty Assembly.

6 Outreach zones, we did change the -- oops -- we did
7 change the zones from numbers to letters. And so I redid
8 the map, relabeled it, and color coded the zone, county,
9 and Commissioners to align with the map itself.

10 Then, we went to line drawing criteria. So when
11 you're drawing maps what exactly, what lens are you
12 following? The Act spells it out very clearly. So I
13 wanted to make sure people knew what that was. And then,
14 the weight that we follow. So equal population, VRA,
15 contiguous districts, respecting the boundaries of
16 cities, counties, neighborhoods, and communities of
17 interest. Being geographically compact. And then
18 nesting districts.

19 And that's spelled out in this graphic here, which I
20 have made a one-paper, also for social media and our
21 website use that folks can share with community members.

22 Now, communities of interest, letting people know
23 what it is exactly. Shared experiences, shared
24 transportation facilities, living standards, work
25 opportunities, so here we actually give Commissioners an

1 opportunity to talk to the audience. And ask them, how
2 do you define your community? Let us know what
3 geographic boundaries or landmarks, really let us know
4 what your community is and what the boundaries are.

5 I did illustrate here different examples for
6 landmarks that you can find throughout California. I
7 added the mountains. I added the little mountain house,
8 the palm trees to represent the beach, and made other
9 changes. And again, made sure that these stick figures
10 here were not just the male/female, but were a little
11 more diverse.

12 We then move on to your voice. Why is it important
13 as a community member to get involved and your role in
14 the process? And we talk about historically
15 underrepresented communities being left out of the
16 process. And where elected officials were selecting what
17 communities they wanted to represent, as opposed to now
18 the communities choosing why they want their
19 representatives to be. So that is captured by the "Your
20 Voice is Your Choice" slogan there.

21 And again, participating in the process steps and
22 suggestions, familiarize yourself with the criteria and
23 the process, organize your community. And these were
24 taken from some of the literature from our community
25 partners. Clarify your goals. Testify at hearings. So

1 we need to go over how to do that, how to testify and
2 what information would be crucial and informative for the
3 Commissioners as they're drawing the lines. And advocate
4 for your community. If you don't define your community,
5 someone else will.

6 We then introduce the COI tool, "Draw My Community
7 Too". This is an actual snapshot of what the website
8 looks like. It was given to me by the Statewide
9 Database. And here, in addition to the map technology,
10 it provides the sample questions on the side, on the
11 left-hand side, where people will be able to add
12 narrative, describe their community, tell us about your
13 community and what shared interests you have. So we'll
14 dive deeper into that with the participants so that they
15 know what to expect when they jump onto this website.
16 That will be connected to our site as well.

17 And then, just to share a timeline so people know
18 what deadlines we're up against. This, of course, has
19 changed as of yesterday, when we had the conversation
20 with the latest news from the Census. So we're going to
21 have to change this accordingly. I do know that
22 education meetings will be ongoing according to
23 yesterday's conversation, again. So we'll make the
24 changes.

25 And we were very mindful to indicate that in June,

1 when we're doing the line drawing they're pre-maps, like
2 some of you suggested, hence to delineate the fact that
3 public input meetings in July through August we'll be
4 doing drawing sessions as well. But that will change
5 according to the updated chart hopefully we'll receive
6 from Commissioner Kennedy.

7 And then lastly, to request information sessions
8 contact the Commission. It has all our information, a
9 direct contact with Marcy who's taking the lead with
10 coordinated these meetings.

11 And then, finally, our social media handle so that
12 folks can follow along with our work as we go along.

13 And that's all I have. It's eighteen slides
14 currently, but of course it's open for additional
15 suggestions. And I think that's the input we'll be
16 taking now.

17 And I'll stop sharing so that you can see your
18 audience, Mr. Chair. There you go.

19 CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you, Director Ceja. So that
20 looks like a wonderful presentation. We will pause,
21 though, right here, before we go on to further discussion
22 regarding this item, and we're going to move to Language
23 Access Recommendation, as we stated we would. And then,
24 we will return to this agenda item.

25 So we're going to quickly pivot. So I'm going to

1 give the floor over to Commissioner Fernandez and
2 Commissioner Akutagawa. I think Commissioner Akutagawa
3 had to leave, so the floor will be solely to Commissioner
4 Fernandez, but I'm here to assist you as needed.

5 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Thank you, Chair Taylor.
6 I'm not going to take that as a sign of being abandoned,
7 but that's okay.

8 But before we do start, I do want to thank Executive
9 Director Claypool, Deputy Executive Director Hernandez,
10 Communications Director Ceja, and Outreach Manager
11 Kaplan, and obviously fellow Commissioner Akutagawa. We
12 spent many hours going back and forth, and coming up with
13 this outreach plan and recommendation. And we're
14 actually feeling very good about it. It's pretty open
15 and we feel that it will be inclusive. And we're going
16 to do as much as we can to provide interpreter services,
17 as needed.

18 And so at the last meeting we presented our
19 preliminary analysis and that document -- and I recommend
20 that if you have time, or if you haven't done so already
21 to go back to that document because it did have some very
22 good recommendations and considerations that were shared
23 by our panel members during the presentations in October,
24 November, December, and it's something that we can use as
25 we move forward into our education meetings, as well as

1 our input meetings.

2 And then for today, it was a three-page document and
3 it was on the website so hopefully, everyone's had a
4 chance to review that. And our goal is to move forward
5 with our language access in terms of contracting for
6 translation and interpreter services. Because as we all
7 know, the contracting process, it can take a while. It
8 can take -- but we're hoping that it's an interpreter and
9 language services is on a California Multiple Award
10 Schedule, a CMAS. So that does shorten the process, but
11 we would like to get something in place as soon as
12 possible.

13 And so what I'm going to do, I'm just going to go
14 straight into what our recommendations are as we've
15 already discussed what our process was last time. So
16 just let me just pivot over to recommendations really
17 quick.

18 And so last time what we used for our recommendation
19 was on the information from the Secretary of State on
20 elections and precincts. And so what we did is we went
21 back and we actually compared -- there's so many
22 different documents that talk about language access, but
23 the one thing that we did notice was that most, if not
24 all of them, the twelve non-English languages that will
25 be translated by our Communities of Interest tool was

1 also common in those other documents. And so with that,
2 that's how we're going forward.

3 Our recommendation is for translation services, so
4 that will be for written materials, and that we contract
5 for the same twelve non-English languages that will be
6 used in our Communities of Interest tools.

7 And those are Arabic, Armenian, Chinese, simplified
8 and traditional, Cambodian, Japanese, Korean, Persian,
9 Farsi, Punjabi, Russian, Spanish, Tagalog, and
10 Vietnamese.

11 And at this time our recommendation is to translate
12 our frequently asked document -- I mean, yeah, our
13 frequently asked questions, our flyers and our
14 factsheets, once we get those finalized, to have those
15 translated in the twelve non-English languages.

16 And then, also to translate the non-English language
17 inputs from the COI Tool into English, and that would be
18 for all languages.

19 And another recommendation is that we translate our
20 non-English written public comments and testimony
21 submitted to the Commission into English.

22 And in terms of our interpreter services for our
23 Commission input meetings, and this is a critical piece
24 that we want to make sure we communicate when we're
25 conducting our educational sessions, or even our meetings

1 is that if a request can be made to the Commission at
2 least five working days prior to a Commission meeting
3 that interpreter services will be needed, the Commission
4 staff will work to procure the interpreter services for
5 the twelve recommended non-English languages noted above.

6 And for those languages beyond the twelve that we've
7 noted above, again we ask for a five-business day advance
8 notice, and Commission staff will work within reason to
9 try and provide the requested interpreter services. And
10 if the Commission cannot or is unable to find a qualified
11 interpreter, then the Commission will work within reason
12 with the local communities and/or community-based
13 organizations to try and provide those interpreter
14 services.

15 And we did make a note here that we are not
16 specifically identifying American Sign Language because
17 we are required to provide that interpretation during our
18 meetings and we will continue to do so.

19 And in terms of other translated documents, the
20 Commission will continue to review the outreach materials
21 and we will determine whether or not some of those
22 documents or videos will be translated and if they are,
23 we'll report those out accordingly.

24 And again, the Commission, as last time, will work
25 and partner with community-based organizations, Tribal

1 leaders, Tribal organizations, ethnic media, and other
2 institutions who are trusted entities, messengers, and
3 communities across California to collaborate on our
4 outreach and engagement.

5 The development and distribution of culturally
6 appropriate and accessible in-language materials.
7 Independent review of translated documents to ensure
8 appropriateness of the translation and interpretation at
9 public meeting, depending on the languages spoken in that
10 area.

11 And so at this point our recommendation is to adopt
12 the recommendations or our actions -- the recommended
13 action is to adopt our recommendations and to also
14 contract for translation and interpreter services in the
15 non-English languages that I mentioned earlier, that are
16 similar to the COI tool languages. And that's it.

17 And yes, Commissioner Akutagawa and I spent many
18 hours, and I think it was -- was it Communications
19 Director Ceja talked about the things that, you know, he
20 thinks about when he can't sleep at night that's the
21 things we -- this is what we think about when we can't
22 sleep at night.

23 So we're very happy to bring this forward. We feel
24 that this is a recommendation that is very inclusive.
25 We're going to do our best to provide interpreter

1 services for all. No guarantees, but we're going to work
2 for -- we're going to work with our community-based
3 organizations and trusted leaders as much as possible, if
4 we cannot find interpreter services.

5 So I think with that we'll open it up.

6 CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you very much. I know you guys
7 worked hard on this subject matter, weighing all of the
8 factors. I appreciate the work.

9 Any questions or Comments from Commissioners?

10 Commissioner Kennedy?

11 COMMISSIONER KENNEDY: Thank you, Chair.

12 Commissioner Fernandez, I'm just wondering if in the --
13 in your discussions there was any discussion of producing
14 any of our materials in Braille. If not, I would propose
15 to speak to the Braille Institute out here in Rancho
16 Mirage, and get their sense of the extent to which there
17 might be a demand or need for any materials in Braille,
18 and report back at a future date. I've had contact with
19 the Braille Institute in the past when the organizing
20 election observation visits in Riverside County. So I'm
21 happy to contact them.

22 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Yeah, do you want me just
23 to respond to that?

24 CHAIR TAYLOR: You can respond, yes.

25 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Okay. Sorry. We did

1 discuss it, but of course at some point in time we really
2 have to like narrow down our focus. But I would
3 appreciate, actually all of us would appreciate if you
4 could do some further research, and that would be
5 separate from this discussion. But thank you very much.

6 CHAIR TAYLOR: Commissioner Vazquez?

7 COMMISSIONER VAZQUEZ: Yes, I think that's a great
8 idea to explore, Commissioner Kennedy. And I also maybe
9 in the interim since so much of our work is digital, I
10 know there are a lot of resources and folks willing to
11 sort of look at our website, look at our, in particular,
12 Instagram to make sure that we are captioning things for
13 screen readers. So folks who don't read Braille, but use
14 screen readers so that they can audio hear what is
15 written on their screen. So there are devices and apps
16 that folks use. So that would be at least a nice interim
17 thing to do so that we can make sure that our digital
18 efforts are accessible.

19 CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you.

20 Ms. Johnston?

21 MS. JOHNSTON: Yes, and I should have noted this
22 also a requirement of the ADA that websites be accessible
23 to screen readers. And I've talked with Fredy about that
24 and he's assured me that our materials will be --

25 CHAIR TAYLOR: Commissioner Kennedy?

1 COMMISSIONER KENNEDY: In fact, I would have been
2 participating in the Riverside County Voting
3 Accessibility Advisory Committee this morning, but the
4 meeting just started and we're otherwise occupied. But I
5 have reached out to the Riverside County VAAC to let them
6 know that I would like to engage with the members of the
7 VAAC on some of these questions.

8 CHAIR TAYLOR: Any other questions or comments from
9 Commissioners?

10 Commissioner Turner?

11 COMMISSIONER TURNER: Thank you, Chair. I may have
12 missed and I didn't want to lose the opportunity. When
13 we talk about working with the trusted messengers for
14 interpretation that's outside of what we're able to
15 provide, was there a provision there for stipends for
16 that interpretive service?

17 CHAIR TAYLOR: Commissioner Fernandez, do you have a
18 response?

19 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Yes, thank you Commissioner
20 Turner. So as a matter of fact the request was made five
21 days ago for interpreter services for our meeting today.
22 We were supposed to have a couple of calls. And so we
23 were able -- our Administrative Director Villanueva was
24 able to set up a contract with our interpreters.

25 COMMISSIONER TURNER: And I should have also said

1 translation.

2 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: I would hope that would be
3 the same in terms of if the -- yes, you're absolutely
4 correct. If it's not -- if it's beyond the twelve,
5 especially for the COI tool input and also any type of
6 written inputs --

7 COMMISSIONER TURNER: Yes.

8 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: -- I would expect it, but I
9 could defer to Executive Director Claypool.

10 COMMISSIONER TURNER: Okay great, thank you.

11 CHAIR TAYLOR: Commissioner Kennedy, did you have an
12 additional comment or question?

13 Any other comments or questions from Commissioners?

14 Commissioner Le Mons?

15 COMMISSIONER LE MONS: I have a question on a follow
16 up to Commissioner Turner's question. I know we had
17 talked about the distinction between interpretation and
18 translation, so I just wanted to understand I think more
19 clearly Commissioner Turner's question, because I also
20 thought that some of what the grant opportunities were
21 going to take care of that. So I think that was a budget
22 question and sort of how we're going to fiscally handle
23 those types of requests. So I'm not sure I fully
24 understood the question, Commissioner Turner, so.

25 COMMISSIONER TURNER: Yeah, I think you're going

1 down the right path. Right towards the end of the
2 presentation Commissioner Fernandez said about the
3 trusted messengers for translation, and left it there.
4 But I wanted to tie in for everyone that's listening, and
5 it's not just an assumption that the trusted messengers
6 would then fill gaps without any expectation of a stipend
7 or some budget that is something that we're looking for.

8 COMMISSIONER LE MONS: Thank you.

9 CHAIR TAYLOR: Director Claypool?

10 DIRECTOR CLAYPOOL: So in our discussions with the
11 Language Access Subcommittee we talked about that,
12 Commissioner Turner. And I believe that we're going
13 to -- I don't believe -- we are going to set aside funds
14 in the outreach budget to make sure that community-based
15 organizations or individuals who assist us can be
16 reimbursed for their expenses. We certainly want to make
17 sure -- they're helping us, we want to make sure we pay
18 them accordingly for carrying that load.

19 CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you. Commissioner Fernandez,
20 are you looking for a vote from the Commission today?

21 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Yes, I would like a -- I
22 guess I could make the motion. But yes, I'd like a vote
23 today so that we can move forward in order to procure
24 these services, translation and interpreter services. So
25 I guess I'll make the motion. Or maybe Commissioner Le

1 Mons would like to make that?

2 COMMISSIONER LE MONS: I'll also help you out there
3 and say I'd like to motion that we accept the proposal
4 from the Language Access Committee's recommendations.

5 COMMISSIONER SINAY: I second. Sinay.

6 CHAIR TAYLOR: Any further discussion?

7 All right, we'll move to public comment. Katy, can
8 you invite in the public, please?

9 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Yes, Chair.

10 In order to maximize transparency and public
11 participation in our process, the Commissioners will be
12 taking public comment by phone. To call in, dial the
13 telephone number provided on the live stream feed. It is
14 877-853-5247. When prompted to enter the meeting ID
15 number that is provided on the live stream feed, it is
16 976-7934-9222 for this week's meetings. When prompted to
17 enter a participant ID, simply press the pound key.

18 Once you have dialed in, you will be placed in the
19 queue. To indicate you wish to comment, please press
20 star 9. This will raise your hand for the moderator.
21 When it is your turn to speak, you will hear an automatic
22 message that says the host would like you to talk and to
23 press star 6 to speak.

24 If you would like to give your name, please state
25 and spell it for the record. You are not required to

1 provide your name to give public comment.

2 Please make sure to mute your computer or live
3 stream audio to prevent any feedback or distortion during
4 your call.

5 Once you are waiting in the queue, be alert for when
6 it is your turn to speak. And again, please turn down
7 the live stream volume.

8 The Commission has requested to make available
9 translators for Oromo and Somali speakers who wish to
10 provide public comment relating to today's agenda item
11 13, Language Access Recommendations. The Commission has
12 interpreters available. Callers wishing to use an
13 interpreter will simply need to say Oromo or Somali so
14 that the appropriate interpreter is ready.

15 We do have several people in the queue.

16 Chair, can you call on someone?

17 CHAIR TAYLOR: Yes, Commissioner Fernandez.

18 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: I'm sorry, I just wanted to
19 confirm are interpreters available, are they ready to go
20 and available? I just want to make sure we're set.

21 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Oh, okay, I'm going to
22 verify that right now.

23 CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you. And as soon as they're
24 available, Katy invite in our callers.

25 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: So we do have several

1 people in the queue. I did just want to make an
2 announcement. I hope that everybody in the queue can
3 understand me at this point. That if you would like to
4 comment, please press star 9 to raise your hand. And
5 we're verifying the interpreters.

6 CHAIR TAYLOR: Commissioner Fernandez, you had
7 another comment?

8 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: My only other comment was
9 maybe we can translate the star 9 in Somali and Oromo.

10 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: I was thinking that. I'm
11 trying to figure out where the -- some of the people in
12 the queue may be our interpreters because they were
13 joining by phone. So I'm just going to do this. Do we
14 have the phone numbers for the interpreters?

15 MS. MORALES: Hello.

16 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Hi.

17 MS. MORALES: Good morning. Am I on?

18 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: You are. Do you need an
19 interpreter?

20 MS. MORALES: No, I don't.

21 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Okay. You do not have to
22 share your name. If you would like to, please state and
23 spell it for the record. And the floor is yours.

24 MS. MORALES: Thank you. Good morning. Buenos
25 dias, Commissioners. My name is Maricela Morales,

1 M-A-R-I-C-E-L-A, the last name M-O-R-A-L-E-S. I serve as
2 Executive Director of the Central Coast Alliance United
3 for a Sustainable Economy, or CAUSE, based in Ventura and
4 Santa Barbara Counties.

5 I come today to lift up the tens of thousands of
6 Mixteco people along the Central Coast, as well as the
7 Fresno area of California. Mixtecs, as they're called,
8 are indigenous people from the southern region of Mexico.
9 They serve mostly as farmworkers for California's multi-
10 billion agricultural industry that provides fruits and
11 vegetables to California, the nation, and the world.

12 Mixtecos, there's about ten, twenty, thirty there's
13 multiple thousands of Mixteco peoples. Many of them do
14 not speak Spanish, much less English. They speak their
15 indigenous language. The good news is that there are at
16 least two CBOs that have interpreter, professional
17 interpreter capacity. MICOP, known as Mixteco Indigena
18 Community Organizing Project, services the Central Coast.
19 And CBDIO, an acronym for Central Binacional Para El
20 Desarrollo Indigena Oaxaqueno, services the Salinas
21 Valley and Fresno. You might want to look them up for
22 interpreter access, language access when you're doing
23 outreach to the Central Coast and the Fresno area. Thank
24 you.

25 CHAIR TAYLOR: Commissioner Fernandez, do you have a

1 response?

2 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Actually, thank you very
3 much Ms. Morales. Is there any way that you can send me
4 the names of those two CBOs, that information. I think
5 you have been in contact with Commissioner Fornaciari.
6 Would you mind sending that to him, if you haven't
7 already? That would be very helpful. Thank you so much.

8 CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you. Can you invite in our
9 next caller?

10 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: The floor is yours. Do
11 you need an interpreter.

12 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Yes.

13 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: We are unmuting the
14 interpreter.

15 Hello? Interpreter, can you please speak to the
16 caller?

17 OROMO INTERPRETER: Yes. My name is Celio Osomon
18 (phonetic). I'm interpreting for Oromo in San Diego. I
19 have one client that's on the line right now. He didn't
20 speak up on Oromo.

21 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: He is -- both of your
22 lines are open for the Commission.

23 OROMO INTERPRETER: Very good.

24 MR. VIASHIN: (Through Oromo Interpreter) Yes, he
25 say my name is Mohammad Viashin (phonetic). I'm

1 calling -- okay, he say my name is Moradon (phonetic). I
2 speaking up on Oromo. Explain the reason why we needed
3 Oromo as part of the language that's for the commenter.
4 We have a lot of several problems in our communities. As
5 soon as whenever we go to service centers, like
6 community, like hospitals, and also when we go to take it
7 a work to office, public grocery centers, wherever we go
8 the State of California don't have own translator for
9 Throng (phonetic), it is all the state. They bring the
10 translator from different state. So when they bring the
11 translator from different states there is multi-culture
12 in our communities. Some of people doesn't understand
13 what the translator says. But the language sometimes is
14 similar sometimes it's different according to the region
15 people come from Ethiopia -- from Ethiopia or
16 (indiscernible) different culture and different accents.
17 So while we go to hospitals and then maybe any public
18 places we need our translators. So we have been
19 suffering a lot, a lot. And we need to put this on
20 considerations that we can use our translators. We have
21 a lot of people that is in our community who can
22 translate our language for us. Please help us on these
23 issues.

24 In addition to all the points I mentioned while we
25 go to schools in the different public sectors, they have

1 written on their language beneficiaries in different
2 languages. But on Oromo it doesn't exist on writing.
3 And also it doesn't have that option, like Vietnamese,
4 Chinese, Tagalog, Arabic, so on. So in our part Oromo,
5 big Oromo community living in San Diego around areas of
6 Bay Areas, L.A. areas, around and in Southern California.
7 So we needed these Oromo as a part of official working
8 language in public center, in government center sectors.

9 CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you, sir. We will take in
10 consideration your comments.

11 OROMO INTERPRETER: I have another client that's on
12 line right now, who is going to speak it right now.

13 CHAIR TAYLOR: Hang on. Hang on. We have to wait
14 for the moderator.

15 OROMO INTERPRETER: Oh, okay.

16 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Okay, real quick, the
17 Oromo interpreter, if you could possibly interpret the
18 instructions of pressing star 9 to raise their hand so
19 that I know they want to speak, is that possible?

20 OROMO INTERPRETER: Yes, I'll tell them right now.
21 (Interpreting instructions in Oromo)

22 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Thank you so much. And
23 the Somali interpreter, if you could unmute yourself?
24 No, aren't they right here? And if you could interpret
25 in Somali, I would appreciate that. Okay, they're

1 working on getting the Somali interpreter unmuted. But I
2 do have the Oromo a lot more people raised their hands.

3 So however, the interpreter, sir you said you have
4 someone on the line with you that would like to make a
5 comment?

6 OROMO INTERPRETER: Yes.

7 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: That's separate from what
8 I have in the queue?

9 OROMO INTERPRETER: Yes.

10 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Okay. Would you like to
11 interpret that comment and then we can go forward?

12 OROMO INTERPRETER: Yes.

13 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Okay. So we'll start
14 with --

15 OROMO INTERPRETER: I can go ahead, okay.

16 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Perfect. We'll start
17 with your client and then we'll move forward.

18 OROMO INTERPRETER: Sure. Okay, my client is
19 missing. I think the line is push him out from the
20 system.

21 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Okay.

22 OROMO INTERPRETER: Hold on. Hello.

23 SOMALI INTERPRETER: I'm the Somali interpreter.
24 I'm translating for Somali community. Did you call me?

25 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Okay. So sir, your

1 client is now through. He was labeled incorrectly.

2 OROMO INTERPRETER: From Oromo. From Oromo I have
3 right now some clients with me. She's going to speak it
4 right now.

5 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Okay. For the Oromo
6 interpreter, if you could just hold on one second.

7 The Somali interpreter, your line is now open. Are
8 you there?

9 SOMALI INTERPRETER: Yes, I'm there.

10 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Thank you so much. Would
11 you be willing to interpret the instructions of pressing
12 star 9 to raise their hand so that I know that they would
13 like to share a comment? And then, we are going to go
14 back to the Oromo interpreter and move forward from
15 there.

16 SOMALI INTERPRETER: Okay, thank you very much.
17 I'll do now.

18 (Interpreting instructions in Somali)

19 SOMALI INTERPRETER: Okay, go ahead I translated.

20 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Thank you so much.

21 And our Oromo interpreter seems to have disappeared.
22 Hung up. So I'm not sure what to do right now.

23 CHAIR TAYLOR: Yeah, just see if we can go to our
24 next caller and hopefully --

25 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: So the issue is that

1 everyone that's raised their hand has been interpreted
2 for Oromo or Somali and I don't know which language.

3 CHAIR TAYLOR: Which one's which.

4 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: So if we can maybe just
5 give one sec. I don't -- he was calling in, so maybe his
6 phone dropped the call. I'm sure he'll be right back.

7 CHAIR TAYLOR: Okay. Okay, we'll work through it.

8 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Sorry guys.

9 (Pause)

10 CHAIR TAYLOR: Thanks to all the Commissioners for
11 their patience in this process as we work through
12 something that we've perfected just yet.

13 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: We got him back. Hold
14 on.

15 OROMO INTERPRETER: I'm on.

16 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Okay. Hi, we're back.
17 Awesome, that's what I like here.

18 Okay, I'm going to go to our next caller. For the
19 interpreters, I don't know which language and so if you
20 can both be alert that would be fabulous.

21 OROMO INTERPRETER: It's Oromo.

22 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Thank you. Your line is
23 open.

24 SOPHIA: Hello.

25 SOMALI INTERPRETER: And that was Sophia in San

1 Diego. She's reading all the (indiscernible). Sophia
2 has difficult in the language barriers of language and
3 she has difficult to communicate with healthcare offices,
4 public offices, and other language has access like the
5 Arabic and Tagalog and all those language. But the
6 Somali is not translated in the State of California. And
7 on one occasion she had an appointment with the DMV,
8 she'd been waiting one month and a half. She's a mother
9 who's struggling, an immigrant who is striving to feed
10 her kids and to work for them. Because of lack of
11 translation, the translator who was available at the DMV
12 he didn't appear, so they had to cancel that appointment
13 and she has to wait a very -- another long time. So
14 she's requesting that the (indiscernible) and the State
15 of California authority to consider this matter and give
16 Somali language a priority. We have a lot of -- from
17 Somali and she's kindly and humbly requesting
18 (indiscernible) --

19 SOMALI INTERPRETER: Hello?

20 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Yes, hello.

21 SOMALI INTERPRETER: That's what Sophia said.

22 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: I'm sorry?

23 CHAIR TAYLOR: That's what she said.

24 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Oh, that's what she said.

25 Oh, okay, perfect. Thank you so much.

1 SOMALI INTERPRETER: That's all she said. That is
2 all she said, yeah.

3 CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you. We will take under
4 consideration her comments. Thank you.

5 SOMALI INTERPRETER: You're welcome. Thank you very
6 much.

7 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: We have more. We have
8 lots more callers.

9 CHAIR TAYLOR: Katy, if you can invite in our next
10 caller, please?

11 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Yes. The next line is
12 open. Whatever language, you state it.

13 MS. TERAN: Hi, yes. Hello, my name is Vanessa
14 Teran and I'm a Policy and Communications Associate at
15 the Mixteco Indigenous Community Organizing Project.
16 It's based in Ventura and Santa Barbara Counties. And
17 MICOP also works on statewide projects, such as being the
18 lead of the Census statewide outreach for farmworkers in
19 2020. And presently is working on state legislation for
20 language access.

21 I wanted to share with you that there's an estimated
22 170,000 Mixteco indigenous peoples in California. And
23 they're concentrating in the following California regions
24 and counties, which are the Central Coast, Central
25 Valley, Los Angeles County, Napa, et cetera.

1 And so we really wanted to offer, MICOP wanted to
2 offer the following language access recommendations which
3 would be to create systems of orality and visual
4 components that can support individuals to understand the
5 redistricting process. We feel very strongly about this
6 due to health literacy levels, and the complexity of
7 language in redistricting.

8 We wanted to note that one in five adults in
9 California actually have low levels of literacy and not
10 all can read and write in their native language. So we
11 appreciate that. We can be reached at -- I can be
12 reached at Vanessa.teran@Mixteco.org, or by phone at 805-
13 612-7568, or our webpage which is www.mixteco.org. Thank
14 you for our time and for allowing us to submit public
15 comment.

16 CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you, appreciate your comments.

17 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: And to our next caller.

18 The floor is yours, if you need an interpreter.

19 MONA: (Through Somali Interpreter): That was
20 Sophia and Sophia say thank you for giving us the time to
21 speak up on --

22 MONA: Mona. My name is Mona (phonetic).

23 SOMALI INTERPRETER: Mona. Mona, I'm sorry, that's
24 Mona. And she thanks for the time that you gave, that
25 she speaks on the difficult (indiscernible) that she has

1 with the language. The Somali language is not a written
2 language. And wherever we go, she said, whether it's
3 (indiscernible), hospital, DMV, Social Office, we don't
4 have translators and we have to take our children to
5 translate for us, children who attend schools. And you
6 can imagine that children, when they translate, it's not
7 even good that they know some of the information and that
8 children is not even bad behavior or, you know. So and
9 she's requesting that the panel to consider to approve
10 the Somali language to include it, like the other
11 language Arabic, and other language that's written in the
12 State of California. And we have a very large Somali
13 community around California, everywhere. And she thanks
14 again for letting her and thank you very much.

15 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: All right.

16 CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you. We will take her comments
17 under consideration, thank you very much.

18 MS. PAJEDRO: Oromo translator.

19 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Yes, sir.

20 MS. PAJEDRO: Oromo.

21 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Yes, sir.

22 OROMO INTERPRETER: Hold on, I have a client on the
23 line right now who was going to speak it.

24 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Okay, thank you. He's
25 with you, correct?

1 OROMO INTERPRETER: Yes, please.

2 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Yes. If he's with you --
3 is he physically with you or do I need to open a specific
4 line?

5 OROMO INTERPRETER: Oh, okay. I think she pushed
6 number 9 and she found number 9, she raised her hand or
7 star 6, she unmuted.

8 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Yes, so I'm going through
9 a long list of callers. There are quite a few. In fact,
10 I have nine still with raised hands. So I don't know
11 which one she is, but I will open her line.

12 OROMO INTERPRETER: Yes, I think her phone number
13 1886, the last four digits is their phone, 1886.

14 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Oh, she's the next
15 caller. Here we are.

16 OROMO INTERPRETER: Oh, okay.

17 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Her line is open.

18 OROMO INTERPRETER: You can speak right now.

19 MS. PAJEDO: (Through Oromo Interpreter):

20 OROMO INTERPRETER: Yes, she say in Oromo my name is
21 Hindia Pajedro (phonetic). We have been suffering a lot,
22 a lot when immigrant is come from African to United
23 States. They don't speak English and we don't have
24 translator in here California, especially when people are
25 arrived over here at adult school. They're trying to

1 learn English, they don't know anything when --
2 especially when registering, do everything, some stuff
3 like that. We have been suffering a lot because we don't
4 have Oromo translators in California, especially in San
5 Diego over here. There's a bit Oromo community lives
6 around here. We have been suffering at DMS, hospitals,
7 adult schools, us too. For example, when we go to
8 clinic, at the time of clinic we don't have any Oromo
9 translator at the clinic. They call them up the phone,
10 they're from different -- the people who speak Oromo from
11 different state, she doesn't speak (indiscernible) Oromo,
12 the one we know. And is account we have been suffering a
13 lot. Please put this issue on considerations. Try to
14 help us on these issues. We need a lot. All
15 (indiscernible) -- people who stay in their home. So we
16 have been suffering a lot.

17 CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you. We'll take your comments
18 under consideration. Thank you.

19 MS. PAJEDO: (Through Oromo Interpreter): You're
20 welcome.

21 OROMO INTERPRETER: I have another client on the
22 line, too. I think the last four digits --

23 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: I'm sorry, sir, I didn't
24 get the last four that you said?

25 OROMO INTERPRETER: Okay, the last four digits was

1 9306 is on the line, too, 9306.

2 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: I do not have a 9306 on
3 the line.

4 OROMO INTERPRETER: Oh, okay, 2512?

5 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: I do have that. That's
6 actually the next caller.

7 OROMO INTERPRETER: Oh, very good.

8 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: In universally alignment
9 here.

10 OROMO INTERPRETER: Do you have another 9490 on the
11 line, 9490?

12 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Yes. Actually, they're
13 after this caller that you just asked for.

14 OROMO INTERPRETER: Okay, very good. Yeah, 9490,
15 her name was Karima Fura (phonetic). So please she
16 can -- she want to speak, too.

17 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Okay. Yes, absolutely.
18 The 2512 -- oh, there you go. They're open.

19 OROMO INTERPRETER: Yes.

20 MORADON: (Through Oromo Interpreter): Okay, my
21 name is Moradon. Especially we have the same issue
22 whatever people arises. And also even if our children
23 went to (indiscernible) -- by the time we take them to
24 the school, the one we tell them and the one that tell to
25 the teacher different. So if you guys put this issue on

1 consideration and to bring or hire some people who speak
2 in school, any public facilities, he can't understand us,
3 so we can't communication (indiscernible) -- whatever we
4 had it. Special again, on other (indiscernible) -- any
5 (indiscernible) they have their own translation. But on
6 Oromo side, we don't have it. Please put this issue
7 under consideration in the schools, in hospital, in
8 clinic, in public welfare places, (indiscernible) -- the
9 same issue he mentioned again.

10 OROMO INTERPRETER: I have another client that's on
11 the line. The last --

12 CHAIR TAYLOR: We appreciate the prior caller's
13 comments. We'll take those into consideration. I think
14 our moderator has everyone in queue, so she's getting
15 there, thank you.

16 OROMO INTERPRETER: You're welcome. Yeah, 9490's on
17 the line, too.

18 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Yes, she is. And they're
19 line is open.

20 MS. FURA (Phonetic): Oromo.

21 OROMO INTERPRETER: Speaking Oromo.

22 MS. FURA: (Through Oromo Interpreter): Hi, the
23 committee, my name is Karima Fura. And she say the first
24 time when I come to the United States over here, I have
25 been sick and been taken to hospitals. When I went in

1 hospital there is some information that the doctor he
2 want to explain to me, but I don't know English. There's
3 no way he can explain to me. And there is some
4 information, my personal information that he doesn't
5 disclose with anybody, but he can only disclose with me.
6 So I have been suffering all the time. No one can help
7 me out, even if my husband at the time with me, and they
8 don't want to share it -- but they want to share the
9 issues with me. Finally, they don't find any
10 translations and my husband little idea, even if he
11 doesn't put for me hundred percents my idea, but he
12 translated with the doctor, between me and the doctor.
13 But starting that day I've been plagued with depression.
14 So that is what happened to me because of the lack of
15 translation. That is I end up with the depression she
16 say, right now. Her name is Karima Fura.

17 So please put this issue on the considerations. Not
18 only me, there is a lot of people like me who have been
19 suffering a lot on these issues. So please help us.
20 Help us. Thank you very much.

21 CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you. We'll take your comments
22 under consideration.

23 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Thank you. I'd like to
24 ask the remaining six people in the queue, if you would
25 like to make a comment, if you could press star 9 to

1 raise your hand.

2 And then, I'd like to ask the Oromo interpreter if
3 they could interpret those instructions one more time.

4 The Oromo interpreter, sir? Sir? Oromo?

5 The Somali interpreter, are you still on the line?

6 Somali interpreter? Can you press star 6, Somali? Oh,

7 yes. Hi. Can you possibly interpret the pressing star 9

8 to raise your hand one more time, for Somali? Hello?

9 Somali or Oromo interpreters? Both of you are here.

10 OROMO INTERPRETER: Oromo's on the line. I'm here

11 on Oromo right now.

12 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Yes, thank you. Can you

13 interpret one more time the instructions of pressing star

14 9 to raise their hand?

15 OROMO INTERPRETER: Sure.

16 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Thank you.

17 OROMO INTERPRETER: It didn't work.

18 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Sir, Oromo?

19 OROMO INTERPRETER: I did.

20 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Oh, you did?

21 OROMO INTERPRETER: I did it.

22 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Okay. We didn't hear

23 you.

24 SOMALI INTERPRETER: Hello, Somali interpreter is

25 here.

1 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Yes, Somali Interpreter
2 could you please possibly press star -- or interpret star
3 9 instructions for the remaining people in the queue?

4 SOMALI INTERPRETER: Okay. (Interpreting
5 instructions)

6 Yeah, I just did do the translation.

7 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Thank you, sir.

8 SOMALI INTERPRETER: You're welcome.

9 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: We have a few more people
10 that have raised their hands. 8495, your line is open.

11 MS. ABDI: Good morning Commissioner, my name is
12 Rahmo Abdi. I'm a community organizer with PANA,
13 Partnership for the Advancement New Americans.

14 First, I wanted to say we appreciate all the staff
15 and consideration that has gone into creating this
16 language access plan. And I wanted to thank you all for
17 working so hard to make a translation available today.

18 I'm calling to urge you to offer COI materials in
19 live translation in both Somali and Oromo language.
20 There's a large Somali and Oromo community throughout
21 this state, particularly here in San Diego, and those
22 people do not speak Arabic. And we have worked hard to
23 acclimate those communities in civic life, including but
24 not limited to participate in the Census, local and state
25 advocacy campaigns, and also educating them about

1 upcoming redistricting.

2 We work with a large number of community members who
3 are motivated and excited about being part of the
4 redistricting process. Like you see today, a lot of
5 people are calling from the community.

6 But we'll be challenged to engage those people or
7 those communities if the proceeding are not in their
8 language. And it is not fair to us organizations to take
9 on the responsibility of translation and interpretation,
10 while at the same time doing the work of organizing,
11 analyzing maps, and also turning out community for public
12 comments.

13 And as you know, redistricting has a lot of
14 technical language. Having a family member or a friend
15 translating for something they're not familiar with it
16 means important information can slip through the cracks.
17 And you need an official translator to make sure we're
18 all getting the same information.

19 This is why I urge you to provide or we urge you to
20 provide with redistricting material, translation services
21 in both Somali and Oromo language. And I thank you so
22 much for all your work. Thank you.

23 CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you.

24 Katy, can you hang on for a second?

25 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Yes.

1 CHAIR TAYLOR: We are at our mandatory 11 o'clock
2 break. But due to the fact that we have the language
3 services on, if possible I would like to continue until
4 we complete these callers, if that's okay with staff.

5 MR. MANOFF: Stand by Chair.

6 CHAIR TAYLOR: Director Claypool?

7 DIRECTOR CLAYPOOL: So it's purely a question as for
8 our VSS and ASL, so they're shaking their heads yes, so
9 we're good, too.

10 MR. MANOFF: Chair, we are good to go.

11 CHAIR TAYLOR: Yes.

12 MR. MANOFF: We are good to go.

13 CHAIR TAYLOR: I assume that's okay with
14 Commissioners that we complete this? Yes, nod.

15 Okay, Katy, can you proceed please. Thank you.

16 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Yes, sir.

17 Your line is open.

18 MORADON: Oromo.

19 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Oromo Interpreter. There
20 we go.

21 OROMO INTERPRETER: I have on Oromo line.

22 MORADON: (Through Oromo Interpreter): Okay, for
23 Oromo, again my name Moradon. At the time we have all of
24 the United States and all over the world we have been
25 suffering with pandemic COVID-19, by the time our patient

1 is sick and can we take them to hospital, so they don't
2 allow other people to go inside with our patient. So
3 people -- right now people was (indiscernible) -- and we
4 have been people dying without proper translations. So
5 this is the main issue right now when (indiscernible) --
6 that's why I (indiscernible) --

7 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Sir, Interpreter?

8 OROMO INTERPRETER: This is Oromo translator, did
9 you hear me?

10 CHAIR TAYLOR: Yes.

11 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Yes, sir. Were you done?

12 OROMO INTERPRETER: Yes. I'm done, yes. I have
13 another client on the line with me, 8866 on the line.

14 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Okay, thank you so much.
15 1866, okay.

16 OROMO INTERPRETER: (Speaking Oromo).

17 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Yes, I'm asking -- they
18 have to press star 6 to unmute themselves.

19 OROMO INTERPRETER: (Speaking Oromo). Okay, I think
20 1866 is not responding. I have 9306 on the line, too.

21 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: I don't have that person
22 in the queue.

23 OROMO INTERPRETER: Okay, 8866 is on the line. Can
24 you see that, that number?

25 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: So oh I did that.

1 OROMO INTERPRETER: The last four digits of his
2 phone number, I saw 8866.

3 (Speaking Oromo).

4 Yeah, he's coming right now.

5 TAHWALI: (Through Oromo Interpreter): He say thank
6 you very much first of all to have this opportunity for
7 me. My name is Tahwali (phonetic). First of all, the
8 State of California is very big, they have big
9 population, big communities in the state. So we don't
10 have any translators. The big issue when we go to the
11 (indiscernible), when you go to the DMVs, when you go to
12 any public places, schools, welfares, the California was
13 as a big state is a translator, especially in Oromo
14 communities. We have been suffering a lot. And so we
15 need our people to work with us with our native languages
16 to translate for us. Thank you, so much. Put this issue
17 on consideration. He say, as he say.

18 CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you. Thank you for that call.

19 OROMO INTERPRETER: You're welcome, sir.

20 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Thank you, sir. We have
21 six more callers in the queue. If you would like to make
22 a comment, could you please press star 9 to raise your
23 hand?

24 And if the interpreters would be willing to
25 interpret those instructions again, I would appreciate

1 it.

2 SOMALI INTERPRETER: Somali Interpreter.

3 (Interpreting instructions into Somali). Somali is
4 translated.

5 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Thank you, sir. And we
6 do have a raised hand. And the line is open, 6158.

7 MS. MARKS: Hi. Yes, thank you. My name is Julia
8 Marks, J-U-L-I-A M-A-R-K-S. I'm from Asian Americans
9 Advancing Justice, Asian Law Caucus.

10 And I just wanted to call in first and foremost to
11 say thank you to the Commission, and the Language Access
12 Subcommittee, and staff, for all the thought you bring
13 into this, and the work you're putting into making it
14 happen. We really appreciate your commitment to
15 expansive coverage, committing to the top twelve
16 languages, but also working hard to make sure smaller
17 language groups can access this really important process.

18 As prior callers have pointed out really eloquently,
19 language access is an urgent need across so many areas of
20 civic participation, so we appreciate the efforts being
21 put into making redistricting inclusive as well.

22 We do support the adoption of the new proposal and
23 appreciate the flexibility. But I did want to ask for a
24 clarification and just a restatement of commitment to
25 adequately compensating community organizations and

1 community members for assisting with both interpretation
2 and with translation of any written documents.

3 Organizations that might be applying to get outreach
4 support in the form of grants should be separately and
5 additionally compensated for any translation work they're
6 doing. Those often go hand in hand but they are, you
7 know, both laborious tasks that should be duly
8 compensated for.

9 I also just wanted to know we acknowledge that there
10 are some logistical difficulties in making all this
11 happen and we appreciate that you're starting this week
12 to really put it into place.

13 A couple of suggestions from some of our past work,
14 one challenge we've seen is arranging translation and
15 interpretation on short notice. So we would recommend
16 that you identify translators potentially for each region
17 based on not just the top twelve languages, but some of
18 the other predominant ones, or some of the ones we
19 identified in the letter we submitted to the Commission.
20 Just to make sure you have folks lined up, in case
21 interpretation is required, in advance so you don't have
22 to scramble.

23 And then, we also recommend figuring out and testing
24 out a way to make sure callers are able to hear
25 interpretation throughout the hearing, not just for, you

1 know, the public comment portion.

2 Zoom has some functions where you can set up
3 different interpretation lines, so ideally, persons
4 should be able to go to your website and see the video
5 feed, and identify which number to call to get
6 interpretation in their language throughout the course of
7 the hearing and through public comment, so that live
8 interpretation is happening the whole time. And then, it
9 will have to switch over for the comment period to make
10 sure that you all can hear the interpreter interpreting
11 the commenters' contribution as well.

12 So I'm sure that will be a bit of a little sticky
13 process, but it's clear you're committed to making it
14 happen and we greatly appreciate that. So thank you.

15 One final note is if you do have the capacity, it
16 would be great to see some basic outreach materials,
17 particularly something like a short video for folks with
18 less literacy being translated or interpreted into some
19 additional languages beyond the top twelve. Some
20 languages we noted in our advocacy letter for regional
21 coverage such as Thai, Hindi, Bengali, Pashto and Hmong
22 would really benefit from additional resources from you
23 all.

24 I believe in the last discussion Commissioner Yee
25 mentioned the power of seeing your language reflected in

1 the statements and materials from important institutions,
2 and so we just would uplift finding some extra funding
3 and time to make a couple more languages covered in your
4 resources would be very helpful.

5 So thank you so much for your consideration.

6 CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you, Ms. Marks for your call
7 and comment.

8 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: And to our next caller.
9 Your line is open, sir.

10

11 MR. IMO: (Through Oromo Interpreter): My name
12 Hussein Imo (phonetic). As a South California, State of
13 California is big and we have been suffering a lot. For
14 example, what happened on me for the last like two, three
15 months, or couple months ago I take one of my family
16 relative to the hospital or clinic. And they don't want
17 to disclose their information to me and they call out
18 some translation from different state, who she doesn't
19 understand her language. And I'm her son, by the time I
20 go with her in hospital they don't trust me. Because she
21 know my language, I know her language, so I can disclose.
22 They don't want to disclose her personal issues with me.
23 And they're going to bring translator from different
24 state.

25 And we have been suffering the same issue with in

1 DMVs, in clinics, in hospitals, in other places, and
2 other (indiscernible) -- any public places. Please, this
3 issue put into consideration as the State of California
4 is big, we need our translator with our languages as we
5 are a big state.

6 And also with this COVID-19 a lot of people is right
7 now suffering with this COVID-19 as currently, especially
8 even from our communities. By the time we take them to
9 hospital, they don't let us know to go with him and we
10 translate for them. Also they don't know what's going
11 on, they don't understand and the (indiscernible) -- how
12 to explain it. By the time they bring the translator he
13 doesn't understand because our language is multi-broad
14 language. That's why I put this issue in consideration.
15 We have our people in California please try to have our
16 people for California for us. We have a lot of education
17 in our own communities and big. Put this issue in
18 consideration. Please help us he say, Hussein. Thank
19 you.

20 CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you. We'll take his comments
21 under consideration. Thank you.

22 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: If there's anybody in the
23 queue that would still like to make a comment, if you
24 could press star 9 to raise your hand indicating you
25 would like to speak.

1 Chair, most of the people, the numbers that are in
2 the queue are people that have spoken, that were with the
3 Oromo interpreter, the last four of their numbers, and no
4 one has raise their hand the last two times we've made
5 the announcement, and no one's raising their hand now.

6 So we can make another announcement, if you'd like.

7 You're on mute, Chair.

8 CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you. One more announcement and
9 then if not, we'll close public comment.

10 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Okay. So one more time
11 if you would like to comment, please press star 9 to
12 raise your hand.

13 And then, I'd like to ask the interpreters if you
14 could please interpret those instructions one more time,
15 that would be great.

16 SOMALI INTERPRETER: In Somali. (Translating
17 instructions). We have Somali translated the
18 instructions.

19 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Thank you, sir.

20 And the Oromo interpreter?

21 OROMO INTERPRETER: Into Oromo. Yes. (Translating
22 instructions). Yes, I pass the message.

23 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Thank you so much, sir.

24 And nobody raised their hand Chair.

25 CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you. Thank you, Interpreters.

1 Thank you, staff.

2 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Oh, wait, wait.

3 CHAIR TAYLOR: We've got one. We've got one.

4 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: One more. It is actually
5 the one number that had not shown.

6 And your line is open. Oromo?

7 MS. FURA: Oromo.

8 OROMO INTERPRETER: (Speaking Oromo).

9 MS. FURA: (Through Oromo Interpreter): My name is
10 she say -- oh, Oromo translator. My name is Karima Fura.
11 I come back again. There is a lot of our big Oromo
12 communities out there in San Diego and live somewhere.
13 So we are the minority group is today to come like very
14 fraction number of people to come in to give you the
15 idea, because of the meeting that was not longer. That's
16 why for next time we bring a lot of peoples. If you have
17 time, you guys will bring it. But a lot of our
18 communities suffered a lot and we need to put this issue
19 on consideration. And we need a translator. Please help
20 us. Thank you very much for listening. And we need this
21 issue to put on consideration, the State of California
22 they need their own Oromo translator. Thank you very
23 much, as she say.

24 CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you.

25 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Thank you.

1 CHAIR TAYLOR: And Katy, I think we have one more.

2 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Yes, we do. And your
3 line is open. Oromo?

4 OROMO INTERPRETER: (Speaking Oromo).

5 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Yes, sir.

6 OROMO INTERPRETER: I'm explain to her. Your line
7 is open. If you are speaking Oromo, the line is open.

8 MORADON: (Through Oromo Interpreter) My name is
9 Moradon. As he say, thank you very much to bring this
10 article on consideration. We really appreciate it from
11 our special place of (indiscernible). And please, please
12 we need it, we need this translation even if our people
13 is suffering a lot and different things, but everybody
14 mentioned the same ideas. So people mention more ideas.
15 And to put this issue on consideration, we really
16 appreciate it. Thank you very much, as he say.

17 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Thank you.

18 CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you. I appreciate the call.
19 And I think seeing no one else in the queue, we will
20 close public comment.

21 Thank you, Translators.

22 OROMO INTERPRETER: You're welcome.

23 SOMALI INTERPRETER: Thank you.

24 CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you, staff, for understanding
25 us going a little longer than usual.

1 So Commissioners, we'll take our required 15-minute
2 break and we'll come back at 11:40, and we'll pick up
3 right where we left off. Thank you. Thank you for your
4 patience.

5 (Whereupon, a recess was held from 11:26 a.m.
6 until 11:41 a.m.)

7 CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you. Good morning, welcome
8 back to meeting day 3 of the California Citizens
9 Redistricting Commission. We left off after having just
10 received public comment regarding our language access
11 recommendations.

12 Any other questions or comments from the Commission
13 before we proceed to a vote?

14 Commissioner Fernandez.

15 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: I just wanted to -- just a
16 brief thank you to everyone, all of our -- everyone that
17 called in. And personally, as being an interpreter and
18 translator since I can remember for my parents, my aunts,
19 my uncles and my friends, an advocate for others, I
20 understand how frustrating it can be to try to ensure
21 that there's appropriate translation and interpretation,
22 and communication is received accordingly. And that's
23 why we try to make this language access as inclusive as
24 possible. So thank you again. I know you have busy
25 lives and it really warmed my heart to have you call in.

1 So thank you.

2 CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you. I appreciate your
3 comments Commissioner Fernandez.

4 Any other questions or comments from the Commission?
5 Ms. Sheffield can you call the roll for a vote?

6 MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Toledo?
7 Commissioner Turner?

8 COMMISSIONER TURNER: Yes.

9 MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Vazquez? Commissioner
10 Vazquez?

11 Commissioner Yee?

12 COMMISSIONER YEE: Yes.

13 MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Ahmad?

14 COMMISSIONER AHMAD: Yes.

15 MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Akutagawa?

16 Commissioner Andersen?

17 COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: Yes.

18 MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Fernandez?

19 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Yes.

20 MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Fornaciari?

21 COMMISSIONER FORNACIARI: Yes.

22 MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Kennedy?

23 COMMISSIONER KENNEDY: Yes.

24 MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Le Mons?

25 COMMISSIONER LE MONS: Yes.

1 MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Sadhwani?

2 COMMISSIONER SADHWANI: Yes.

3 MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Sinay?

4 COMMISSIONER SINAY: Yes.

5 MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Taylor?

6 CHAIR TAYLOR: Yes.

7 MS. SHEFFIELD: Motion passes.

8 CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you for all of the work that
9 the Language Access Committee has put into that, into
10 this. Thank you.

11 Commissioner Andersen?

12 COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: Thank you. Before we move
13 off this topic, I would like to bring up, which one of
14 the callers mentioned is back when Commissioner Yee
15 mentioned the idea of putting like a little bit of a line
16 in multi different languages on our website to say hey,
17 just a short, like, you know, you count too. I would
18 like the Language Access Committee to look into that.
19 Like it's a separate contract having a couple of lines in
20 multi different languages, with a little short sentence
21 and saying -- maybe doing a link to one of our CBO
22 partners that had language translations. So it would be
23 actually people who have -- rather than our full twelve,
24 just a short line about, you know, and the idea being
25 maybe we can help the people in different language be

1 directed to how to use the COI tool, something like that.
2 Just or something like that, I like that idea of just a
3 short blurb on our website in multiple different
4 languages. If I could sort of throw that idea to the
5 Language Access Committee to look into, and that can be
6 just a small, separate contract as opposed to the big,
7 you know, translating all the documents, that sort of
8 thing.

9 CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you Commissioner Andersen.
10 Commissioner Le Mons, did I see your hand raised?
11 Oh, I'm sorry. Commissioner Fernandez, did you have a
12 reply?

13 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Actually, I think the
14 directors are happy to address it.

15 But I think with language access and our
16 recommendation going forward, I don't want to say we're
17 going to sunset our subcommittee, but I think going
18 forward it would be any requests would be handled by the
19 communications area. That was our intention at this
20 point. But we'll still move forward in terms of the
21 contract, and RFP, whatever language, of course, that
22 needs to be written up for that.

23 CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you. Director Ceja?

24 DIRECTOR CEJA: Just a friendly reminder that the
25 California Statewide Database is including instructions

1 on how to use the COI tool in those twelve languages. So
2 once we have that literature we will definitely plug it
3 into our website so folks can access instructions in
4 their different language.

5 CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you. All right, we will now
6 return to agenda item number 15, the outreach plans and
7 material.

8 Director Ceja? I guess we last left with you ending
9 your reveal of our PowerPoint deck, correct? Correct, so
10 then I'll give --

11 DIRECTOR CEJA: Version 2.

12 CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you. So I'll give it back to
13 Commissioner Fernandez and Commissioner Kennedy.

14 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Okay. So I think we were
15 trying to figure out how best to move forward with this
16 because we do have the collateral documents. I'm
17 thinking with those documents, and also due to time
18 constraints, because I'm really interested in the data
19 management piece of it.

20 If there are changes in the language or if you want
21 to see additions, if we could have the Commissioners and
22 the public, as well, if they could forward that to us to
23 the subcommittee to include Communications Director Ceja,
24 that would be best.

25 I'm not sure, Chair Taylor, how you want to do -- if

1 you want us to actually go through the PowerPoint
2 presentation to see if there's changes there or if you
3 want to handle it the same way where they can forward
4 their comments to us. Either way is fine.

5 CHAIR TAYLOR: I'm fine with the forward and then we
6 can adjust it, and any changes or amendments, you can
7 offer them up in either your report or a subcommittee
8 report.

9 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Uh-hum.

10 CHAIR TAYLOR: All right. I see on the agenda we do
11 have the -- we also have the 2020 Commission Logo
12 presentation. Is that something that we've already
13 covered with the new logo?

14 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Commissioner Sinay.

15 CHAIR TAYLOR: Commissioner Sinay.

16 COMMISSIONER SINAY: I just have a quick question.
17 You know, with subcommittees and all that, if we could
18 have clarification from counsel, are we supposed to be
19 sending it just to staff and then staff puts our comments
20 all together and then shares it with the other
21 subcommittee members, or do we cc the subcommittee
22 members? I've done both and so I know that I've messed
23 up somewhere.

24 MS. MARSHALL: You know, we're currently working on
25 protocol and I'll try to get something out to you by

1 tomorrow, because I see the responses are pretty much
2 inconsistent and I want us to be consistent, so before I
3 give a definitive response. But we'll get something out
4 to you quickly.

5 COMMISSIONER SINAY: Thank you.

6 CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you, Chief Counsel Marshall.
7 Thank you.

8 Any other questions or comments? All right, so that
9 will conclude agenda item number 15 and we can move on to
10 agenda item -- oh, Commissioner Kennedy?

11 COMMISSIONER KENNEDY: Sorry Chair. We got
12 sidetracked there for a second, but I'm not sure we ever
13 finished on the logo presentation.

14 So where are we formally on the logo presentation?

15 CHAIR TAYLOR: Director Ceja?

16 DIRECTOR CEJA: That was a leftover from previous
17 agendas. That was just ported over. But the new
18 branding has been released and has been applied to all
19 agendas and future collateral materials.

20 COMMISSIONER KENNEDY: Okay. It's just still the
21 "we" and the "the" still get lost a little bit depending
22 on the size and because of the color. It's very weak and
23 it tends to drop out.

24 CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you. Any other questions or
25 comments? Commissioner Yee?

1 COMMISSIONER YEE: Yeah, while we're in public
2 session I want to mention for the PowerPoint I'll be
3 sending in a note about our discussion yesterday about
4 not receiving public input in educational sessions. I
5 think slide 13, especially, is a little bit unclear on
6 that. So I'll be sending that in. I just wanted to
7 mention that publicly.

8 CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you Commissioner Yee. And I
9 also have a note considering the same. Thank you.
10 Commissioner Andersen?

11 COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: Yes, I will be sending --
12 again, publicly, I really want us to emphasize that in
13 the criteria for drawing compactness that's not the
14 definition. It's not about shape and my shape, it is
15 not. And we really -- that's going to be an issue that
16 comes up, and up, and up, and we must be totally clear.
17 So our definitions in the PowerPoint are misleading. And
18 in one case that's not it. And so I will be definitely
19 sending in things like that.

20 Also the emphasize in terms of we mention testimony,
21 and we've never talked about testimony virtually at all
22 until this document. We're talking about, you know, the
23 drawing your community, getting involved with your
24 community, our COI tool, and we all the sudden shifted in
25 this document. So I will be submitting things for making

1 changes in the documents to correspond to that.

2 But it's great work, great work, but it does need
3 some shifting to be consistent and correct.

4 CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you Commissioner Andersen.

5 Any other questions or comments? All righty, that
6 will conclude agenda item number 15.

7 We'll move on to agenda item number 16, Data
8 Management, with Commissioners Ahmad and Turner.

9 COMMISSIONER AHMAD: Thank you Chair. Commissioner
10 Turner and I will take it from here. We have quite a few
11 things to go over with you all, and particularly to
12 gather your feedback and input about where we are in the
13 process right now.

14 So just a quick recap. As you know, we have been
15 talking to a whole bunch of different folks about what we
16 would need in order for us to implement a successful data
17 management tool within our organization.

18 And Commissioner Turner, I have had numerous
19 meetings with USDR, the United States Digital Response,
20 over the past couple of weeks to continue to refine the
21 process we are thinking could potentially work for us.

22 So we want to go over certain items today. So there
23 are four documents posted online for agenda item number
24 16. The document labeled "16 Data Management
25 Subcommittee Checklist" is a document that outlines the

1 other documents we will be reviewing for this agenda
2 item. And this is to keep us organized and to be able to
3 make sure that we're looking at the specific documents of
4 discussion, and then also our focus questions which are
5 for the group to react to. This document also outlined
6 our recommended action, which we will discuss at the end
7 of our presentation today.

8 So just jumping right in, the first document that we
9 will be reviewing is titled "Partnership Options from
10 USDR". So this is the three-page document with charts.
11 Would it be helpful for you all if I did a screen share?
12 Yes. Okay.

13 Commissioner Turner, can you field in case I can't
14 see folks?

15 COMMISSIONER TURNER: Yes.

16 COMMISSIONER AHMAD: Okay, awesome. Let me jump
17 into a screen share. All right, are we seeing the
18 document?

19 COMMISSIONER TURNER: Yes.

20 COMMISSIONER AHMAD: Okay, awesome. So this
21 document highlights the different options that USDR
22 proposed to Commissioner Turner and I, and that we are
23 bringing back to you all for feedback, suggestions,
24 thoughts, reactions, all of the above.

25 So USDR outlined two options that they saw, based

1 off of our conversations. The first option is that USDR
2 assists us in building out the Data Collection Management
3 Analysis and Publishing Tool. And we, as the CRC, hire
4 that data analyst who would then be using that tool to
5 manage all of the inputs that we're going to be getting.

6 The second option, jumping below to the row titled
7 "2"; the CRC hires a data analyst. And there's one minor
8 addition to this. We would also hire the product manager
9 and an engineer to build out that tool and then hand it
10 over to the data analyst, who would then manage the
11 input, the data collection, and analysis, and publishing
12 of all of the inputs that we gather.

13 They also went ahead and listed out some pros and
14 cons for each of the options.

15 And then, if you jump to page 2 and 3, it's the same
16 options as discussed, however they have outlined a little
17 bit more clearly the different roles that USDR would play
18 and the role that our hired data analyst would play, and
19 then as well as our role as the CRC.

20 This chart does not reflect, based off of our
21 conversation on Monday, since we weren't allowed to
22 change material that late in the game these charts don't
23 reflect the inclusion of a product manager and an
24 engineer within option 2.

25 Commissioner Turner, am I missing something or

1 anything else with this particular issue?

2 COMMISSIONER TURNER: I don't think you're missing
3 it, other than for the clarity the product manager and
4 the engineer both would be hired by CRC under that option
5 number 2.

6 COMMISSIONER AHMAD: Yes.

7 COMMISSIONER TURNER: Okay.

8 COMMISSIONER AHMAD: Yes. And if it's helpful to
9 delineate what those roles are, a product manager would
10 be managing the product. They would see the development
11 of that product from end to end. So starting from the
12 fact finding of what kind of features do you all need in
13 a data collection tool? What exists out in the market?
14 Do we need to build something from scratch to be able to
15 hold what we are asking for? They would take those
16 answers, figure out what the solution is, work with the
17 engineer to actually code and develop that tool, whether
18 it's in existence already, like Airtable has come up in
19 the past, in which we could make edits, et cetera, or, if
20 it's to build something from scratch. We don't know yet,
21 we haven't had this conversation with us, as well as with
22 USDR of what that would look like.

23 But from the first step they have identified that if
24 we choose option 2, we would need to hire all three of
25 those roles in order for us to be able to successfully

1 create a tool and employ that tool in our data collection
2 efforts.

3 Do we have questions on this particular document?

4 And I am open to holding questions off until the end of
5 our presentation or we can go document by document,
6 however you all want to go.

7 CHAIR TAYLOR: Commissioner Ahmad, can you run
8 through your presentation and then we'll run through the
9 questions, please?

10 COMMISSIONER AHMAD: Sure, awesome. So this is the
11 first document and this is our first question for all of
12 us is to really think through whether we would want to go
13 with option 1 or with 2. And I would like to add that
14 USDR was not shy about saying that they do want to help
15 us with this project. They're really eager. I believe,
16 in my personal opinion, that they do have the skill set
17 to be able to assist us through this process, as well as
18 the network for the necessary skills to build out our
19 tool.

20 If we move along to this document, our second
21 document is a data flow diagram, so it is also one of the
22 attachments. Let me bump over to that one. Can you all
23 see this? Commissioner Turner --

24 COMMISSIONER TURNER: Yes.

25 COMMISSIONER AHMAD: -- can I get a verbal? Okay,

1 awesome.

2 So this document outlines the flow of our data from
3 the people back to the people, essentially. We went
4 through various iterations of this document with USDR,
5 mainly being able to -- trying to tease out all of the
6 different tools that -- all of the different inputs that
7 we would be receiving.

8 There's a question mark in there and that is not an
9 accident. I should have added another question mark
10 because I have several questions on this flow. But for
11 now, let's go over this flow.

12 So all of our data will be coming from Californians.
13 They would funnel that data to us through two different
14 mechanisms, whether that's through the COI tool or some
15 other means that is not the COI tool.

16 So let's start with following the line through the
17 COI tool. So a Californian will hop on their computer or
18 cell phone, access that COI tool through the captcha, so
19 this captcha will be able -- hopefully, will be able to
20 limit the bots that enter. They would go into the COI
21 tool, input their information, the map along with their
22 commentary. That COI tool would then pop out the output,
23 which we have discovered many times in our talks, and
24 with Karin's insight that is going to be a CSV file,
25 shapefiles, and PDFs.

1 From there, there's two different paths. Either
2 that COI tool information comes to us in English or it
3 comes to us in another language. If it comes to us in
4 another language, it would need to be translated into
5 English. So the ones that come to us that are in non-
6 English languages would then funnel into the translation
7 piece back to our data management team.

8 The data management team would then funnel this back
9 into the COI tool in English, so it feeds into the main
10 database.

11 Now, if the COI tool information comes to us in
12 English, it will flow directly into that main database.

13 I will come back to this question mark at the end.
14 So that is one path that information from Californians
15 will get to that main database.

16 The second path that we had identified in our
17 conversations is that folks come to us directly. So
18 whether that be through emails, written comments, meeting
19 notes, phone calls, verbal testimony in person maybe, and
20 any other option that we are not even thinking about
21 right now that is not the COI tool.

22 From there, that information flows directly to us,
23 the Commissioners, and we determine where that flows
24 next. So there's two paths that we've identified in our
25 conversations. One path is to the data management team

1 directly. Another path is to the line drawers.

2 So if this non-COI tool data comes to us in English,
3 we would be able to either flow that information to the
4 data management team if it's comments, qualitative data,
5 any sort of data that falls within that realm.

6 If it's map data, so information about where my
7 community lives, where my community is located, it's from
8 1st Street to 10th Street, et cetera, we would flow that
9 to the line drawer.

10 If this non-COI tool data comes to us in a non-
11 English language, that first initial step would be the
12 same. It would flow to the data management team for
13 nonline drawer information, get translated, and then
14 populated through the COI tool into the main database.

15 If it is map-related information, in a non-English
16 language, it would need to be translated, theoretically
17 our data management team would handle that, and then flow
18 directly to the line drawers who would draw that and
19 populate shapefiles.

20 Those shapefiles will then jump into the shapefile
21 database that we all know that Statewide Database would
22 have, or our line drawers would have, sorry. And also
23 flow directly into our main database.

24 So at this point all of the information,
25 theoretically, that we're getting from Californians has

1 flowed into our main database.

2 From here we would apply the filters. So this could
3 be filters to remove harmful language. It could be
4 filters to identify unusable entries, so we could apply a
5 filter that if every cell is empty, put it aside. If
6 there's any other types of filters we could think of at
7 that time, we would add that in this step. That would
8 then populate a filtered database, or a clean dataset
9 from which we can work from.

10 This filtered dataset will then go two directions.
11 It's the same dataset, but it would go into two different
12 directions as a whole. So one direction would be back to
13 the public, so they see exactly what the dataset looks
14 like that we're -- or the database looks like that we are
15 working from. And then, it will also go to our analyst,
16 who would be working with the database to come up with
17 the visualizations, the synthesis, the qualitative
18 analysis that exists in that main database.

19 That information would then go back to us as the
20 Commissioners to inform our decision making, and then
21 also flow back to Californians so they can see what we
22 are using to inform our decision making.

23 Now, this question right here. Theoretically, if
24 this is an automated process for let's say myself to jump
25 onto the COI tool, punch in my information and click

1 submit, if this path right here is truly an automated
2 process I am not sure, with the skills that I have, if
3 there is a way to intercept that automated process to
4 identify non-English submissions.

5 The other place where this translation piece can go
6 is potentially in that filter step, where we could apply
7 that filter to identify non-English submissions.

8 The other question that I have is regarding the line
9 drawer, and the line drawers will in the analysis, if
10 any. And I will leave it at that because I am not sure
11 where that sits right now and I would love to hear from
12 my colleagues about that.

13 So this is something that Commissioner Turner and I
14 came up with based off of all of the conversations that
15 we've had in our meetings, the back and forth that we've
16 had with USDR. It is not final by any means. This was
17 just to put on paper, so we have something to react to,
18 something we can look and be like, hey, well we didn't
19 think of XYZ. We should move it like this or like that.

20 And then, also something we can have on paper as we
21 go through the recruitment process, if we choose to hire
22 a data analyst, so that they can also react to it and be
23 able to identify any gaps that we may not have seen in
24 the pre-planning process. So that's that document.

25 The last document we wanted to review is the draft

1 timeline. Let me see if I can -- So this draft timeline,
2 granted we just learned new information yesterday, so it
3 might change. It will change. But this draft timeline
4 outlines the different steps that the data management
5 component of our organization would be taking in order to
6 develop out that process.

7 So in February we are thinking about creating that
8 data management system plan and the staffing plan, so
9 this ties into us figuring out the different options we
10 want to pursue with our partnership with USDR, whether
11 that be option 1 or 2.

12 And then, we would need to develop a duty statement
13 for a data manager position. I have been told by staff
14 that it might not take as long as last time, but we will
15 see where that goes.

16 We would also develop that RFI and begin the
17 recruitment process for a data analyst. And that would
18 require that twenty-day posting of the duty statement for
19 the -- I'm sorry, the duty statements for the data
20 manager, the RFI is for the data analyst, and that
21 twenty-day posting. So we're thinking that can happen in
22 February.

23 And then, when we jump to March we would start that
24 interview process, looking at both of those roles that we
25 are hiring, a data manager and a data analyst, if we

1 choose to go that route, going through the interview
2 process, bringing forth recommendations, and then
3 including that onboarding that's going to be led by the
4 staff executive team.

5 And then, that data manager and analyst working
6 together to identify the process in which they would be
7 managing all of the information going in.

8 We have done a lot of the head work for it and of
9 course, things might change. They obviously would have
10 expertise in this area. Commissioner Turner and I are
11 just, you know, learning as we go and doing a lot of
12 research on our own. And then, they would be able to
13 identify the different detailed components of such a
14 tool, whether it be a completely separate tool than, you
15 know, Airtable or Tableau, or whatever it is, a built out
16 tool in combination with the COI tool, and how to
17 actually pull all of that information in.

18 And then, we would actually have an opportunity to
19 review that process, of course, and troubleshoot -- bring
20 forth any troubleshooting items as well.

21 This goes into a lot of details, number 3 in late
22 March. So developing a manual review of the inputs,
23 outside of the COI tool. So figuring out which -- you
24 know, which piece of information that comes to us from a
25 non-COI tool perspective, how is that information

1 handled? So that top part of the right-hand side of that
2 table. So emails, hand-drawn letters, verbal testimony,
3 the data manager would develop a system of protocol
4 within that team to identify, okay, if we get this type
5 of information, this is the process it flows to get back
6 to us as the Commission, and back to the public.

7 And then, in April 2021 the hiring of temporary
8 staff, if there is the need for the temporary staff. So
9 looking for data entry folks. This is where we would
10 potentially have college students; interns play a role in
11 this process as well.

12 That's as far as we got. This is before, you know,
13 we learned changes within the timeline for the Census and
14 other changes. So this is draft as well, open to being
15 edited and changed, but this is where we're at right now.

16 Before we move on to the recommendations, though, I
17 think I need to know if I'm making any sense at all.

18 COMMISSIONER TURNER: And before we even open it up,
19 I want to say for the amount of meetings the data, the
20 individuals that we interviewed, the feedback and support
21 was received, I'm impressed with Commissioner Ahmad, how
22 she's been able to pull it altogether and present to you.
23 We were all over the board in trying to make sure this
24 made sense and would flow.

25 And I was in the meetings and I'm like, yes. So

1 Commissioner Ahmad, your office is amazing. So we are
2 ready for sure for now questions that you have. But I
3 just had to, even before we go into it give her that
4 public praise because that presentation was wonderful.

5 CHAIR TAYLOR: Comments and questions from
6 Commissioners? Go ahead.

7 COMMISSIONER TURNER: Okay, Commissioner Kennedy?

8 COMMISSIONER KENNEDY: Thank you. First of all,
9 yes, I want to say that I am both impressed and inspired
10 by the quality of work and you know, the obvious learning
11 that has gone on. I think we're all better off for this.

12 You know, I was asking in one of the recent meetings
13 for a more complete data flow diagram and this is
14 wonderful. This is incredibly helpful.

15 My one question about it is I'm not fully
16 understanding the purpose of the shapefile database if
17 all of the shapefiles are also in the main database. And
18 if they're all in the main database, do we achieve the
19 same thing just by having a flag on the record, or
20 something?

21 COMMISSIONER TURNER: Yes. And you're referring,
22 Commissioner, to the shapefile database on the right
23 side, under shapefiles. You know, so what we were told
24 when we asked the same question is that the line drawers
25 will maintain their own database for different drawings

1 that they're trying on, and what have you. So it may be
2 they will possibly have shapefiles there as drafts, or as
3 drafts that may not be in the other, official database.
4 Is I think how it was explained that the line drawers, I
5 guess from 2010, they maintained their own files just
6 based on what they're trying on.

7 COMMISSIONER KENNEDY: Thank you.

8 COMMISSIONER TURNER: Commissioner Fernandez?

9 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Oh, yes thank you. Thank
10 you to both of you for this presentation. I'm trying to
11 catch up to all of the knowledge that you have and I'm
12 sure I'm not even going to get close to that. So I do
13 have quite a few questions.

14 I'll go through like the admin questions quickly,
15 though. Like for the data analyst position, do we have
16 that position already established? Because I know that's
17 the issue that we had with the deputy executive director,
18 we didn't have that position, so that's why it took
19 longer. So I'm just wondering is that position
20 established.

21 COMMISSIONER TURNER: I believe, Daniel, you said
22 that was one that was established so it won't take as
23 long but using that -- what the terms, what the codes
24 were.

25 DIRECTOR CLAYPOOL: Actually, for the data analyst

1 that is a position that it's contemplated at an
2 interagency agreement at this time if we do it. So we
3 wouldn't need to have that position. If we couldn't do
4 the IIA, then of course we would try to go out on a
5 contract. Because that's going to be a very specialized
6 position, it's going to have a very short period of time
7 that they'll be working for us.

8 The data manager position, on the other hand if we
9 hire our own we do have that position established, but
10 it's in the way that we have the position itself
11 established. Raul right now is going through the process
12 of then getting us an additional slot for it. So we're
13 expanding the number of SSMLs that we have. Once you
14 have the basic position established, it's much easier to
15 then expand and just get a new slot for one, and that's
16 where we're at for it.

17 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Okay. And then, how about
18 you also mentioned for option 2 you would need an
19 engineer, so that one we wouldn't -- that's the one we'd
20 need to establish?

21 COMMISSIONER TURNER: Well, under option 2 would be
22 USDR that's actually going to hire both the product
23 manager and engineer. No, wait, wait, wait.

24 COMMISSIONER AHMAD: It's flipped.

25 COMMISSIONER TURNER: Did I get the wrong one?

1 COMMISSIONER AHMAD: Yeah, yeah, option 1 is where
2 USDR does the heavy lifting in the front end and then we
3 take on data analyst.

4 COMMISSIONER TURNER: Right. So but Commissioner
5 Fernandez you were speaking of the product manager, the
6 new hire, the new position that wasn't previously
7 discussed.

8 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Right. Was that option 2
9 with the product manager and the engineer?

10 COMMISSIONER TURNER: USDR.

11 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Oh, okay, that's where I'm
12 getting confused.

13 So you mentioned -- Commissioner Ahmad, you
14 mentioned that USDR is eager to help. So we have
15 assurances that they'll be there for the long haul and
16 also do we need to contract with them and how long would
17 that take?

18 COMMISSIONER AHMAD: Yeah, good questions. So one,
19 we can have theoretically the organization for the long
20 haul, but we might not have the same face for the long
21 haul. However, the way that they have divided it up in
22 their options, with option 1 being that they build out
23 the data collection tool from, you know, from a project
24 manager managing it from end to end, and an engineer
25 actually building it out. They think, they have said and

1 I can quote them, we go -- we run at this -- what is it,
2 that we run at the --

3 COMMISSIONER TURNER: As the speed of need.

4 COMMISSIONER AHMAD: -- speed of need. So we pushed
5 them and they were like, "We run at the speed of need".
6 So if you have a reasonable deadline, we will get it
7 done.

8 So in terms of their relationship being in the long
9 run, from what I understood was that they would do that
10 heavy lifting in the front end and then give us the tool
11 so that our data manager and data analyst can pick up and
12 move it forward.

13 We did have a conversation, this is like ancillary,
14 but related, if the tool breaks, if there is some kind of
15 a glitch in the system, if, you know, a weekend goes by
16 and people are unable to input their information that
17 would be all bad. So they said they would be able to
18 help, but they might not be just as readily available.

19 So that is a skill or at least a perspective that we
20 would want any internal staff to have is to be able to
21 continuously do quality checks, whether that be through
22 submissions like test inputs on a daily basis, or a
23 weekly basis just to make sure that it's actually flowing
24 through, whatever flow we establish.

25 And then, your second question was something and I

1 totally forgot it.

2 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: You're expecting me to
3 remember my own questions? Let me think. Oh, hold on.

4 COMMISSIONER AHMAD: Oh, contracting. Contracting.

5 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Yes, thank you.

6 COMMISSIONER AHMAD: They are a volunteer-based
7 organization. They do everything for free. But for our
8 purposes, they are also willing and I think they have
9 signed contracts with other government agencies, just so
10 that there's a clear understanding of roles among both
11 parties. So I would -- you know, I wouldn't bring anyone
12 on without a contract, just to make sure that, you know,
13 everything's clear and the I's are dotted and the T's are
14 crossed kind of thing. But there's no cost associated
15 with it, so that's nice.

16 COMMISSIONER TURNER: Thank you, Commissioner
17 Kennedy.

18 COMMISSIONER AHMAD: Yeah.

19 COMMISSIONER TURNER: Commissioner Yee.

20 COMMISSIONER YEE: Thank you Commissioners Turner
21 and Ahmad. I love how you're helping us push into this
22 new area of work with the Commission, which is taking us
23 beyond what the 2010 Commission did.

24 A comment and a question. A comment is that I just
25 want to remind ourselves that, you know, as community

1 input comes in, you know some people may have a complete
2 kind of piling on mappable community of interests to
3 submit, but a lot of people won't. They'll just have a
4 verbal description and it may involve even just one what
5 would be a line, you know one side of a polygon, which is
6 what they really care about. They don't really care
7 about the other sides.

8 So I know there is -- it seemed to me that in your
9 flow chart there is provision for that.

10 COMMISSIONER TURNER: Yes.

11 COMMISSIONER YEE: But I just wanted to lift that up
12 and remind us that kind of input may actually be a large
13 part, or even the greater part of the inputs that we get.

14 A question, just cost. So option 1, option 2, USDR
15 being volunteer, how much of the consideration is cost?
16 And perhaps, Director Claypool, maybe you can help us
17 weigh how much to think about the two options in terms of
18 costs.

19 COMMISSIONER TURNER: I'd like to say to the first,
20 to your comment, yes, absolutely that was taken in
21 consideration. If people indeed only have opportunity to
22 draw one side of their diagram, or just all of the
23 qualitative words, verbiage, the tool will capture that.

24 Consideration of cost, Director Claypool I saw your
25 hand you wanted to weigh in on that?

1 DIRECTOR CLAYPOOL: Certainly. The first
2 consideration for cost is how the subcommittee has
3 dramatically decreased the cost over what our original
4 estimate was. So this is, yeah, this was a very, very
5 successful venture in bringing us to a better solution.

6 Cost, so we would have -- if we hire our own data
7 manager, then we would have about a ten-month cost at an
8 SSM1 level. And then, we would have whatever temporary
9 staff came board, and they would come aboard on
10 interagency agreements at 9,500 -- well, at \$9,999
11 limits. So it's hard to tell. We can definitely factor
12 the SSM1 in because we know that number. The rest of it
13 will really depend on volume.

14 On the other end, it's also hard to tell what a data
15 analyst will cost us on an interagency agreement. We'll
16 have to put that out and just see what people bid.

17 And then, the product manager, as Commissioner Ahmad
18 has said, that would come from USDR and presumably at no
19 cost. And I would be quite honest, if there were some
20 cost, it would be well worth paying for that expertise to
21 have it -- to have them follow us. But I am of the same
22 mindset that they seemed to indicate that they would do
23 it at no cost.

24 So saying that, you know again, the actual costs
25 will be very, very low compared to our original estimate.

1 And when I say very, very low, I think we're talking
2 about in the hundreds of thousands, instead of in the \$2
3 million range that I originally thought of. So that's
4 about what the costs look like to me at this point.

5 COMMISSIONER TURNER: Thank you. I see you,
6 Commissioner Kennedy. I wanted to also just name, in the
7 phrasing you said how much is cost consideration. I
8 wanted to say that for the expertise, the commitment,
9 experience and knowledge that USDR provide, I think in
10 addition to there being a huge cost savings I'm convinced
11 that this is the right team that will be able to bring
12 the type of product that we need for the data management
13 and analysis, the tool. On any of the sessions that
14 we've met with, in addition to our team here, and some of
15 the other subcommittees they've had no less than three of
16 four people that's leaned in, trying to help us work this
17 through.

18 So it's not just a cost savings. I think they're
19 also the right individuals that are committed to bringing
20 what we need for this Commission.

21 Commissioner Kennedy?

22 COMMISSIONER KENNEDY: Thank you. Just wanted to
23 check and see do we have enough information at this point
24 to be able to estimate hardware costs? Because this is
25 not just software development and staffing, we are going

1 to have some hardware costs for maintaining all of this.
2 And I don't know where we are as far as estimating those.

3 COMMISSIONER TURNER: Uh-hum, yeah, we have.
4 Commissioner Fornaciari, were you raising your hand for
5 that. Oh, okay, Commissioner (sic) Claypool. We, I
6 think, looked into some of the hardware costs.

7 COMMISSIONER AHMAD: And I think -- I think
8 theoretically, like I would like it if everything lived
9 on the cloud. So hopefully, there's not much associated
10 with, you know, saving files or backing up. But, yeah,
11 so I don't know how that changes the cost estimate based
12 off of that feature.

13 COMMISSIONER TURNER: I see you, Commissioner
14 Fornaciari.

15 COMMISSIONER FORNACIARI: Well, the platform that
16 they're looking at using is the data's hosted on their
17 end. So the data would be hosted there, all the hardware
18 would be there. We'd pay a monthly fee for access to the
19 platform and that's the business model.

20 So you know, one advantage of the tool that we're
21 likely looking at is we don't have to buy servers, we
22 don't have to set up servers, we don't have to manage
23 servers, we don't have to maintain servers. It's all
24 done by the host of the database.

25 And just with regard to Commissioner Yee's question,

1 I mean, so correct me if I'm wrong, but the way I
2 understand it there's two options, right. One, USDR
3 builds the system for us and we hire an analyst.

4 Option 2, we hire an engineer, we hire a product
5 manager, they build it, and then we still have an analyst
6 and we still have a data manager. So the difference in
7 cost between the two options is USDR will build this
8 thing for free or we hire people to build it for us. And
9 so it's probably significantly higher if we're obviously
10 hiring engineers and project managers ourselves.

11 COMMISSIONER TURNER: Commissioner Andersen?

12 COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: Thank you. I really
13 appreciate all the different angles that people are
14 coming at this issue from. I'm more of a process and how
15 are we getting it all done. And I appreciate the admin
16 and the whole different perspectives of it.

17 And in that part, I'm trying to make sure that I'm
18 understanding our terminology of what is -- what do we
19 mean by a project manager and a data analyst? Because
20 I'm thinking, okay, we need your tech person in there
21 who's going to be -- who will be running, you know, doing
22 all the hardware. You know, not the hardware, but
23 basically doing all the troubleshooting of this is
24 working, that's not working. We need that person.

25 Then we also have people who are just entering data

1 into it. And then, I'm guessing the manager is the
2 person who's kind of just the go-between? I'm not quite
3 sure what these titles mean, if you could please walk
4 through that.

5 COMMISSIONER TURNER: So your data manager is going
6 to be managing those that are doing the input. So we
7 will have a team of individuals that may come from
8 different colleges. We haven't determined who's going to
9 actually be doing the input. But your data manager is
10 going to be both managing them and managing the input of
11 the information.

12 When you talked about the tech person, as far as
13 your project manager they're going to be ensuring the
14 flow, the continuous flow, troubleshooting, doing the
15 day-to-day checking of the project to ensure that the
16 product is working fine.

17 And you have a data analyst that's actually going to
18 take the information that has been input and being able
19 then to massage it, answer questions, and inform us what
20 the data is actually telling us.

21 COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: Okay. Yeah, just again to
22 clarify. So you're saying the manager is -- okay, I'm
23 trying to walk through. A document comes in, who decides
24 where that is going? That's the project manager's?

25 COMMISSIONER AHMAD: Can I take a stab at this?

1 COMMISSIONER TURNER: Yes.

2 COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: Yeah, sorry.

3 COMMISSIONER AHMAD: Sorry, this is so Silicon
4 Valley of me but a product -- a product manager would be
5 managing the actual product. So the tool that we
6 actually use to collect the data. So another example of
7 a product, for example Google Docs, that's a product.

8 COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: That's a tech person, then?

9 COMMISSIONER AHMAD: Right. So a product manager
10 would walk that product through the line of development,
11 so that person would be responsible of essentially
12 carrying that product from an idea to an actual tool.

13 So in our case a product manager would be
14 responsible for listening to our input of what we want
15 our tool to include. We want our tool to have like audio
16 capability, and video capability. I'm just making this
17 up. You know, we need to be able to travel to Mars and
18 back in one day using our product. They would take all
19 of that information and then work with the engineer to
20 develop the actual product.

21 USDR is proposing that they would take on that role.

22 COMMISSIONER TURNER: Right.

23 COMMISSIONER AHMAD: And they would take on the
24 engineering role. And then once that product is
25 finished, and they have a Google Docs finished for us,

1 per se, they would hand it to us and be like here you go,
2 use this for your data collection.

3 COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: Okay, right.

4 COMMISSIONER AHMAD: Once it's in CRC, we would have
5 a data manager, managing the data aspect of our
6 organization.

7 COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: Got it.

8 COMMISSIONER AHMAD: So they would manage the data
9 input, interns or contractors, they would oversee the
10 data analyst's role. They would play, you know, like in
11 any organization, the advocate role for the data
12 management team. If there's any issues they would be
13 working with Dan, with the rest of the team to
14 essentially say, hey, this is how our functioning is
15 going on a day-to-day. I hope that helps clarify it.

16 COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: Yes. Okay, and then the
17 analyst is the person who -- okay, so basically -- right,
18 so we're saying essentially like option 1, which there
19 kind of is the U.S. -- oh, shoot, you know, USDR is the
20 project manager, essentially. They're helping us and
21 going, okay, what are we trying to do with this. They're
22 the person who's going to actually work with this is what
23 the line drawer's doing, their ability, this is what the
24 statewide can do, and this is the product you guys need.

25 COMMISSIONER AHMAD: Uh-hum.

1 COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: And then, we're hiring a
2 project manager, who will then go, okay, so here's the
3 stuff that's coming in. It is -- oh, that's already a
4 drawing, it will be handed -- and the line drawer is
5 going to handle that part going forward. Here is, okay,
6 wow, that's going to need translation, and shifts it
7 that -- the project manager's essentially the sorter.

8 And then, we go down to and it's talking to, oh,
9 okay, we need this, everything's still flowing along.
10 And then, the analyst is that the right category, is the
11 person who's actually the tech person who's making sure
12 that, yeah, this is all running, the process is going
13 smoothly and you know, I need you to type in this, that
14 kind of stuff. Is that the process we have, so the role?

15 COMMISSIONER AHMAD: The analyst would be able to
16 answer questions like how many -- how many people
17 commented from Redding, California. And then, they would
18 go through the database and be able to call that, query
19 that information forward. Or if we stratify or separate
20 the state into different parts, like we want to make sure
21 we focus on the northern part, and we want to make sure
22 we focus on heavily populated areas and see how many
23 people submitted comments through our tools through that
24 manner. The analyst would be able to pull that
25 information out for us. They would also be able to pull

1 out information such as identical comments. For example,
2 if there's an advocacy group out there that's saying, hey
3 everyone, go populate this COI tool with this
4 information, the analyst would be able to say, hey, you
5 got fifty identical comments from Fresno, California.
6 This is what they said. So that's the role of the
7 analyst.

8 COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: Okay.

9 COMMISSIONER AHMAD: The project manager or data
10 manager, which is the same role in our eyes, is the
11 people manager. So there needs to be a person who's
12 managing the people.

13 COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: Okay.

14 COMMISSIONER AHMAD: The process of the flow from
15 the data -- from data from Californians back to
16 Californians, that whole cyclical cycle -- that was
17 redundant, cyclical cycle. But that whole process is
18 something that the engineer would build out with our
19 recommendations of what that protocol should look like.
20 So if it's an automated process, how that data flows
21 through the process.

22 COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: Okay.

23 COMMISSIONER AHMAD: If it's a written comment, we
24 would decide like how are we going to make sure that this
25 comes back to our database so we can retrieve it for

1 deliberations at a later point.

2 COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: Okay.

3 COMMISSIONER AHMAD: They would work at our
4 discretion to be able to, you know, build out that tool.

5 COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: Okay. So essentially you're
6 saying USDR, who is doing the tool, et cetera, is
7 essentially handing this baby off to the analyst who is
8 doing the real work on the technical work. And the data
9 manager is more of the people. Right, because that's --
10 you know, when you keep on saying these things I'm going
11 those tasks are the same -- it's the same task and you're
12 saying it's -- and in terms of how it's really going to
13 work out, yeah, I'm kind of wondering where the line is.
14 I'm thinking we're not quite -- the categories are a
15 little different in terms of reality.

16 And that could be because I'm also -- I understand
17 exactly what's written in the line drawer's RFP and what
18 the line drawer is thinking. So I would really love to
19 work with both of you on this to kind of flesh out some
20 ideas, which in terms of we've already kind of walked
21 through quite a bit of it.

22 COMMISSIONER AHMAD: Uh-hum.

23 COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: And in terms of this is
24 where these pieces can fit together. If I may, I would
25 love to do it.

1 COMMISSIONER AHMAD: No, definitely Commissioner
2 Turner and I had many questions that came up regarding
3 the line drawer's role and how that fits into that
4 diagram, which is why I should have put a question mark
5 there. I wasn't sure, is the line drawer using their own
6 tool? Is the line drawer using the COI tool?

7 COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: Yeah, I know.

8 COMMISSIONER AHMAD: What Commissioner Kennedy
9 brought up about the purpose of the two separate
10 databases. Do we need two separate databases? Is there
11 a way to combine them? All questions, valid questions
12 and I have them, too. I don't have the answers to those,
13 yet, but those questions are there.

14 COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: If I may, I'd love to help
15 out with this in terms of fleshing this and moving this
16 forward just for consistency's sake.

17 But then, I do have questions about which I think
18 are more general is what -- we're looking out for the
19 public. And then, the biggies are, which the whole
20 Commissioner I think should be answering is how do we
21 want to use this material and what do we want out of it?
22 Because that's the bottom line that that criteria is
23 absolutely necessary to build and to do any of the
24 categories. The minutiae of it, which you can get really
25 caught up into, which this is -- obviously, it's not more

1 than minutiae, but it is all the details of it. We need
2 to know what do we want -- what are we trying to do with
3 it at the end?

4 COMMISSIONER TURNER: Commissioner Andersen, what do
5 we want to do with this specific diagram?

6 COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: No. No, no.

7 COMMISSIONER TURNER: What do we want to do with --

8 COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: The information that comes
9 out of it. What information do we want out and what are
10 we doing with that? Are we using that to compare just
11 different districts, different drawings? That's what we
12 need to think about to put the proper -- essentially, to
13 be able to give the information to USDR. Yeah, USDR in
14 terms of what we're asking. What are our categories and
15 why?

16 COMMISSIONER TURNER: Well, yeah, that's not on this
17 chart. We definitely will. That's what I think in our
18 timeline there will be a time that we will be able, as
19 they're creating the actual, be it Airtable or Tableau,
20 there will be a time period where we'll have to determine
21 what will we -- you know, what is it about. Do we need a
22 space for lakes, a space for train tracks, a space for --
23 you know, all of that still has to be created.

24 The tool that we're walking through here basically
25 assumes that the engineer that's creating it will be part

1 of doing -- you know, determining based even on what was
2 collected from 2010, based on what we're saying we need
3 now. Yeah, so that information still needs to be
4 determined. There's not a list or a chart that we have
5 right now that would say this is the type of things we're
6 going to collect. It just will be based on as testimony
7 starts to come in as well.

8 Commissioner Taylor?

9 CHAIR TAYLOR: Okay, Commissioners, we have to be
10 mindful of time. If this has to expand very much more,
11 we'd have to agendize it on another day.

12 Commissioner Sadhwani?

13 COMMISSIONER SADHWANI: Thanks Chair, I'll be brief.
14 First of all thank you. This is incredible and you've
15 put so much work in it, so a big thanks to both
16 Commissioner Ahmad and Commissioner Turner.

17 You know, my thoughts on this is that yes,
18 absolutely whoever we all -- however we develop this
19 system, and whoever we hire in these positions will
20 absolutely need to work really closely with the line
21 drawer.

22 And you know, I think are there additional questions
23 that we as Commissioners should answer? Probably, maybe
24 a few. But I think one of the great things is
25 identify -- what you have already done.

1 COMMISSIONER TURNER: Social studies?

2 COMMISSIONER SADHWANI: Excuse me?

3 COMMISSIONER TURNER: Oh, I think I was telling my
4 grandbaby to go to social studies.

5 COMMISSIONER SADHWANI: Oh, sorry.

6 COMMISSIONER TURNER: Sorry, I thought I was on
7 mute.

8 COMMISSIONER SADHWANI: I was like, oh, I could
9 teach social studies.

10 You know, what was saying. Oh, I think one of the
11 things that I find so helpful about this, though, is that
12 in the next week or so Commissioner Andersen are going to
13 be thinking about like the scoring, and all of the things
14 that will go into the evaluation of the line drawer
15 applicants that we receive. And I think this is super
16 helpful because ultimately, rather than us kind of
17 answering all of -- trying to figure out all of these
18 specifics, I think when we have a line drawer on board,
19 as well as I think it will help inform the data
20 management process even more. And just is that clear
21 reminder that we're really going to need folks that can
22 work very collaboratively and closely together.

23 And so my only question was, I may have missed it,
24 what was the timeline? I know Commissioner Turner, you
25 were just talking about timeline. What was that timeline

1 in terms of beginning to build some of this out and
2 advance this, just so that we can coordinate that
3 appropriately?

4 CHAIR TAYLOR: Commissioner Turner, briefly do you
5 have a reply?

6 COMMISSIONER TURNER: I do not. Not briefly, I have
7 to find it. Sorry.

8 CHAIR TAYLOR: Commissioner Ahmad, do you have a
9 reply as to timeline?

10 COMMISSIONER AHMAD: I guess in terms of timeline of
11 building out a tool, if we were to go with USDR, would
12 hopefully be like a month and a half.

13 In terms of our ask today was the two pieces that we
14 were actually sure of, which is an internal data manager
15 and an internal data analyst. Whether we move forward
16 with a partnership with USDR or not, we would have to
17 either hire additional staff or we don't need to hire
18 those additional staff.

19 So I think that's what we're looking for today from
20 you all is whether we have the Commission's support to
21 move on with those hirings or the recruitment, starting
22 the recruitment process for those hirings. I will work
23 with Dan and Commissioner Turner to figure out the
24 timeline and then, hopefully, we can get something more
25 in terms of potential contract language, or et cetera,

1 for everyone's reaction by the next meeting. I don't
2 want to make any promises, though.

3 CHAIR TAYLOR: So Commissioner Ahmad and
4 Commissioner Turner, are you looking for sort of a
5 leaning or do you want a formal vote?

6 COMMISSIONER TURNER: It would be great if we can
7 have a formal vote, if people feel they have enough
8 information.

9 CHAIR TAYLOR: Commissioner Fernandez?

10 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Yes, I was at that point
11 where I wanted to know how to voice my motion. So I want
12 to make sure I get it right. Because Commissioner Ahmad,
13 you mentioned moving forward with the data analyst and
14 data manager, correct? And then, also working with USDR
15 to build that for us, correct? Is that the -- did I get
16 the right language?

17 CHAIR TAYLOR: Yes, and I would think that it would
18 be in support of option number 1.

19 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Okay, is that -- is that
20 correct?

21 COMMISSIONER AHMAD: Yes, but we didn't write it on
22 that document. Is that something that we should be
23 holding off on or is it safe from a legal stand point to
24 still take action on such an item?

25 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Well, because you -- I

1 think you agendized it with potential action, correct?

2 COMMISSIONER AHMAD: Okay. Okay, so our --

3 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Action.

4 COMMISSIONER AHMAD: Got it, okay.

5 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: So would my -- and correct
6 me if I'm wrong, would my motion be in support of option
7 1, which includes the data analyst and data manager? Is
8 that right?

9 CHAIR TAYLOR: I would think that you can state in
10 support of option number 1.

11 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Okay then, there it is.

12 CHAIR TAYLOR: Commissioner Andersen?

13 COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: I love this conversation,
14 but I believe we already did this. Didn't we already
15 vote and for to move forward with proceeding, that the
16 subcommittee would proceed writing an RFI, given -- I
17 know they've gotten more in formation and it's a
18 modification, but I believe that coming back this is more
19 of a clarification as opposed to requiring a vote or I
20 could be --

21 COMMISSIONER TURNER: No, you're absolutely right
22 Commissioner Andersen, there was a previous vote. Just
23 so much has changed since then though, which is why we're
24 coming back now. And it really looks a lot different
25 than the initial approval received.

1 COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: Okay. All right, thank you
2 for that clarification.

3 COMMISSIONER FORNACIARI: I'll second.

4 CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you. And it's seconded by
5 Commissioner Fornaciari.

6 Any further discussion regarding this issue?

7 Before we move to public comment regarding a vote,
8 we also have to revisit Deputy Executive Director
9 Hernandez's amendment to the Outreach Plan, so that we
10 would be able to take public comment, right, regarding
11 those votes all they want.

12 The floor is yours, Deputy.

13 DIRECTOR HERNANDEZ: Yes, so thank you very much.
14 I've gone back and I've made some edits to the areas that
15 were addressed. On page 8, under phase 2, Educational
16 Outreach, I've added a paragraph at the end. And I can
17 share my screen here real quick so that you can take a
18 look at that. Hopefully, you can see that there. "Staff
19 and/or Commissioners will communicate to the community-
20 based organizations when scheduling an educational
21 presentation, but the presentation is for educational
22 purposes only, and that the Commission will not take
23 public comment during this meeting. Commissioners will
24 also mention that they are providing information for
25 educational purposes and not taking public input at the

1 beginning of the presentation and at the beginning of the
2 question and answer part of the presentation. Staff
3 and/or Commissioners will provide the community
4 organizations information on how to get to the tools for
5 public input."

6 So that was the first thing that was added.

7 Secondly, on page 8, under phrase -- phase 3, just
8 changed the date, "Scheduled to begin in April".

9 Likewise on page 9, clarified the text a little bit.
10 "Public input the COI input are scheduled to begin in
11 April and we'll include the line drawer at those
12 meetings."

13 So those are some of the minor changes. The last
14 change on the page 7, I removed the reference to
15 "Citizens" and we are now using Californians throughout
16 the document.

17 Commissioner Andersen?

18 COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: Thank you. If you could go
19 up so that we can see on the page 8, could you please
20 take the line: "During this phase the Commission will
21 receive the Census data to work with" and move that to
22 the end. Because that way we don't want them to think --
23 because the way it reads right now, it appears that, oh,
24 the Census data and then again, in their minds, so and
25 that's what we're starting with.

1 And so it's more consistent, public meetings would
2 begin in April, more details schedule during this phase.
3 Because then it says -- it doesn't say at the beginning,
4 it's during this phase -- yeah, that just reads much more
5 with what's really going to go on. Thank you.

6 DIRECTOR HERNANDEZ: Very well.

7 CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you.

8 DIRECTOR HERNANDEZ: I'm actually not seeing the
9 screen, so if anyone else has any comments, so I'm going
10 to stop sharing for a second.

11 CHAIR TAYLOR: Commissioner Fernandez and then
12 Commissioner Yee.

13 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Yeah, I just -- did you
14 need a motion?

15 CHAIR TAYLOR: Yes.

16 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Okay, I'll make a motion to
17 accept this fluid document, how's that.

18 CHAIR TAYLOR: Conceptual.

19 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Okay, conceptual.

20 CHAIR TAYLOR: Commissioner Andersen, do you second?

21 COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: I second.

22 CHAIR TAYLOR: Commissioner Yee?

23 COMMISSIONER YEE: Yes, on item 1 there, "Will not
24 accept public comment", can we insert "on redistricting
25 matters" so it's more clear what isn't being accepted. I

1 mean I wouldn't want anyone to think they can't say
2 anything, right. So let's keep it to the language that's
3 actually in our rules.

4 DIRECTOR HERNANDEZ: Very well, I'll -- so I think
5 we have to amend the motion for --

6 CHAIR TAYLOR: Commissioner Fernandez, do you accept
7 Commissioner Yee's suggestion, the motion as amended by
8 Commissioner Yee?

9 COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: And the second also as
10 amended.

11 CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you. Any further discussion?

12 Katy, can you invite in public comment regarding the
13 Outreach Plan, agenda item 6, and the Data Management
14 Option number 1, agenda item number 16.

15 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Yes, Chair.

16 CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you.

17 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: In order to maximize
18 transparency and public participation in our process, the
19 Commissioners will be taking public comment by phone. To
20 call in dial the telephone number provided on the live
21 stream feed. It is 877-853-5247. When prompted to enter
22 the meeting ID number that is provided on the live stream
23 feed, it is 976-7934-9222, for this week's meeting. When
24 prompted to enter a participant ID, simply press the
25 pound key.

1 Once you have dialed in, you'll be placed in a
2 queue. To indicate you wish to comment, please press
3 star 9. This will raise your hand for the moderator.

4 When it is your turn to speak, you will hear an
5 automatic message that says the host would like you to
6 talk and to press star 6 to speak. If you would like to
7 give your name, please state and spell it for the record.
8 You are not required to provide your name to give public
9 comment.

10 Please make sure to mute your computer or live
11 stream audio to prevent any feedback or distortion during
12 your call.

13 Once you are waiting in the queue, be alert for when
14 it is your turn to speak and again, please turn down the
15 live stream volume.

16 The Commission is taking public comment at this time
17 on agenda item 6, option 1, and agenda item 16. And we
18 do not have any callers with their hand up.

19 CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you. We'll give it a minute --
20 we'll give it a few minutes for a pause.

21 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Okay.

22 (Pause)

23 COMMISSIONER SINAY: Chair, I just wanted to
24 acknowledge all the great work Katy's done today.

25 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Thank you.

1 CHAIR TAYLOR: It goes. I can't say enough. Thank
2 you, Katy, thank you Knute (phonetic), thank you. We
3 worked Jesse, too. Thank you, we appreciate it.

4 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Yeah, thank you so much.

5 CHAIR TAYLOR: We're almost there Commissioners,
6 we're working the problem.

7 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Yeah, the instructions
8 are completed on the stream, Chair.

9 CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you.

10 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: We do have two callers in
11 the queue and I --

12 CHAIR TAYLOR: All right.

13 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: We do have two callers in
14 the queue, but they -- you can press star 9.

15 CHAIR TAYLOR: They don't have their hand raised.

16 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: No.

17 CHAIR TAYLOR: Okay, can you just give the hand-
18 raising instruction one more time? If not, then we'll
19 proceed.

20 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Yes. If you have called
21 in and you are waiting in the queue, if you could press
22 star 9 to indicate you would like to share? Nope, not
23 right now.

24 CHAIR TAYLOR: All right, thank you.

25 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Uh-hum.

1 CHAIR TAYLOR: Ms. Sheffield, can you move -- can we
2 move to a -- can you call the roll for a vote regarding
3 agenda item number 6 in concept, the Outreach Plan, by
4 Deputy Executive Director Hernandez?

5 MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Toledo?

6 VICE CHAIR TOLEDO: Yes.

7 MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Turner?

8 COMMISSIONER TURNER: Yes.

9 MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Vazquez?

10 COMMISSIONER VAZQUEZ: Yes.

11 MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Yee?

12 COMMISSIONER YEE: Yes.

13 MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Ahmad?

14 COMMISSIONER AHMAD: Yes.

15 MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Akutagawa?

16 Commissioner Andersen?

17 COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: Yes. Yes.

18 MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Fernandez?

19 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Yes.

20 MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Fornaciari?

21 COMMISSIONER FORNACIARI: Yes.

22 MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Kennedy?

23 COMMISSIONER KENNEDY: Yes.

24 MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Le Mons?

25 COMMISSIONER LE MONS: Yes.

1 MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Sadhwani?

2 COMMISSIONER SADHWANI: Yes.

3 MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Sinay?

4 COMMISSIONER SINAY: Yes.

5 MS. SHEFFIELD: And Commissioner Taylor?

6 CHAIR TAYLOR: Yes.

7 MS. SHEFFIELD: Motion passes.

8 COMMISSIONER FORNACIARI: You're muted.

9 CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you. Ms. Sheffield, can you
10 call the roll for the vote on agenda item number 16,
11 option 1 for the data management?

12 COMMISSIONER VAZQUEZ: You're muted.

13 MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Toledo?

14 VICE CHAIR TOLEDO: Yes. Sorry.

15 MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Turner?

16 COMMISSIONER TURNER: Yes.

17 MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Vazquez?

18 COMMISSIONER VAZQUEZ: Abstain.

19 MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Yee?

20 COMMISSIONER YEE: Yes.

21 MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Ahmad?

22 COMMISSIONER AHMAD: Yes.

23 MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Akutagawa?

24 Commissioner Andersen?

25 COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: Yes.

1 MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Fernandez?

2 COMMISSIONER FERNANDEZ: Yes.

3 MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Fornaciari?

4 COMMISSIONER FORNACIARI: Yes.

5 MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Kennedy?

6 Commissioner Le Mons?

7 COMMISSIONER LE MONS: Yes.

8 COMMISSIONER KENNEDY: That was a yes from me. I
9 was having problems unmuting. Sorry.

10 MS. SHEFFIELD: Got it.

11 Commissioner Sadhwani?

12 COMMISSIONER SADHWANI: Yes.

13 MS. SHEFFIELD: Commissioner Sinay?

14 COMMISSIONER SINAY: Yes.

15 MS. SHEFFIELD: And Commissioner Taylor?

16 CHAIR TAYLOR: Yes.

17 MS. SHEFFIELD: All right, the motion passes.

18 CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you. Good work for everyone on
19 their respective committees.

20 Quickly, we want to address any future meeting dates
21 and agenda items. When we left last, we had all of the
22 February meeting dates intact. Our first subtraction was
23 the March 3rd date, I believe.

24 Do we have any other differences or additions?

25 Quickly, how can we address our meeting dates?

1 Commissioner Andersen?

2 COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: Okay, I propose in March
3 we've already dropped the 3rd, we do not want -- we'd
4 rather not go to a three-day. So leave 8 and 9 as is and
5 either try a workshop on Saturday the 13th, say for the
6 new line drawer, just to kind of -- it would be probably
7 a half day. And then, possibly another on the -- oh,
8 that's right before Easter. On the Saturday, the 27th,
9 possibly a workshop VRA training, or maybe a little
10 something like that. Again, that would probably be a
11 half day. Or a day on the weekend.

12 CHAIR TAYLOR: Commissioner Sinay?

13 COMMISSIONER SINAY: What I'm seeing on our calendar
14 that the February 13th is President's Day weekend, so
15 that means it's a long weekend. I know none of us are
16 traveling but --

17 CHAIR TAYLOR: Commissioner Sinay, did you mean
18 March 13th? Our February --

19 COMMISSIONER SINAY: Again, I messed up. Sorry.

20 CHAIR TAYLOR: No problem. The February calendar
21 remains intact.

22 COMMISSIONER SINAY: Yeah, sorry.

23 CHAIR TAYLOR: Commissioner Sadhwani then
24 Commissioner Le Mons.

25 COMMISSIONER SADHWANI: You know, while I certainly

1 share Commissioner Andersen's desire to do workshops for
2 the line drawer and VRA, I think given the news that the
3 Census data is most certainly going to be delayed, and
4 also knowing that February is going to be an
5 extraordinarily busy month, particularly for the Legal
6 Affairs Committee, who will meeting numerous additional
7 days beyond our business meetings, I would like for the
8 Commission to consider holding off on those workshops
9 until April. I don't think that there is any problem for
10 us to wait.

11 And then, if it's on a Saturday, that sounds fine
12 with me. I know we talked about just changing it up so
13 that it's not always on the days. But I think that way
14 it can lighten our load a little in March and give us
15 just a little bit more breathing room because we do have
16 that flexibility.

17 CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you.

18 Commissioner Le Mons.

19 COMMISSIONER LE MONS: I echo Commissioner
20 Sadhwani's comments.

21 CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you. Any other questions or
22 comments from Commissioners?

23 Commissioner Andersen?

24 COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN: I agree with that and I
25 would actually almost even tend to propose that we might

1 do a combo type thing on Saturday, April 10, which is
2 after Easter, the week after Easter.

3 CHAIR TAYLOR: So what I would -- yes, what I would
4 propose is that especially given what we might have on
5 the outreach calendar that we will come back at our next
6 meeting and we can address perhaps going that far out to
7 April. Does that sound acceptable to Commissioners?

8 All right. We brought in Mariano Rivera to get a
9 save here.

10 COMMISSIONER SINAY: I wonder if we --

11 CHAIR TAYLOR: Commissioner Sinay?

12 COMMISSIONER SINAY: Oh, I'm sorry, I didn't realize
13 I was unmuted this whole time. Do we still need the
14 March 29th and April 1st meeting, since we're looking at
15 further out of April? I mean, I know we're all kind of
16 breathing a little bit more air right now.

17 CHAIR TAYLOR: I would think that would be addressed
18 on our February 8th meeting. Thank you.

19 All right. So then I would like to invite in public
20 comment to conclude this meeting. Katy, can you invite
21 in the public, please?

22 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: Yes, I can.

23 In order to maximize transparency and public
24 participation in our process, the Commissioners will be
25 taking public comment by phone. To call in, dial the

1 telephone number provided on the live stream feed. It is
2 877-853-5247. When prompted to enter the meeting ID
3 number that is provided on the line stream feed, it is
4 976-7934-9222 for this week's meeting. When prompted to
5 enter a participant ID, simply press the pound key.

6 Once you have dialed in, you'll be placed in a
7 queue. To indicate you wish to comment, please press
8 star 9. This will raise your hand for the moderator.
9 When it is your turn to speak, you will hear an automatic
10 message that says the host would like you to talk, and to
11 press star 6 to speak. If you would like to give your
12 name, please state and spell it for the record. You are
13 not required to provide your name to give public comment.

14 Please make sure to mute your computer or live
15 stream audio to prevent any feedback or distortion during
16 your call. Once you are waiting in the queue, be alert
17 for when it is your turn to speak and please, again, turn
18 down the live stream volume.

19 The Commission is taking general public comment to
20 close this week's meeting.

21 And we do not currently have anybody knew in the
22 queue. And if anybody who is in the queue would like to
23 speak, please press star 9 to raise your hand.

24 CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you. We'll give it pause.

25 (Pause)

1 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: And we do have a caller.

2 CHAIR TAYLOR: I think we have a caller, thank you.

3 PUBLIC COMMENT MODERATOR: And the floor is yours.

4 If you would like to share your name, please state and
5 spell it for the record. Otherwise, share your comment.

6 MS. WESTA-LUSK: Yes, this is Renee Westa-Lusk
7 again, and I just had a question regarding the, I guess,
8 the flow chart. The flow chart for the --

9 CHAIR TAYLOR: Yes, go ahead.

10 MS. WESTA-LUSK: -- data management system.

11 CHAIR TAYLOR: Ms. Westa-Lusk, please go ahead.

12 MS. WESTA-LUSK: Okay. Yeah, I'm trying to mute my
13 computer. The question I have about the flow chart is I
14 see two kinds of data coming into the CRC. One's the
15 electronic, I would call it electronic, the COI tool
16 data. And then, you have hardcopy, or maybe physical
17 letters, and I guess there is a little box that says
18 public testimony or something like that, where there's
19 meeting notes and verbal testimony, and then emails, and
20 then hand-drawn maps.

21 My only question is are both kinds of data going to
22 be treated equally the same? Because I only see line
23 drawing for the non-COI tool. And is it assumed that
24 because the COI tool, is that partly considered as an
25 automatic line drawer, so therefore, there's no line

1 drawing listed on that flow data chart? Whereas on
2 the -- I'm looking at it. On the right side it says line
3 drawers, arrow from the side where it's non-COI tool
4 files.

5 I guess I'm worried about equal treatment of data.
6 I would assume you'd still need some kind of line
7 drawing, even with the COI tool data that you'll be
8 receiving. I guess that's my main question.

9 And then, I have a security issue with all the data.
10 I assume that's going to be taken care of at a later
11 discussion, or the Cyber Security Subcommittee takes care
12 of that. I guess I'm worried about data that could be
13 not just hacked into, but erased from the system. And I
14 wanted to know will the data management people be
15 addressing security or is that someone else's
16 responsibility. Thank you.

17 CHAIR TAYLOR: Commissioner Turner, I saw you
18 briefly unmuted yourself. Was that to provide a
19 response?

20 COMMISSIONER TURNER: Yes, I wanted to just -- uh-
21 hum, I wanted to thank the caller and for the first part
22 of your question where you are referencing the blue box,
23 it spoke to the emails, written comments, the non-COI
24 tool data, it is treated with equal concern and
25 importance. It's just a matter of process. Because it

1 is non-COI tool data, it will go and come directly into
2 the Commissioner's first.

3 And then, if you notice the line that goes down to a
4 data management team, which will process it and ensure
5 that that information is sent back through the captcha,
6 which part of our -- one part of the security piece. And
7 then, down into the COI tool for the line drawing for it
8 to be processed through the COI tool that will go into
9 the main database.

10 Your second part of the question had to do with, I
11 think, security. And for that, we have worked with our
12 data security people throughout the process to ensure
13 that it is a secure system. I don't know if,
14 Commissioner Fornaciari, you want to say anything
15 additional to that, or if there was something else I left
16 out.

17 CHAIR TAYLOR: Commissioner Fornaciari?

18 COMMISSIONER FORNACIARI: Yeah, I want to just --
19 yeah, the cyber security team is in on the meetings with
20 the data management team, you know, providing that
21 perspective, too. So we're closely engaged with the
22 process.

23 MS. WESTA-LUSK: I guess one other feedback to your
24 responses, will there be more than one backup system?
25 Because I'm always worried, especially about California.

1 It seems like California, as a state, the people here
2 experience more identity theft, hacking, stealing of
3 information than I think over states do. And I don't
4 know exactly why. But I guess I'm worried that just one
5 backup system, if something should get erased or someone
6 gets in there and just deletes whole files, is there
7 going to be something like that where you have more than
8 one backup system for all the data that's inputted either
9 through the non-COI tool files or the COI tool files?

10 COMMISSIONER FORNACIARI: Well, you know, we haven't
11 resolved all those details yet, but we're working on it.
12 And I do appreciate your input and that thought, and
13 that's something we'll definitely take into consideration
14 as we kind of work through our cyber security approach.
15 So thank you for bringing that thought up. Appreciate
16 that.

17 MS. WESTA-LUSK: Thank you.

18 CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you for your comments, it's
19 always extremely helpful. Thank you, Ms. Westa-Lusk.

20 Director Claypool?

21 DIRECTOR CLAYPOOL: Before you leave, Ms. Westa-
22 Lusk, would you please send me your email information to
23 my email address? It is Daniel.claypool@crc.ca.gov. We
24 want to make sure that we provide you with a way to
25 upload your information. And so again that is

1 Daniel.claypool@crc.ca.gov. Thank you very much.

2 CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you.

3 All right, Commissioners, with that we'll close
4 public comment.

5 Commissioner Kennedy?

6 COMMISSIONER KENNEDY: Just I thought we were going
7 to close the session, but I just wanted to give a shout
8 out to our counterparts in the Michigan Commission, who
9 are meeting as we speak.

10 CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you. Any other statements or
11 comments from Commissioners?

12 I would like to remind those following
13 Commissioners, those watching, that the Legal Affairs
14 Committee will begin their meeting in approximately an
15 hour. What do you say, Commissioner Sadhwani --

16 COMMISSIONER SADHWANI: 2:15.

17 CHAIR TAYLOR: -- Chair Sadhwani for that -- 2:15?

18 MS. MANOFF: No, it's going to start in 15 minutes.

19 COMMISSIONER SADHWANI: I believe we'll need to take
20 a one-hour lunch break for all of the staff.

21 CHAIR TAYLOR: For staff.

22 COMMISSIONER SADHWANI: Correct. So we will have to
23 push the start time to 2:15, yes.

24 CHAIR TAYLOR: Thank you. Thank you, guys. Thank
25 you, everyone. Thank you.

1 COMMISSIONER VAZQUEZ: Thank you, Chair.

2 CHAIR TAYLOR: No problem. I know I have shared
3 space. Thank you. See you guys on February 8th.
4 February 8th. All righty, thank you.

5 (Whereupon, the CRC Business Meeting adjourned
6 at 1:16 p.m.)

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

CERTIFICATE OF TRANSCRIBER

I certify that the foregoing is a correct transcript,
to the best of my ability, of the videoconference
recording of the proceedings provided by the California
Citizens Redistricting Commission.



LORI RAHTES, CDLT-108

June 23, 2022

DATE